Case: 20-55437, 04/24/2020, ID: 11671626, DktEntry: 3-10, Page 1 of 19

# EXHIBIT 8

#### **DECLARATION OF MAYRA G. MORALES**

I, MAYRA G. MORALES, declare:

1. I am a Staff Services Manager III for the California Department of Justice, Bureau of Firearms. I make this declaration of my own personal knowledge and experience and, if called as a witness, I could and would testify competently to the truth of the matters set forth herein.

#### **BACKGROUND**

- 2. I posses a Bachelor of Science Degree in Speech Pathology. I have been with the Department of Justice (Department) for over 18 years, of which 11 years have been with the Bureau of Firearms. Over that time, I have held various positions. In 2014, I became a Staff Services Manager within the Administration and Special Projects Section where I oversaw all administrative functions of the Bureau of Firearms including legislation, regulations, budgets, facilities, personnel, telecommunication, procurement, and contracts. In April of 2016, I was promoted to a Department of Justice Administrator II within the Regulatory Program Section of the Bureau of Firearms. In this capacity I planned, organized, directed and provided leadership to several programs.
- 3. I have served as a Staff Services Manager III over the Special Assignment Section since April 2018.
- 4. My primary role in this capacity has been to oversee the Reporting and Quality Assurance Section and provide oversight of the implementation of the Ammunition Purchase Authorization Program. Under the direction of the Assistant Bureau Director, I was responsible for the implementation of the Ammunition Purchase Authorization Program that was established by Proposition 63, "Safety for All Act," as amended by Senate Bill 1235. In this capacity, I was a subject-matter generalist for all regulatory sections of the Bureau of Firearms.

## I. THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE'S REGULATIONS GOVERNING AMMUNITION PURCHASES AND TRANSFERS

- 5. Proposition 63 was passed by California voters on November 8, 2016.
- 6. In January 2018, the Bureau of Firearms adopted Ammunition Vendor Licensing regulations, which are codified in title 11 of the California Code of Regulations at sections 4260-4264. These regulations establish the process for an ammunition vendor to obtain a license to sell ammunition and set the fee an ammunition vendor is authorized to charge the purchaser for processing an ammunition sale between two private, non-vendor parties.
- 7. As of July 31, 2019, there were 2,040 vendors licensed to sell ammunition in California. Of that number, 1,760 were licensed to sell firearms and ammunition and 280 were licensed to sell ammunition only.
- 8. In December 2018, the Department issued an Initial Statement of Reasons outlining proposed regulations governing the purchase and transfer of ammunition. A copy of that notice is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 1.
- 9. The Bureau of Firearms held a public comment period beginning on December 14, 2018, and closing on January 31, 2019. (Often referenced as the 45-day comment period—per the Administrative Procedure Act, the requirement is a minimum of 45 days.) During this comment period, the Bureau of Firearms received 219 different comments from 566 members of the public. The comments and the Summary and Response to Comments are part of the rulemaking file, which is publically available.
- 10. The Bureau of Firearms also held two public hearings for these regulations during the comment period. The first was held on January 29, 2019, in Los Angeles, and the second was held on January 31, 2019, in Sacramento. I was the hearing officer at both hearings. Transcripts of both are included in the final rulemaking file, which is publicly available.

- 1 11. The Bureau of Firearms held an additional public comment period 2 beginning on April 18, 2019, and closing on May 8, 2019. (Often referenced as a 3 15-day comment period—per the Administrative Procedure Act, the requirement 4 for notice of modifications is a minimum of 15 days.) The documents provided for 5 this additional comment period were a Notice of Modification, an Updated Notice 6 of Modification (correcting an incorrect e-mail address and extending the comment 7 period), modifications to the Text of Proposed Regulations, an Initial Statement of 8 Reasons Addendum, and a revised Economic and Fiscal Impact Statement (Std. 9 399). During this comment period, the Bureau of Firearms received 32 different 10 comments from 139 members of the public. The comments and the Summary and 11 Response to Comments, are all part of the rulemaking file, which is publically 12 available. 13 12. In May 2019, the Department submitted a Final Statement of Reasons to 14 the Office of Administrative Law. A copy of that final statement of reasons is
  - attached to this declaration as Exhibit 2.
  - The regulations were approved by the California Office of Administrative Law on June 24, 2019 and went into effect on July 1, 2019.
  - 14. The regulations outline the process for three eligibility checks: (1) the Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check; (2) the Certificate of Eligibility Verification Check; and (3) the Basic Ammunition Eligibility Check. (The regulations also contemplate a fourth Firearms Eligibility Check that permits a person to purchase a firearm and ammunition at the same time.)
  - 15. The Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check and the Certificate of Eligibility Verification Check rely on the Department's Dealer Record of Sale (DROS) Entry System (DES). DES is a web-based application used by California firearms dealers to submit firearm background checks to the Department to determine if an individual is eligible to purchase, loan, or transfer a handgun or

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

long gun—and now ammunition—and subsequently receive background and eligibility check determinations.

### A. Standard Ammunition Eligibility Checks

- 16. Section 4302 of title 11 of the California Code of Regulations governs Standard Ammunition Eligibility Checks.
- 17. To determine whether a purchaser or transferee (I will generally refer to these together as "purchaser") is eligible to purchase or possess (I will generally refer to these together as "purchase") ammunition under a Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check, the Department, through an automated process in DES, cross-references the purchaser's name, date of birth, current address, and driver license or other government identification number with the information maintained in the Department's Automated Firearms System.
- 18. If the purchaser's information does not match an Automated Firearms System entry, the transaction will be rejected. This usually occurs for one of two reasons: (1) the purchaser's name, date of birth, current address, driver license or other identification number does not match an entry in the Automated Firearms System and therefore the transaction is rejected; or (2) the purchaser does not have a record in the Automated Firearms System.
- 19. If the purchaser's information matches an Automated Firearms System entry, the Department determines if the purchaser falls within a class of persons who are prohibited from owning or possessing firearms and ammunition by cross-referencing the Prohibited Armed Persons File (also known as the Armed Prohibited Persons System). If the purchaser is prohibited from owning or possessing firearms and ammunition, the transaction will be denied.
- 20. Purchasers who are rejected on a Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check have the ability to electronically update one or more Automated Firearms System records through the California Firearms Application Reporting System, which is available on the Department's website at: https://cfars.doj.ca.gov. People wishing

- to correct their records will need to create a California Firearms Application Reporting System account (if they do not already have one), log in, select the "Automated Firearm System Personal Information Update" link, and then enter their current personal information, firearm information, and personal information at time of firearm purchase.
- 21. Address changes are systematically processed. I am informed and believe that, once the application is submitted, and if a match is found in the Automated Firearms System, the time it takes to update one's address on the system may take less than 10 minutes, but depending on the number of pending applications, may take longer.
- 22. Name changes, identification number changes, and date of birth changes require additional documentation be uploaded in order for an analyst to review and validate the change. I am informed and believe that because an analyst must validate the change, these transaction may take a few hours, but depending on Department workload, can take several days (excluding weekends) to process and subsequently update the record (assuming a match is found in the Automated Firearms System).
- 23. If a person does not know the personal information that was used at the time of purchase of the firearm, they can request to obtain information on all firearms for which they are listed as the purchaser, transferee, or owner in the State of California Automated Firearms System database by submitting an Automated Firearms System Request for Firearm Records (BOF 053) application to the Bureau of Firearms. That form is available on the Department's website at: https://oag.ca.gov/firearms/forms.
- 24. Once the application is received by the Bureau of Firearms, the Bureau of Firearms will conduct a diligent search of the Automated Firearms System for their records and will provide the individual with the listing of their firearms records via U.S. mail. The individual can then reference the listing (which notes their personal

information at time of purchase or transfer) and use it to submit an Automated Firearm System Personal Information Update application to update their records.

### B. Basic Ammunition Eligibility Checks

- 25. Section 4303 of title 11 of the California Code of Regulations governs Basic Ammunition Eligibility Checks.
- 26. The Department was required by law to develop a procedure in which a person who is not prohibited from purchasing or possessing ammunition may be approved for a single ammunition transaction or purchase. In order to meet this requirement, the Department developed the Basic Ammunition Eligibility Check which closely mirrored the current background check for firearms (without checking federal databases), thereby ensuring consistency in the eligibility checks. A Department analyst manually reviews a purchaser or transferee's records to ascertain the purchaser or transferor is not prohibited from owning or possessing ammunition due to a felony or violent misdemeanor conviction or warrant, domestic violence restraining order, mental health issue, or some combination of these factors.

#### C. COE Verification Checks

- 27. Section 4305 of title 11 of the California Code of Regulations governs Certificate of Eligibility Verification Checks.
- 28. To qualify for this type of check, a purchaser must have a current Certificate of Eligibility issued by the Department. To determine if the purchaser or transferee has a current Certificate of Eligibility, the Department, through an automated process in DES, cross-references the Certificate of Eligibility database. If the purchaser does not have a current Certificate of Eligibility, the transaction will be rejected.
- 29. A Certificate of Eligibility Verification Check (COE Verification Checks) may be rejected for the following reasons: (1) personal information provided to the ammunition vendor and entered into DES does not match the

information in the Certificate of Eligibility database; (2) the Certificate of Eligibility number provided to the ammunition vendor, and entered into DES does not match the information in the Certificate of Eligibility database; or (3) the Certificate of Eligibility for the purchaser is not current.

# II. THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE UPGRADES THE DEALER RECORD OF SALE ENTRY SYSTEM (DES) TO PROCESS AMMUNITION SALES AND TRANSFERS

- 30. Starting July 1, 2019, California ammunition vendors had access to DES to submit ammunition eligibility checks to the Department, and subsequently receive eligibility determinations through the system. DES also enables ammunition vendors to report information relative to the sale or transfer of ammunition to the Department, at the time of delivery, resulting in a systematic update of the Ammunition Purchase Records File.
- 31. The Department took several steps in the lead-up to the July 1, 2019 implementation date. A number of updates were made to DES to implement the new law. The user-facing side of these updates, and how to use them, were described to licensed ammunition vendors in a series of notices and guides.
- 32. On June 7, 2019, the Bureau of Firearms distributed a notice entitled "Ammunition Purchase Authorization Program." The notice advised dealers that effective July 1, 2019, ammunition vendor licensees would be prohibited from providing a purchaser with ammunition without approval from the Department of Justice, except as otherwise specified. It also advised that the "Ammunition Purchases and Transfers" regulations were being finalized, what equipment would be needed to process transactions through DES, how to enroll in DES, when full access to DES would be available for licensed ammunition vendors, what enhancements were made to DES, that the Department would be updating the DES User Guide and creating an Ammunition Vendor User Guide and both would be released at a later date, and it provided Customer Support Center hours of operation as well as the contact number. Included with the notice was a Quick Reference

- 33. On June 28, 2019, the Bureau of Firearms distributed a notice entitled "California Department of Justice Notification Regarding Regulations for Ammunition Purchase or Transfers and Automated Firearms System Information Updates." The notice advised licensed ammunition vendors and firearms dealers that effective July 1, 2019, persons seeking to purchase or transfer ammunition would have to undergo an eligibility check, and be approved by the Department, prior to the sale or transfer, except as otherwise specified. It also advised that effective July 1, 2019, persons with an outdated Automated Firearms System record would have the ability to correct or update personal information on their Automated Firearms System record via the California Firearms Application Reporting System. The notice provided information on where to locate the relevant regulations as well as contact information for the Customer Support Center. A copy of that notice is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 4.
- 34. On the same day, the Bureau of Firearms distributed a notice entitled "Regarding Availability of Instructional User Guides Related to Upcoming Ammunition Sale Requirements," and a quick reference guide that provided instructions on how to submit ammunition transactions. A copy of that notice and quick reference guide is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 5.
- 35. Also on the same day, the Bureau of Firearms posted on its website updated and new DES user guides relating to the ammunition sales requirements. The user guides provide an overview of the DES functions and provide direction on how to use the system in relation to ammunition transactions. Copies of those user guides are attached to this declaration as Exhibits 6 and 7.

# III. THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE'S EMERGENCY REGULATIONS GOVERNING THE IDENTIFICATION REQUIREMENTS FOR FIREARMS AND AMMUNITION PURCHASES AND TRANSFERS

- 36. As a result of my job duties, I am aware that in 2015, the California Department of Motor Vehicles started issuing driver licenses and identification cards with the notation "FEDERAL LIMITS APPLY" printed on the front under California State Assembly Bill (AB) 60 (AB 60), Stats. 2013, Ch. 524.
- 37. I am also aware that, as of January 22, 2018 California driver licenses and identification cards with the words "FEDERAL LIMITS APPLY" on the front are now issued to both: (1) persons applying under AB 60; and (2) persons who are able to submit satisfactory proof that their presence in the United States is authorized under federal law, but choose not to apply for a "REAL ID" driver license or identification card. REAL ID driver licenses comply with minimum requirements for various official federal purposes, and do not bear the "FEDERAL LIMITS APPLY" disclaimer.
- 38. As a result of my job duties, I have learned that some firearms dealers refused to accept "FEDERAL LIMITS APPLY" licenses issued on or after January 22, 2018, because they have been advised by their attorneys or have heard from advocacy groups that such licenses are being issued to AB 60 applicants.
- 39. For purchasers with "FEDERAL LIMITS APPLY" driver licenses issued before January 22, 2018, it should be readily apparent from the face of the license whether the applicant is an AB 60 license holder. For those applicants with "FEDERAL LIMITS APPLY" licenses issued after January 22, 2018, however, there is no practical way to determine from the face of the license whether the applicant is an AB 60 license holder.
- 40. In response to these concerns, the Department issued a Finding of Emergency on June 7, 2019, stating the need to promulgate an emergency regulation addressing the identification requirements for firearms and ammunition

- purchases and eligibility checks. A copy of that Finding of Emergency is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 8.
- 41. The Finding of Emergency references a document titled "National Rifle Association Institute for Legislative Action, California Special Alert: Update Regarding Use of Non-REAL IDs for Firearm Purchases," March 22, 2018 (NRA Update). That document is part of the rulemaking file, to which I have access. A true and correct copy of the NRA Update is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 9.
- 42. The Finding of Emergency also references a document titled "U.S. Department of Justice, Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, Open Letter to All California Federal Firearms Licensees," which was incorrectly listed as being dated June 30, 2018. The correct date of the letter is June 30, 2016 (ATF June 2016 Letter). That document is part of the rulemaking file, to which I have access. A true and correct copy of the ATF June 2016 Letter is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 10.
- 43. Department records, to which I have access, also contain an April 9, 2018 letter from Michel & Associates, P.C. to Attorney General Xavier Becerra regarding a Pre-Litigation Demand to Rescind Policy Prohibiting Purchase of Firearms Using Non-Real IDs (Michel Letter). A true and correct copy of the Michel Letter is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 11.
- 44. The Emergency Regulation was codified in the California Code of Regulations at title 11, section 4045.1. It went into effect on June 27, 2019.
- 45. The same day, the Department issued an notice titled "California Department of Justice Update Regarding the Use of 'Federal Limits Apply' Driver License and Identification Cards to Perform Eligibility Checks." A true and correct copy of the notice is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 12.

1	IV. THE AMMUNITION ELIGIBILITY CHECK SYSTEM AND RULES GO INTO EFFECT ON JULY 1, 2019.			
2	EFFECT ON JULY 1, 2019.			
3	46. The ammunition eligibility check system went live the morning of July 1,			
4	2019.			
5	47. As part of my job duties, I can request data from the Department's			
6	Application Development Bureau regarding ammunition eligibility transactions. I			
7	have obtained data for the period starting July 1 and ending July 31, 2019—the first			
8	calendar month that the ammunition eligibility check process was in place.			
9	48. Total number of ammunition transactions processed, including			
10	transactions that were rejected or where the purchaser was denied: 62,083.			
11	49. At least 106 transactions were denied because prohibited persons had			
12	attempted to purchase ammunition.			
13	50. Standard Ammunition Eligibility Checks: 57,553.			
14	a. Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check approvals: 46,702.			
15	b. Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check rejections: 10,837.			
16	c. Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check denials: 14.			
17	51. COE Verification Checks: 880.			
18	a. COE Verification Check approvals: 768.			
19	b. COE Verification Check rejections: 112 (this number may			
20	include denials).			
21	52. Basic Ammunition Eligibility Checks: 3,798.			
22	a. Basic Ammunition Eligibility Check approvals: 3,536.			
23	b. Basic Ammunition Eligibility Check denials: 92.			
24	c. Basic Ammunition Eligibility Check rejections: 22.			
25	53. Average time to check a purchaser's eligibility in a Standard			
26	Ammunition Eligibility Check: 1 second.			
27	54. Average time check a purchaser's eligibility in a COE Verification			
28	Check: 1 second.			

- 56. Average time, in COE Verification Check, from when the dealer submits the eligibility check to DES through when the dealer hits the "Deliver" button at the end of the Submit Ammunition Purchase process (ending the transaction in DES): 11 minutes, 5 seconds.
- 57. Based on my knowledge of DES and the ammunition eligibility check process, I understand that these numbers provide a good estimate of how long the average Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check and COE Verification Check take, once the personal information field in DES is populated (most of which is done by magnetic swipe), and excluding the time it takes to print and sign the Dealer Record of Sale.
- 58. The COE Verification Check average is likely higher than the Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check average because there are fewer COE Verification Checks overall, and some outliers may have affected the average—e.g., transactions where the eligibility check was submitted and the customer left the store and returned the next day, creating a gap of several hours in the transaction.
- 59. I am aware that a number of nonparty ammunition vendors submitted declarations in this matter representing the length of time it takes them to process ammunition transactions. For each of these vendors, I requested and obtained data from July 1 to and including July 31, 2019, showing the average time, in Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check and COE Verification Checks, from when the dealer submits the eligibility check to DES through when the dealer hits the "Deliver" button at the end process (ending the transaction in DES).
  - 60. Bill Ortiz and Turner's Outdoorsman: 5 minutes, 17 seconds.
  - 61. David Burwell and Norco Armory: 4 minutes, 31 seconds.

- 62. Chris Puehse and Foothill Ammo, Inc.: 2 minutes, 42 seconds.
- 63. Travis Morgan and Guns, Fishing and Other Stuff: 3 minutes, 46 seconds.
  - 64. Ethan Bartel and Royal Loan: 3 minutes, 12 seconds.

- 65. Myra Lowder and Mosquito Creek Outfitters: 3 minutes, 38 seconds.
- 66. Daniel Gray and Discount Gun Mart: 6 minutes, 3 seconds.
- 67. I am also aware that Plaintiff Denise Welvang submitted a declaration in this matter representing the amount of time it took to process an ammunition transaction at Gun World in Burbank, California, on July 13, 2019. I requested records involving Ms. Welvang be pulled for that day.
- 68. The records show that she engaged in a Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check at Gun World on the afternoon of July 13. In that transaction, the time from when the vendor submitted the eligibility check through when the dealer hit the "Deliver" button at the end process (ending the transaction in DES) took less than a minute.
- 69. The records also show that before Ms. Welvang went to Gun World she purchased ammunition at American Gun Works. In that transaction, the time from when the vendor submitted the eligibility check through when the dealer hit the "Deliver" button at the end process (ending the transaction in DES) took just over a minute.

## V. REPORTED ISSUES WITH THE AMMUNITION ELIGIBILITY CHECK SYSTEM.

- 70. Since the July 1, 2019 rollout of the ammunition eligibility check process on DES, the Department has received feedback and inquiries from the public.
- 71. The Department operates a Customer Support Center, which fields calls from hotlines for licensed firearms dealers and ammunition vendors, law enforcement agencies, Department certified instructors, and the public. The hotline for licensed firearms dealers and ammunition vendors is called the DES Customer

Support Center, and is available daily, 8:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. The center is specifically intended to assist licensed firearms dealers and ammunition vendors with their business needs. Firearms dealers and ammunition vendors may call the center with technical questions.

- 72. During the first week of July, there was a spike in the number of calls per day fielded by all members of the Customer Support Center. Most of those calls related to ammunition purchases. For that first week, callers may have had to wait or call back due to the high volume of calls. Since then, however, the number of calls per day has dropped significantly, but remains above the monthly average. The Bureau of Firearms anticipates a general increase in calls moving forward as a new program has been implemented and that will continue to generate calls.
- 73. Since the ammunition eligibility check process has been in effect, the Department has received notice of technical issues with DES and ammunition eligibility checks. I am aware of some of the issues that have been raised, and the steps that have been taken to address them. I will describe two examples of these issues.
- 74. First, the week of July 1, the Department received notices that a few Standard Ammunition Eligibility Checks were delayed due to the system not accommodating people who have more than two first names. A fix was implemented on July 25, 2019.
- 75. Second, there have been reports that the "Caliber" dropdown menu in the "Transaction and Ammunition Information" step does not contain all calibers of ammunition. I have been informed that the Department is currently researching whether any calibers are missing and anticipates implementing a fix, if one is necessary.
- 76. I am aware that a number of nonparty ammunition vendors submitted declarations stating that they have been unsuccessful in having their magnetic card readers populate the "gender, hair color, eye color, height, weight, place of birth,

- and telephone number" fields in DES. Place of birth and telephone number are not included on California driver licenses or identification cards, and therefore cannot be populated using the magnetic card reader. With regard to the other fields, the Department has not received any calls regarding the magnetic card reader not populating gender, hair color, eye color, height, or weight. At this time, the Department has no reason to believe that DES is preventing that information from being populated by magnetic swipe.
- 77. I am aware that a number of nonparty ammunition vendors submitted declarations suggesting that they cannot process ammunition transactions for customers whose driver licenses or identification cards list a P.O. Box as their address. I am also aware that these nonparty ammunition vendors have stated that they believe that California law and Department regulations do not allow ammunition vendors to manually edit a customer's address as reflected on their driver license or identification.
- 78. If the identification card or driver license has a P.O. Box listed, the dealer can manually enter the current address into the "Personal Information" field in the Standard Ammunition Eligibility Check. It is recommended, however, that dealers obtain documentation from the purchaser with the purchaser's current address to verify what they are entering on the transaction is accurate. The Department is not aware of any regulation or Penal Code that states ammunition vendors cannot manually input or edit a customer's address. The Department has issued guidance regarding P.O. boxes on the Bureau of Firearms Frequently Asked Questions website at: https://oag.ca.gov/firearms/apfaqs.

## Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on: August 2, 2019

Case 3:18 Case 08020 5 6 4 A J 2 4 3 6 6 A G 7 1 6 A G 7 1 6 A G 7 1 6 A G 8 A G 7 1 6 A G 8 A G 7 1 6 A G 8

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

Case Name:	Rhode v. Becerra	No.	3:18-cv-00802-BEN-JLB		
I hereby certify that on <u>August 5, 2019</u> , I electronically filed the following documents with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system:					
DECLARATION OF MAYRA G. MORALES IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT XAVIER BECERRA'S OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION					
I certify that <b>all</b> participants in the case are registered CM/ECF users and that service will be accomplished by the CM/ECF system.					
I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on <u>August 5, 2019</u> , at Sacramento, California.					
Tra	acie L. Campbell	/	s/ Tracie Campbell		
	Declarant		Signature		

SA2018101286 13985041.docx