Case	3:18-cv-00802-BEN-JLB Document 17 F	Filed 10/31/18 PageID.366 Page 1 of 17					
1 2	XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California TAMAR PACHTER						
	Supervising Deputy Attorney General NELSON R. RICHARDS						
3	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 246996						
4 5	2550 Mariposa Mall, Room 5090						
	Fresno, CA 93721 Telephone: (559) 705-2324						
6	Fax: (559) 445-5106 E-mail: Nelson.Richards@doj.ca.gov	7					
7	Attorneys for Defendant Attorney General Xavier Becerra						
8		TATES DISTRICT COURT					
9							
10	FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA						
11							
12							
13	Kim Rhode et al.,	3:18-cv-00802-BEN-JLB					
14	Plaintiff	fs, ANSWER TO THE FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT					
15	V.						
16		Judge: The Honorable Roger T	•				
17	Xavier Becerra, in his official capacity as Attorney General of the State of California, et al.,	Benitez Action Filed: 4/27/2018					
18	Defendant:	to l					
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28							

Defendant Xavier Becerra, in his official capacity as Attorney General of
 California, answers the First Amended Complaint, ECF No. 9, in paragraphs that
 correspond to the First Amended Complaint's, as follows:

1. Denies.

4

5

2. Denies.

3. The allegations contained in Paragraph 3 constitute conclusions of law
to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

9 4. The allegations contained in Paragraph 4 constitute conclusions of law
10 to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
11 fact, they are denied.

12 5. The allegations contained in Paragraph 5 constitute conclusions of law
13 to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
14 fact, they are denied.

6. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
the allegations contained in Paragraph 6, and basing his denial on this ground,
denies each and every allegation thereof.

18 7. The allegations contained in Paragraph 7 are Plaintiffs'
19 characterization of their case, to which no answer is required; to the extent they
20 may be deemed allegations of fact, they are denied.

8. The allegations contained in Paragraph 8 constitute conclusions of law
to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

9. The allegations contained in Paragraph 9 constitute conclusions of law
to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

10. The allegations contained in Paragraph 10 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of

fact, they are denied.

11. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
the allegations contained in Paragraph 11, and basing his denial on this ground,
denies each and every allegation thereof.

5 6

7

1

12. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer the allegations contained in Paragraph 12, and basing his denial on this ground, denies each and every allegation thereof.

8 13. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
9 the allegations contained in Paragraph 13, and basing his denial on this ground,
10 denies each and every allegation thereof.

11 14. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
12 the allegations contained in Paragraph 14, and basing his denial on this ground,
13 denies each and every allegation thereof.

14 15. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
15 the allegations contained in Paragraph 15, and basing his denial on this ground,
16 denies each and every allegation thereof.

16. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
the allegations contained in Paragraph 16, and basing his denial on this ground,
denies each and every allegation thereof.

20 17. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
21 the allegations contained in Paragraph 17, and basing his denial on this ground,
22 denies each and every allegation thereof.

18. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
the allegations contained in Paragraph 18, and basing his denial on this ground,
denies each and every allegation thereof.

19. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
the allegations contained in Paragraph 19, and basing his denial on this ground,
denies each and every allegation thereof.

20. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
 the allegations contained in Paragraph 20, and basing his denial on this ground,
 denies each and every allegation thereof.

4 21. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
5 the allegations contained in Paragraph 21, and basing his denial on this ground,
6 denies each and every allegation thereof.

7 22. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
8 the allegations contained in Paragraph 22, and basing his denial on this ground,
9 denies each and every allegation thereof.

Admits that he is the Attorney General of California; otherwise the
allegations in Paragraph 23 constitute conclusions of law to which no answer is
required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of fact, they are denied.

13 24. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
14 the allegations contained in Paragraph 24, and basing his denial on this ground,
15 denies each and every allegation thereof.

16 25. Admits that he is carrying out his statutory duties under the Safety for
17 All Act (Proposition 63) and that he intends to carry out any additional duties as
18 they take effect; otherwise the allegations contained in Paragraph 25 constitute
19 conclusions of law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be
20 deemed allegations of fact, they are denied.

21 26. The allegations contained in Paragraph 26 constitute conclusions of
22 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
23 fact, they are denied.

24 27. Admits that the Safety for All Act (Proposition 63) was adopted in
25 2016; otherwise the allegations contained in Paragraph 27 constitute conclusions of
26 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
27 fact, they are denied.

28 28. The allegations contained in Paragraph 28 constitute conclusions of

law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
 fact, they are denied.

3 29. The allegations contained in Paragraph 29 constitute conclusions of
4 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
5 fact, they are denied.

30. The allegations contained in Paragraph 30 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

9 31. The allegations contained in Paragraph 31 constitute conclusions of
10 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
11 fact, they are denied.

32. The allegations contained in Paragraph 32 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

15 33. The allegations contained in Paragraph 33 constitute conclusions of
16 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
17 fact, they are denied.

34. The allegations contained in Paragraph 34 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

35. The allegations contained in Paragraph 35 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

36. The allegations contained in Paragraph 36 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

37. The allegations contained in Paragraph 37 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of

1 fact, they are denied.

38. The allegations contained in Paragraph 38 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

39. Admits that the Department of Justice began issuing licenses on
January 2, 2018; otherwise the remaining allegations contained in Paragraph 39
constitute conclusions of law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may
be deemed allegations of fact, they are denied.

9 40. The allegations contained in Paragraph 40 constitute conclusions of
10 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
11 fact, they are denied.

41. The allegations contained in Paragraph 41 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

42. The allegations contained in Paragraph 42 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

43. The allegations contained in Paragraph 43 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

44. The allegations contained in Paragraph 44 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

45. The allegations contained in Paragraph 45 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

46. The Attorney General lacks information or belief sufficient to answer
the allegations contained in Paragraph 46, and basing his denial on this ground,

1 denies each and every allegation thereof.

47. The allegations contained in Paragraph 47 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

5 48. The allegations contained in Paragraph 48 constitute conclusions of
6 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
7 fact, they are denied.

8 49. The allegations contained in Paragraph 49 constitute conclusions of
9 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
10 fact, they are denied.

11 50. The allegations contained in Paragraph 50 constitute conclusions of
12 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
13 fact, they are denied.

14 51. The allegations contained in Paragraph 51 constitute conclusions of
15 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
16 fact, they are denied.

17 52. The allegations contained in Paragraph 52 constitute conclusions of
18 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
19 fact, they are denied.

20 53. The allegations contained in Paragraph 53 constitute conclusions of
21 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
22 fact, they are denied.

54. The allegations contained in Paragraph 54 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

26 55. The allegations contained in Paragraph 55 constitute conclusions of
27 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
28 fact, they are denied.

56. The allegations contained in Paragraph 56 constitute conclusions of
 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
 fact, they are denied.

57. The allegations contained in the first and third sentences of
Paragraph 57 constitute conclusions of law to which no answer is required; to the
extent they may be deemed allegations of fact, they are denied. Denies the second
sentence of paragraph 57.

8 58. The allegations contained in Paragraph 58 constitute conclusions of
9 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
10 fact, they are denied.

59. The allegations contained in Paragraph 59 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

14 60. The allegations contained in Paragraph 60 constitute conclusions of
15 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
16 fact, they are denied.

17 61. The allegations contained in Paragraph 61 constitute conclusions of
18 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
19 fact, they are denied.

62. The allegations contained in Paragraph 62 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

63. The allegations contained in Paragraph 63 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

64. The allegations contained in Paragraph 64 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

65. The allegations contained in Paragraph 65 constitute conclusions of
 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
 fact, they are denied.

4 66. The allegations contained in Paragraph 66 constitute conclusions of
5 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
6 fact, they are denied.

67. The allegations contained in Paragraph 67 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

10 68. The allegations contained in Paragraph 68 constitute conclusions of
11 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
12 fact, they are denied.

69. The allegations contained in Paragraph 69 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

16 70. The allegations contained in Paragraph 70 constitute conclusions of
17 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
18 fact, they are denied.

19 71. The allegations contained in Paragraph 71 constitute conclusions of
20 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
21 fact, they are denied.

72. The allegations contained in Paragraph 72 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

73. The allegations contained in Paragraph 73 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

28 74. The allegations contained in Paragraph 74 constitute conclusions of

law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
 fact, they are denied.

3 75. The allegations contained in Paragraph 75 constitute conclusions of
4 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
5 fact, they are denied.

6 76. The allegations contained in Paragraph 76 constitute conclusions of
7 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
8 fact, they are denied.

9 77. The allegations contained in Paragraph 77 constitute conclusions of
10 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
11 fact, they are denied.

12 78. The allegations contained in Paragraph 78 constitute conclusions of
13 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
14 fact, they are denied.

15 79. The allegations contained in Paragraph 79 constitute conclusions of
16 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
17 fact, they are denied.

18 80. The allegations contained in Paragraph 80 constitute conclusions of
19 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
20 fact, they are denied.

81. The allegations contained in Paragraph 81 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

24 82. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 1
25 through 81 in answer to Paragraph 82.

83. The allegations contained in Paragraph 83 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

84. The allegations contained in Paragraph 84 constitute conclusions of
 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
 fact, they are denied.

4 85. The allegations contained in Paragraph 85 constitute conclusions of
5 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
6 fact, they are denied.

7 86. The allegations contained in Paragraph 86 constitute conclusions of
8 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
9 fact, they are denied.

10 87.

Denies.

11 88. The allegations contained in the first and third sentences of
12 Paragraph 88 constitute conclusions of law to which no answer is required; to the
13 extent they may be deemed allegations of fact, they are denied. Denies the second
14 sentence of paragraph 88.

15 89. The allegations contained in Paragraph 89 constitute conclusions of
16 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
17 fact, they are denied.

18 90. The allegations contained in Paragraph 90 constitute conclusions of
19 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
20 fact, they are denied.

91. The allegations contained in Paragraph 91 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

24 92. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 1
25 through 91 in answer to Paragraph 92.

26 93. The allegations contained in Paragraph 93 constitute conclusions of
27 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
28 fact, they are denied.

94. The allegations contained in Paragraph 94 constitute conclusions of
 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
 fact, they are denied.

4 95. The allegations contained in Paragraph 95 constitute conclusions of
5 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
6 fact, they are denied.

7 96. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 1
8 through 95 in answer to Paragraph 96.

9 97. The allegations contained in Paragraph 97 constitute conclusions of
10 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
11 fact, they are denied.

12 98. The allegations contained in Paragraph 98 constitute conclusions of
13 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
14 fact, they are denied.

15 99. The allegations contained in Paragraph 99 constitute conclusions of
16 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
17 fact, they are denied.

18 100. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 119 through 99 in answer to Paragraph 100.

20 101. The allegations contained in Paragraph 101 constitute conclusions of
21 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
22 fact, they are denied.

102. The allegations contained in Paragraph 102 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

103. The allegations contained in Paragraph 103 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

1 104. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 1
 2 through 103 in answer to Paragraph 104.

105. The allegations contained in Paragraph 105 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

106. The allegations contained in Paragraph 106 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

9 107. The allegations contained in Paragraph 107 constitute conclusions of
10 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
11 fact, they are denied.

108. Denies.

12

13 109. The allegations contained in Paragraph 109 constitute conclusions of
14 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
15 fact, they are denied.

16 110. The allegations contained in Paragraph 110 constitute conclusions of
17 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
18 fact, they are denied.

19 111. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 120 through 110 in answer to Paragraph 111.

112. The allegations contained in Paragraph 112 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

113. The allegations contained in Paragraph 113 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

27 114. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 128 through 113 in answer to Paragraph 114.

1 115. The allegations contained in Paragraph 115 constitute conclusions of
 2 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
 3 fact, they are denied.

4 116. The allegations contained in Paragraph 116 constitute conclusions of
5 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
6 fact, they are denied.

7 117. The allegations contained in Paragraph 117 constitute conclusions of
8 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
9 fact, they are denied.

10 118. The allegations contained in Paragraph 118 constitute conclusions of
11 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
12 fact, they are denied.

13 119. The allegations contained in Paragraph 119 constitute conclusions of
14 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
15 fact, they are denied.

16 120. The allegations contained in Paragraph 120 constitute conclusions of
17 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
18 fact, they are denied.

19 121. The allegations contained in Paragraph 121 constitute conclusions of
20 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
21 fact, they are denied.

122. The allegations contained in Paragraph 122 constitute conclusions of
law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of
fact, they are denied.

123. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 1
through 122 in answer to Paragraph 123.

124. No response to Paragraph 124 is required because it is made in support
of a claim that the Court dismissed in its October 17, 2018 Order, ECF No. 16.

1 125. No response to Paragraph 125 is required because it is made in support 2 of a claim that the Court dismissed in its October 17, 2018 Order, ECF No. 16. No response to Paragraph 126 is required because it is made in support 3 126. 4 of a claim that the Court dismissed in its October 17, 2018 Order, ECF No. 16. 5 127. No response to Paragraph 127 is required because it is made in support of a claim that the Court dismissed in its October 17, 2018 Order, ECF No. 16. 6 7 No response to Paragraph 128 is required because it is made in support 128. of a claim that the Court dismissed in its October 17, 2018 Order, ECF No. 16. 8 No response to Paragraph 129 is required because it is made in support 9 129. 10 of a claim that the Court dismissed in its October 17, 2018 Order, ECF No. 16. No response to Paragraph 130 is required because it is made in support 11 130. of a claim that the Court dismissed in its October 17, 2018 Order, ECF No. 16. 12 13 131. The Attorney General incorporates his answers to Paragraphs 1 through 130 in answer to Paragraph 131. 14 15 132. The allegations contained in Paragraph 132 constitute conclusions of 16 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of fact, they are denied. 17 18 133. The allegations contained in Paragraph 133 constitute conclusions of 19 law to which no answer is required; to the extent they may be deemed allegations of fact, they are denied. 20 21 The Attorney General denies each and every allegation not previously admitted or otherwise qualified. 22 The Attorney General denies that Plaintiffs are entitled to the relief set forth in 23 24 the prayer for relief immediately following Paragraph 133, or to any relief 25 whatsoever. 26 In addition, without admitting any allegations contained in the First Amended 27 Complaint, the Attorney General asserts the following defenses based on 28 15

Case	3:18-cv-00802-BEN-JLB Document 17 Filed 10/31/18 PageID.381 Page 16 of 17						
1	information and belief:						
2	FIRST DEFENSE						
3	The First Amended Complaint, and the claims for relief alleged therein, fails						
4	to state facts sufficient to constitute a cause of action.						
5	SECOND DEFENSE						
6	Plaintiffs' claims in this action are barred in that they do not have standing to						
7	bring them.						
8	THIRD DEFENSE						
9	The Attorney General has not knowingly or intentionally waived any						
10	applicable defense or affirmative defense. The Attorney General reserves the right						
11	to assert and rely upon other such defenses as may become available or apparent						
12	during discovery proceedings or as may be raised or asserted by others in this case,						
13	and to amend the Answer, defenses, and/or affirmative defenses accordingly. The						
14	Attorney General further reserves the right to amend the Answer to delete defenses						
15	and/or affirmative defenses that he determines are not applicable after subsequent						
16	discovery.						
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28							

Case	3:18-cv-008	802-BEN-JLB Document 17	Filed 10/31/18 PageID.382 Page 17 of 17			
1	WHEREFORE, the Attorney General prays that:					
2	1.	1. Plaintiffs take nothing by reason of their complaint;				
3	2.	2. Judgment be entered in favor of the Attorney General;				
4	3.	3. The Attorney General be awarded his costs incurred in defending this				
5	action; a	iction; and				
6	4.	4. The Attorney General be awarded such further relief that the Court may				
7	deem jus	st and proper.				
8	Dated: (October 31, 2018	Respectfully submitted,			
9			XAVIER BECERRA			
10			Attorney General of California TAMAR PACHTER			
11			Supervising Deputy Attorney General			
12						
13			/s/ Nelson Richards NELSON R. RICHARDS			
14			Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Defendant Attorney General Xavier Becerra			
15 16						
16 17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						
26						
27						
28						

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Case	Rhode v. Becerra	No.	3:18-cv-00802-BEN-JLB
Name:			

I hereby certify that on October 31, 2018, I electronically filed the following documents with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system:

ANSWER TO THE FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT

I certify that all participants in the case are registered CM/ECF users and that service will be accomplished by the CM/ECF system.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on October 31, 2018, at Fresno, California.

Nelson R. Richards Declarant /s/ Nelson R. Richards Signature