NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1068

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, BY LETITIA JAMES, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK,

Plaintiff,

Index No. 451625/2020 Motion Seq. No. 39

v.

THE NATIONAL RIFLE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA, WAYNE LAPIERRE, WILSON PHILLIPS, JOHN FRAZER, and JOSHUA POWELL

Defendants.

AFFIRMATION IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF'S OPPOSITION TO THE NRA'S MOTION FOR REVIEW OF THE SPECIAL MASTER'S RULING DATED NOVEMBER 29, 2022 PERTAINING TO ALLEGED DEFICIENCIES IN PLAINTIFF'S PRIVILEGE LOG AND PRODUCTION OF RECORDS

Stephen C. Thompson, an attorney duly admitted to the Bar of this State, affirms under penalties of perjury pursuant to Civil Practice Law and Rules 2016 as follows:

- 1. I am an Assistant Attorney General in the Office of Letitia James, Attorney General of the State of New York ("OAG"), who appears on behalf of the People of the State of New York in this action.
- 2. I submit this Affirmation in support of Plaintiff's opposition to the National Rifle Association of America's ("NRA") motion for review of the Special Master's ruling dated November 29, 2022 pertaining to alleged deficiencies in Plaintiff's privilege log and production of records.
- 3. I am familiar with the facts and circumstances set forth in this Affirmation, which are based upon my personal knowledge and information contained in the files of the OAG.

INDEX NO. 451625/2020 COUNTY CLERK 01/17/2023

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1068

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

4. In February of 2021, the OAG produced the nonprivileged portions of its

investigatory file to the parties in this action. That file contained approximately 1.5 million pages

of documents and testimony obtained by the OAG during its investigation.

5. Attached as Exhibit A to this Affirmation is a true and correct copy of the OAG's

February 18, 2021 responses and objections to the NRA's February 3, 2021 First Requests for

Production of Documents.

6. Attached as Exhibit B to this Affirmation is a true and correct copy of the OAG's

November 10, 2021 responses and objections to the NRA's October 14, 2021 Second Requests for

Production of Documents.

Dated: New York, New York

January 17, 2023

/s Stephen Thompson

Stephen C. Thompson

2 of 3

COUNTY CLERK

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1068

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

Attorney Certification Pursuant to Commercial Division Rule 17

I, Stephen Thompson, an attorney duly admitted to practice law before the courts of the

State of New York, certify that the Affirmation of Stephen Thompson in Support of Plaintiff's

Opposition to the NRA's Motion for Review of the Special Master's Ruling Dated November 29,

2022 Pertaining to Alleged Deficiencies in Plaintiff's Privilege Log and Production of Records

complies with the word count limit set forth in Rule 17 of the Commercial Division of the Supreme

Court (22 NYCRR 202.70(g)) because the affirmation contains 247 words, excluding the parts

exempted by Rule 17. In preparing this certification, I have relied on the word count of the word-

processing system used to prepare this affirmation.

Dated: January 17, 2023

New York, New York

/s/ Stephen Thompson

Stephen C. Thompson

3 of 3

FILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 01/17/2023 06:53 PM INDEX NO. 451625/2020

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1069

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

# **EXHIBIT A**

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1069

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, BY LETITIA JAMES, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE NATIONAL RIFLE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA, INC., WAYNE LAPIERRE, WILSON PHILLIPS, JOHN FRAZER, and JOSHUA POWELL

Defendants.

Index No. 451625/2020

PLAINTIFF'S RESPONSES AND OBJECTIONS TO DEFENDANT NRA'S FIRST REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION

Pursuant to Rule 3122 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules, Plaintiff, the People of the State of New York, by their attorney, LETITIA JAMES, Attorney General of the State of New York, hereby object and respond to Defendant National Rifle Association of America, Inc.'s ("NRA") First Requests for Production of Documents, dated February 3, 2021, as follows.

### **GENERAL OBJECTIONS**

The following general responses and objections ("General Objections") are incorporated into each specific response and objection as if fully set forth therein:

1. These objections apply to Defendant's Instructions, Definitions, and each of Defendant's Requests for Production as if such objections were set forth in full in the response to each Request for Production and are not necessarily repeated in response to each individual Request for Production. The assertion of the same, similar, or additional objections in Plaintiff's specific objections to an individual Request for Production, or the failure to assert any additional objection to a Request for Production, does not and shall not be deemed to waive any of

ILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 01/17/2023 06:53 PM INDEX NO. 451625/2020

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1069 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

Plaintiff's objections as set forth in this section.

2. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they seek documents or information that are not relevant to, nor reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence relevant to, the allegations asserted in the Complaint.

- 3. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they are not sufficiently limited in time and/or scope.
- 4. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they seek to impose obligations that are broader than or inconsistent with those set forth in the Civil Practice Law and Rules.
- 5. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they call for the production of information or documents that are not in Plaintiff's possession, custody, or control.
- 6. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they seek the production of documents and/or information which are privileged, protected work product, confidential, proprietary, sensitive, relating to the privacy interests of nonparties, or otherwise protected from disclosure by law. The inadvertent production of any document or information that is privileged, was prepared in anticipation of litigation, or is otherwise immune from discovery shall not constitute a waiver of any privilege or of any other ground for objecting to discovery with respect to that document or information or of Plaintiff's right to object to the use of that information during any proceeding in this litigation or otherwise.
- 7. By responding to these Requests for Production, Plaintiff does not concede the materiality of the subject matters to which they refer. These responses are made expressly subject to, and without waiving or intending to waive, any questions or objections as to the

INDEX NO. 451625/2020 COUNTY CLERK 01/17/2023 06:53

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1069

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

competency, relevancy, materiality, privilege, or admissibility as evidence or for any other purpose, of any of the documents or information produced in response hereto, or of the subject

matter thereof, in any proceeding including the trial of this action or any subsequent proceeding.

8. Plaintiff objects to each and every document request to the extent it is overly

broad, unduly burdensome, vague, ambiguous, or seeks documents that are equally available to

Defendants and/or are publicly available. Plaintiff is willing to confer with Defendants to the

extent necessary to tailor these requests.

9. The responses set forth below are based on information currently available to

Plaintiff, who reserves the right to supplement, amend, or correct these responses.

**REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION** 

Request No. 1: All Documents and Communications concerning the

Investigation including, without limitation, all Documents referenced in the Attachment to the

January 27, 2021 letter sent by Assistant Attorney General Stephen C. Thompson to

Defendants' counsel, a copy of which is appended hereto as Exhibit B.

Response to Request No. 1: Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it

seeks information protected from disclosure by attorney client privilege and attorney work

product, is vague and ambiguous, is overly broad and unduly burdensome and seeks documents

or information that are not relevant to, nor reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence

relevant to, the allegations asserted in the Complaint. Subject to and without waiving these

objections, and subject to the General Objections, Plaintiff will produce non-privileged

responsive documents to the extent they can be located after a reasonable search.

Dated: New York, New York

February 18, 2021

**LETITIA JAMES** 

Attorney General of the State of New York

FILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 01/17/2023 06:53 PM INDEX NO. 451625/2020

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1069

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

Attorney for Plaintiff

By:

/s/ Stephen C. Thompson

STEPHEN C. THOMPSON Assistant Attorney General 28 Liberty Street

New York, New York 10005 Telephone: (212) 416-6183

Email: Stephen.Thompson@ag.ny.gov

To:

Sarah B. Rogers, Esq.
Brewer, Attorneys and Counselors
Attorney for Defendant National Rifle
Association of America, Inc.
750 Lexington Avenue, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor
New York, NY 10022
Tel. 212-489-1400

Email: sbr@brewerattorneys.com

FILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 01/17/2023 06:53 PM INDEX NO. 451625/2020

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

# **EXHIBIT B**

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, BY LETITIA JAMES, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE NATIONAL RIFLE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA, INC., WAYNE LAPIERRE, WILSON PHILLIPS, JOHN FRAZER, and JOSHUA POWELL

Defendants.

Index No. 451625/2020

PLAINTIFF'S RESPONSES AND OBJECTIONS TO DEFENDANT NRA'S SECOND REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION

Pursuant to Rule 3122 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules, Plaintiff, the People of the State of New York, by their attorney, LETITIA JAMES, Attorney General of the State of New York, hereby object and respond to Defendant National Rifle Association of America, Inc.'s ("NRA") Second Requests for Production of Documents, dated October 14, 2021, as follows.

#### **GENERAL OBJECTIONS**

The following general responses and objections ("General Objections") are incorporated into each specific response and objection as if fully set forth therein:

1. These objections apply to Defendant's Instructions, Definitions, and each of Defendant's Requests for Production as if such objections were set forth in full in the response to each Request for Production and are not necessarily repeated in response to each individual Request for Production. The assertion of the same, similar, or additional objections in Plaintiff's specific objections to an individual Request for Production, or the failure to assert any additional objection to a Request for Production, does not and shall not be deemed to waive any of

COUNTY CLERK

DOC. NO. 1070

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

Plaintiff's objections as set forth in this section.

2. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they seek documents or information that are not relevant to, nor reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence relevant to, the allegations asserted in the Amended and Supplemental Verified Complaint, dated August 16, 2021 (the "Complaint").

- Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they are not 3. sufficiently limited in time and/or scope.
- Plaintiff objects to these Requests to the extent that they relate to Defendant 4. NRA's Counterclaims, because discovery on said Counterclaims is stayed by order of the Court and the parties' Stipulation.
- Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they seek to 5. impose obligations that are broader than or inconsistent with those set forth in the Civil Practice Law and Rules.
- 6. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they call for the production of information or documents that are not in Plaintiff's possession, custody, or control, or are more readily available from other parties or sources.
- 7. Plaintiff objects to these Requests for Production to the extent that they seek the production of documents and/or information which are privileged, protected work product, prepared in anticipation of litigation or for trial, confidential, proprietary, sensitive, confidential law enforcement materials, relating to the privacy interests of nonparties, or otherwise protected from disclosure by law. The inadvertent production of any document or information that is privileged, was prepared in anticipation of litigation, or is otherwise immune from discovery shall not constitute a waiver of any privilege or of any other ground for objecting to discovery

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

with respect to that document or information or of Plaintiff's right to object to the use of that information during any proceeding in this litigation or otherwise.

- 8. By responding to these Requests for Production, Plaintiff does not concede the materiality of the subject matters to which they refer. These responses are made expressly subject to, and without waiving or intending to waive, any questions or objections as to the competency, relevancy, materiality, privilege, or admissibility as evidence or for any other purpose, of any of the documents or information produced in response hereto, or of the subject matter thereof, in any proceeding including the trial of this action or any subsequent proceeding.
- 9. Plaintiff objects to each and every document request to the extent it is overly broad, unduly burdensome, vague, ambiguous, or seeks documents that are equally available to Defendants and/or are publicly available. Plaintiff is willing to confer with Defendants to the extent necessary to tailor these requests.
- 10. The responses set forth below are based on information currently available to Plaintiff, who reserves the right to supplement, amend, or correct these responses.

# **REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION**

### **REOUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 2:**

All Documents and Communications relating to the drafting, contents, timing, and release of any of Your public statements concerning the NRA, whether in an official or an individual capacity.

### Response to Request No. 2:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request at this time.

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 3:** 

For each statement attributed to James and listed in Table A below, please produce all

Documents and Communications related to such statements, including but not limited to:

i. Any talking points, scripts, prepared speeches, or prepared remarks

for or by James containing such statements or referencing such statements;

ii. Any transcripts or recordings of such statements by James;

iii. Any calendar invitations for or photographs from the events at

which these statements were made; and/or

iv. Any of the foregoing types of materials that reflect any statements

or contemplated statements by James to the effect of the statements listed

in Table A below—or any other statements accusing the NRA of illegal

behavior—during or in furtherance of the Campaign.

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

# Table A

	Statement or Reported Statement by Letitia James (underline indicates emphasis added)	Approximate Date/Event
A.	"The NRA is an <u>organ of deadly propaganda</u> masquerading as a charity for public good."	July 12, 2018 Press Release <sup>2</sup>
В.	"As Attorney General, Tish James will target the NRA, take on arms manufacturers and dealers, investigate financial backing of gun makers and sellers, and build new models to take on interstate arms trafficking."	July 12, 2018 Press Release <sup>3</sup>
C.	"Together, we can take on the @nra"	September 1, 2018 <sup>4</sup>
D.	"[W]e CAN take down the NRA. We CANNOT waiver on gun control. That's why I'm running."	September 3, 2018 <sup>5</sup>
E.	"[The NRA] are nothing more than a criminal enterprise. We are waiting to take on all of the banks that finance them, their investors."	August 30, 2018, Published Interview with Our Time Press <sup>6</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Tish James for Attorney General Press Release, Tish James Announces Attorney General Platform to Protect New Yorkers from Gun Violence, July 12, 2018, https://www.tishjames2018.com/press-releases/2018/7/12/taking-on-the-scourge-of-gun-violence-and-keeping-new-yorkers-safe/ (Last Visited, October 14, 2021).

<sup>3</sup> *Id.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> @TishJames Twitter post.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> @TishJames Twitter post.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Tish James Becomes New York's Attorney General – First Black Woman Elected to Statewide Office, Our Time Press (Nov. 8, 2018), https://ourtimepress.com/tish-james-becomes-new-yorks-attorney-general-first-black-woman-elected-to-statewide-office/ (Last Visited, October 14, 2021).

NIZGEE DOG NO 1070

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

Statement or Reported Statement by Letitia James Approximate Date/Event (underline indicates emphasis added) F. "the NRA . . . is a criminal enterprise." September 4, 2018, Video of "Evening with the Candidates" Forum for the Democratic Attorney General Primary Candidates hosted by New York City Bar Association<sup>7</sup> ""NRA . . . needs to be held accountable for the September 27, 2018<sup>8</sup> G. destruction and the loss of lives . . . " "James said that she made no distinction between September 27, 2018<sup>9</sup> H. the lobbying and charitable arms of the NRA." "When I'm Attorney General I'll take on the I October 8, 2018<sup>10</sup> @NRA and investigate their status as a nonprofit." "Tums out they [the NRA] don't like it . . . if you October 10, 2018<sup>11</sup> J. pledge to investigate their status as a non-profit as the next AG of NY." "The NRA holds [itself] out as a charitable K. October 31, 2018, Published Interview with *Ebony*<sup>12</sup> organization, but in fact, [it] really [is] a terrorist organization." November 8, 2018<sup>13</sup> "Let me be clear: when I take office I will L. investigate the non-profit status of the NRA & take every legal step I can to help ensure another life isn't lost to senseless gun violence. #GunControlNow"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6n2 LHNEUW0 (statement at the 17:50 mark).

http://liherald.com/stories/nassau-protests-nra-fundraiser,107617 (Oct. 25, 2018) (Last Visited, October 14, 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> @TishJames Twitter post.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> @TishJames Twitter post.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Letitia 'Tish' James on Becoming New York's Next Attorney General, EBONY (Oct. 31, 2018) https://www.ebony.com/news/letitia-tish-james-on-becoming-new-yorks-next-attorney-general/ (Last Visited, October 14, 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> @TishJames Twitter post.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

Response to Request No. 3:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

**REOUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 4:** 

documents responsive to this Request at this time.

All Documents and Communications concerning public roundtables, discussion groups, meetings or other public gatherings in which the NRA was referenced or discussed by James, whether during her Campaign or as Attorney General, including but not limited to, the September 27, 2018 roundtable event in Mineola, New York referenced above in Request for Production No. 3, Table A. Concerning the September 27, 2018 roundtable event, please produce all Documents and Communications including, but not limited to: (i) drafts or recordings of James's speeches or remarks; (ii) communications related to the planning of the roundtable event and the decision to schedule it the same day as a Friends of the NRA fundraiser held in New Hyde Park, New York; (iii) communications

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

related to whether and how holding the roundtable event was intended to or would likely

help James get elected as the Attorney General for the State of New York; and/or (iv) any

photographs, transcripts or recordings from the event.

Response to Request No. 4:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request at this time.

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 5:** 

All Documents and Communications concerning Campaign materials and/or Campaign

fundraising materials, referring to the NRA—directly or indirectly—including but not

limited to, any materials referencing the statements set forth in Request for Production No.

3, Table A.

Response to Request No. 5:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request at this time.

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 6:** 

All Documents and Communications concerning the drafting, contents, timing, and release of any of Campaign statements, Campaign fundraising statements and/or donor solicitations referencing the NRA, directly or indirectly, including but not limited to, the fundraising solicitation issued by James on or about August 6, 2020, a copy of which is

**Response to Request No. 6:** 

annexed hereto as Exhibit B.

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request at this time.

**REOUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 7:** 

All Documents and Communications relating to the drafting, contents, timing, and release

of any of Your and/or the Campaign's press releases concerning the NRA.

Response to Request No. 7:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request at this time.

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 8:** 

All Documents and Communications between James and former Governor Andrew Cuomo

("Cuomo") concerning the NRA, including but not limited to, concerning Cuomo's

endorsement of James for New York State Attorney General.

Response to Request No. 8:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request at this time.

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 9:** 

All Documents and Communications concerning the Investigation, including but not

limited to: (i) concerning authorization of the commencement of the Investigation, and

(ii) evidencing the date of the commencement of the Investigation.

**Response to Request No. 9:** 

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Notwithstanding the foregoing, and without

waiving the objections stated herein, Plaintiff states that it has already produced to the

NRA in this action all discoverable factual information from the investigation with the

exception of documents and information that are protected from disclosure by one or more

of the aforementioned privileges or otherwise under the law. Accordingly, Plaintiff will

not produce documents responsive to this Request.

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 10:** 

All Documents and Communications related to formal or informal interviews conducted

by You or any of Your staff, attorneys or other representatives, during the Investigation,

including but not limited to, transcripts of interviews, notes of interviews, exhibits used

during interviews, and lists of individuals interviewed and present during the interviews,

and including but not limited to, the dates of such interviews.

Response to Request No. 10:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Notwithstanding the foregoing,

and without waiving the objections stated herein, Plaintiff states that it has already

produced to the NRA in this action all discoverable factual information from the

investigation with the exception of documents and information that are protected from

disclosure by one or more of the aforementioned privileges or otherwise under the law.

Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce documents responsive to this Request.

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 11:** 

All Documents and Communications concerning continuation or termination of any

Person's business relationship with the NRA, including but not limited to,

Communications between (a) You, and (b) that Person.

Response to Request No. 11:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request.

**REOUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 12:** 

All Documents and Communications concerning any changes in the NRA's (a) internal

governance, or (b) internal policies and procedures, including but not limited to,

Documents and Communications regarding any internal or external audit performed by or

for the NRA of its (i) internal policies and procedures, or (ii) financial and/or accounting

records.

Response to Request No. 12:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. In addition, documents

responsive to the Request are already in the possession, custody, or control of Defendant

NRA. Notwithstanding the foregoing, and without waiving the objections stated herein,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

Plaintiff states that it has already produced to the NRA in this action all discoverable

factual information from the investigation with the exception of documents and

information that are protected from disclosure by one or more of the aforementioned

privileges or otherwise under the law. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce documents

responsive to this Request.

**REOUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 13:** 

All Documents and Communications concerning the NRA between You and any of the

following entities—whether directly or indirectly—including but not limited to, any of the

entities' current or former officers, employees, contractors, investigators, attorneys, agents,

representatives, predecessors-in-interest, or designees.

- 1. Edward Skyler;
- 2. Cuomo;
- 3. Office of the Attorney General for the District of Columbia;
- 4. New York State Department of Financial Services;
- 5. Michael R. Bloomberg and/or any other Campaign donor or supporter;
- 6. Everytown;
- 7. Moms Demand Action;
- 8. Moms Demand Action for Gun Sense in America;
- 9. Gays Against Guns;
- 10. Pod Save America;
- 11. Berkshire Bank;
- 12. Citibank;
- 13. Citizens Financial Group;
- 14. People's United Bank;

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

15. Regions Financial Corp.;

- 16. TD Bank;
- 17. Truist Financial (formerly BB&T Corp.); and/or
- 18. Former or current members of the NRA's Board of Directors, the NRA's officers, employees, or representatives of vendors of the NRA or any witnesses whose testimony or out-of-court statements You may offer in evidence at trial or any pretrial hearing in this Action, including but not limited to, Wilson "Woody" Phillips, Joshua Powell, Wayne LaPierre, John Frazer, Christopher Cox, Oliver North, Mildred Hallow, Peter Brownell, Richard Childress, Daniel Boren, Esther Schneider, Roscoe "Rocky" Marshall, Phillip Journey, Ackerman McQueen, Inc., Aronson, LLC, RSM US LLP, J. Stephen Hart, Michael Volkov, and/or Cooper & Kirk LLP.

In complying with this request, for any meeting or other Communication, please produce, without limitation, all Documents related to:

- (a) any scheduling communications, including but not limited to, calendar invitations, sent in advance of any such meetings or Communications,
- (b) evidence of any planned, cancelled, or actual communications with these individuals or entities concerning the NRA,
  - (c) email messages,
  - (d) other Outlook or similar application records,
  - (e) text messages or other instant messages,
  - (f) voicemails,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

(g) materials used or created for, during, or after such meetings or Communications (such as PowerPoint presentations, meeting agenda(s), handouts,

meeting notes, action or follow up items, or transcripts), and/or

(h) summary memoranda or similar documents prepared in

conjunction with or after such meetings or other Communications.

Response to Request No. 13:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Notwithstanding the foregoing, and without

waiving the objections stated herein, Plaintiff states that it has already produced to the

NRA in this action all discoverable factual information from the investigation with the

exception of documents and information that are protected from disclosure by one or more

of the aforementioned privileges or otherwise under the law. Accordingly, Plaintiff will

not produce documents responsive to this Request.

DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

**REOUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 14:** 

All Documents and Communications in effect since January 1, 2011 concerning Your

internal or publicly disclosed guidance, guidelines, directives, policies and/or procedures

for seeking the involuntary judicial dissolution of not-for-profit corporations.

**Response to Request for Production No. 14:** 

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which

the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce

documents responsive to this Request.

**REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 15:** 

All Documents and Communications referring to or describing any entity for which You

have sought involuntary judicial dissolution as a "sham."

**Response to Request No. 15:** 

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it is vague and

ambiguous, its meaning is difficult to ascertain, is overly broad and unduly burdensome,

and seeks documents or information that are not relevant to, nor reasonably calculated to

lead to, discovery of evidence relevant to the allegations asserted in the Complaint or to

this action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to the Request to the extent that the Request is

deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled

discovery is stayed and regarding which the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed.

Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce documents responsive to this Request.

**REOUEST FOR PRODUCTION NO. 16:** 

All Document preservation notices effectuating Your obligations to preserve documents

and other things in light of pending or anticipated litigation against You.

Response to Request No. 16:

Plaintiff objects to this request to the extent that it seeks information protected from

disclosure by various privileges, including the attorney client privilege, attorney work

product privilege, deliberative process privilege, public interest privilege, common

interest privilege, and/or law enforcement privilege, on the ground that it was prepared in

anticipation of litigation or for trial, on the ground that it is vague and ambiguous, is overly

broad and unduly burdensome, is not material and necessary to the prosecution or defense

of the action, and is not reasonably calculated to lead to discovery of evidence material

and necessary to the prosecution or defense of the action. Moreover, Plaintiff objects to

the Request to the extent that the Request is deemed to relate to Defendant NRA's

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1070

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 01/17/2023

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

counterclaims, about which the Court has ruled discovery is stayed and regarding which the NRA has stipulated discovery is stayed. Accordingly, Plaintiff will not produce documents responsive to this Request.

Dated: New York, New York November 10, 2021

LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General of the State of New York
Attorney for Plaintiff
By: /s/ Monica Connell

MONICA CONNELL
Assistant Attorney General
28 Liberty Street

New York, New York 10005 Telephone: (212) 416-8965

Email: Monica.Connell@ag.ny.gov

To:

Sarah B. Rogers, Esq.
Brewer, Attorneys and Counselors
Attorney for Defendant National Rifle
Association of America, Inc.
750 Lexington Avenue, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor
New York, NY 10022
Tel. 212-489-1400

Email: sbr@brewerattorneys.com