IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

DELAWARE STATE SPORTSMEN'S ASSOCIATION, INC; BRIDGEVILLE RIFLE & PISTOL CLUB, LTD.; DELAWARE RIFLE AND PISTOL CLUB; DELAWARE ASSOCIATION OF FEDERAL FIREARMS LICENSEES; MADONNA M. NEDZA; CECIL CURTIS CLEMENTS; JAMES E. HOSFELT, JR; BRUCE C. SMITH; VICKIE LYNN PRICKETT; and FRANK M. NEDZA,

Plaintiffs,

v.

DELAWARE DEPARTMENT OF SAFETY AND HOMELAND SECURITY; NATHANIAL MCQUEEN JR. in his official capacity as Cabinet Secretary, Delaware Department of Safety and Homeland Security; and COL. MELISSA ZEBLEY in her official capacity as superintendent of the Delaware State Police,

Defendants.

GABRIEL GRAY; WILLIAM TAYLOR; DJJAMS LLC; FIREARMS POLICY COALITION, INC. and SECOND AMENDMENT FOUNDATION,

Plaintiffs,

v.

KATHY JENNINGS, Attorney General of Delaware,

Defendant.

C.A. No. 1:22-cv-00951-RGA (Consolidated)

DECLARATION OF LUCY P. ALLEN IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS'
OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION

- I, Lucy P. Allen, the undersigned, declare as follows:
- 1. I am a Managing Director of NERA Economic Consulting ("NERA"), a member of NERA's Securities and Finance Practice, and Chair of NERA's Product Liability and Mass Torts Practice. NERA provides practical economic advice related to highly complex business and legal issues arising from competition, regulation, public policy, strategy, finance, and litigation. NERA was established in 1961 and now employs approximately 500 people in more than 20 offices worldwide.
- 2. In my over 25 years at NERA, I have been engaged as an economic consultant or expert witness in numerous projects involving economics and statistics. I have been qualified as an expert and testified in court on various economic and statistical issues relating to the flow of guns into the criminal market. I have testified at trials in Federal and State Courts, before the New York City Council Public Safety Committee, the American Arbitration Association, and the Judicial Arbitration Mediation Service, as well as in depositions.
- 3. I have an A.B. from Stanford University, an M.B.A. from Yale University, and M.A. and M. Phil. degrees in Economics, also from Yale University. Prior to joining NERA, I was an Economist for both President George H. W. Bush's and President Bill Clinton's Council of Economic Advisers. My resume with recent publications and testifying experience is included as **Exhibit A**.
- 4. I have been asked by the Delaware Department of Justice to address the following issues: (a) the number of rounds of ammunition fired by individuals using a gun in self-defense;¹

I have also been asked to analyze the use of assault rifles by private citizens in active shooter incidents according to the FBI's "Active Shooter Incidents" reports and the percent of incidents in which rifles were used in self-defense according to The Heritage Foundation's "Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S." database.

and (b) the outcomes when assault weapons and large-capacity magazines are used in public mass shootings, including the associated number of casualties.

OPINIONS

A. Use of Guns in Self-Defense

- 1. The number of rounds used by individuals in self-defense
- 5. Plaintiffs claim the "large-capacity magazines" (magazines capable of holding more than seventeen rounds) and "assault weapons" covered by Delaware's House Bill 450 ("HB 450") and Senate Substitute 1 for Senate Bill 6 ("SS 1 for SB 6")² are commonly used for lawful purposes, including for self-defense.³
- 6. The number of rounds commonly needed by individuals to defend themselves cannot be practically or ethically determined with controlled scientific experiments and there is no source that systematically tracks or maintains data on the number of rounds fired by individuals in self-defense. Due to these limitations, I have analyzed available data sources to estimate the number of rounds fired by individuals to defend themselves. In particular, I have analyzed data from the NRA Institute for Legislative Action, as well as my own study of news reports on incidents of self-defense with a firearm. In all, I have analyzed almost 1,000 incidents

Under Delaware's HB 450, a firearm is classified as an assault weapon if it is one of 63 firearm types and models listed, if it is a copy of one of the listed firearms, or if it has "certain features." Examples of assault weapons include the "Daewoo AR 100," "Bushmaster semi-auto rifle," "Colt AR-15," and the "UZI pistol." A semiautomatic, centerfire rifle that can accept a detachable magazine can also be considered an assault weapon if it includes certain features, including a "pistol grip," a "thumbhole stock," a "flash suppressor," or a "folding or telescoping stock." *See* Delaware's HB 450 and Amended Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief, filed September 9, 2022, ¶¶ 42-45.

See, for example, Amended Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief, filed September 9, 2022, ¶¶ 61 and 72, and Complaint, filed November 16, 2022, ¶¶ 57 and 63.

of self-defense with a firearm and found that it is extremely rare for a person, when using a firearm in self-defense, to fire more than seventeen rounds.

The NRA maintains a database of "Armed Citizen" stories describing private 7. citizens who have successfully defended themselves, or others, using a firearm ("NRA Armed Citizen database"). According to the NRA, the "Armed Citizen" stories "highlight accounts of law-abiding gun owners in America using their Second Amendment rights to defend self, home and family."⁴ Although the methodology used to compile the NRA Armed Citizen database of stories is not explicitly detailed by the NRA, the NRA Armed Citizen database is a useful data source in this matter for at least three reasons. First, the NRA Armed Citizen database was the largest collection of accounts of citizen self-defense compiled by others that I was able to find.⁵ Second, the incidents listed in the NRA Armed Citizen database highlight the very conduct that Plaintiffs claim the Delaware law impedes (i.e., the use of firearms by law-abiding citizens for self-defense).⁶ Third, the NRA Armed Citizen database is compiled by an entity that actively opposes restrictions on magazine capacity and restrictions on the possession and use of firearms in general. In light of the positions taken by the entity compiling the data, I would expect that any selection bias would be in favor of stories that put use of guns in self-defense in the best possible light and might highlight the apparent need of guns and/or multiple rounds in selfdefense incidents.

NRA Institute for Legislative Action, Armed Citizens, https://www.nraila.org/gunlaws/armed-citizen/, accessed May 28, 2017.

Note that in 2020, after the time my research was conducted, The Heritage Foundation began an online database of its own sample of defensive gun use incidents (https://datavisualizations.heritage.org/firearms/defensive-gun-uses-in-the-us).

⁶ Amended Complaint, ¶¶ 1-7.

⁷ See, for example, NRA Civil Rights Defense Fund website, http://www.nradefensefund.org/current-litigation.aspx, accessed October 12, 2018.

- 8. My team and I performed an analysis of incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen database that occurred between January 2011 and May 2017.⁸ For each incident, the city/county, state, venue (whether the incident occurred on the street, in the home, or elsewhere) and the number of shots fired were tabulated.⁹ The information was gathered for each incident from both the NRA synopsis and, where available, an additional news story. An additional news story was found for over 95% of the incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen database.
- 9. According to this analysis of incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen database, it is extremely rare for a person, when using firearms in self-defense, to fire more than seventeen rounds. Out of 736 incidents, there were no incidents in which the defender was reported to have fired more than 17 bullets and only two incidents (0.3% of all incidents), in which the defender was reported to have fired more than 10 bullets.¹⁰ Defenders fired 2.2 shots on average.¹¹ In 18.2% of incidents, the defender did not fire any shots. These incidents highlight the fact that in

My collection and coding of the NRA Armed Citizen stories was last performed in mid-2017.

The following incidents were excluded from the analysis: (1) duplicate incidents, (2) wild animal attacks, and (3) one incident where the supposed victim later pleaded guilty to covering up a murder. When the exact number of shots fired was not specified, we used the average for the most relevant incidents with known number of shots. For example, if the story stated that "shots were fired" this would indicate that at least two shots were fired and thus we used the average number of shots fired in all incidents in which two or more shots were fired and the number of shots was specified.

Note that the only two incidents with more than 10 bullets fired were added to the NRA Armed Citizen database in 2016 and 2017 after an earlier analysis that I had conducted of the database had been submitted to and cited by the Court in *Kolbe v. O'Malley*, Case No. CCB-13-2841 (Dkt. 79).

Note that the analysis is focused on shots fired when using a gun in self-defense and therefore the average includes instances when no shots are fired. If one calculates the average excluding incidents of self-defense with a gun without firing shots, the average is still low, 2.6 shots when at least one shot is fired.

many instances defenders are able to defend themselves without firing any shots. For example, according to one of the incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen Database:

"A man entered a Shell station in New Orleans, La. and attempted to rob a cashier, by claiming he was carrying a gun. The cashier responded by retrieving a gun and leveling it at the thief, prompting the criminal to flee. (The Times Picayune, New Orleans, La. 09/02/15)"¹²

10. For incidents occurring in the home (56% of total), defenders fired an average of 2.1 shots, and fired no shots in 16.1% of incidents. For incidents occurring outside the home (44%) of total, defenders fired an average of 2.2 shots, and fired no shots in 20.9% of incidents.¹³ The table below summarizes these findings:

[&]quot;Gas station clerk scares off robber," NRA-ILA Armed Citizen, September 9, 2015.

A separate study of incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen database for an earlier period (the five-year period from 1997 through 2001) found similar results. Specifically, this study found that, on average, 2.2 shots were fired by defenders and that in 28% of incidents of armed citizens defending themselves the individuals fired no shots at all. See, Claude Werner, "The Armed Citizen – A Five Year Analysis," https://tacticalprofessor.files.wordpress.com/2014/12/tac-5-year-w-tables.pdf, accessed January 26, 2023.

Number of Shots Fired in Self-Defense Based on NRA Armed Citizen Incidents in the United States January 2011 - May 2017

Shots Fired by Individual in Self-Defense

	Overall	Incidents in Home	Outside the Home
Average Number of Shots Fired	2.2	2.1	2.2
Number of Incidents with No Shots Fired	134	66	68
Percent of Incidents with No Shots Fired	18.2%	16.1%	20.9%
Number of Incidents with >10 Shots Fired	2	2	0
Percent of Incidents with >10 Shots Fired	0.3%	0.5%	0.0%
Number of Incidents with >17 Shots Fired	0	0	0
Percent of Incidents with >17 Shots Fired	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%

Notes and Sources:

Data from NRA Armed Citizen database covering 736 incidents (of which 411 were in the home) from January 2011 through May 2017. Excludes duplicate incidents, wild animal attacks and one incident where the supposed victim later pleaded guilty to covering up a murder.

- 11. In addition to our analysis of incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen database, we performed a systematic, scientific study of news reports on incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home, focusing on the same types of incidents as the NRA stories and covering the same time period.¹⁴
- 12. To identify relevant news stories to include in our analysis, we performed a comprehensive search of published news stories using Factiva, an online news reporting service

This analysis was initially conducted to research issues regarding self-defense in the home, which was a focus of federal Second Amendment jurisprudence before the 2022 *New York State Rifle & Pistol Association v. Bruen* Supreme Court decision. The analysis of the NRA Armed Citizen database incidents described above indicates that the number of shots fired in self-defense outside the home is similar to those inside the home.

and archive owned by Dow Jones, Inc. that aggregates news content from nearly 33,000 sources. The search was designed to return stories about the types of incidents that are the focus of the NRA Armed Citizen database and that Plaintiffs claim the Delaware law impedes — in particular, the use of firearms for self-defense. The search identified all stories that contained the following keywords in the headline or lead paragraph: one or more words from "gun," "shot," "shoot," "fire," or "arm" (including variations on these keywords, such as "shooting" or "armed"), plus one or more words from "broke in," "break in," "broken into," "breaking into," "burglar," "intruder," or "invader" (including variations on these keywords) and one or more words from "home," "apartment," or "property" (including variations on these keywords). The search criteria match approximately 90% of the NRA stories on self-defense with a firearm in the home, and an analysis of the 10% of stories that are not returned by the search shows that the typical number of shots fired in these incidents was no different than in other incidents. The search covered the same period used in our analysis of incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen database (January 2011 to May 2017). The region for the Factiva search was set

_

Factiva is often used for academic research. For example, a search for the term "Factiva" on Google Scholar yields over 28,000 results. As another example, a search on Westlaw yields at least 83 expert reports that conducted news searches using Factiva.

NRA Institute for Legislative Action, Armed Citizens, https://www.nraila.org/gunlaws/armed-citizen/, accessed May 28, 2017. See, also, Amended Complaint, ¶¶ 1-7.

The precise search string used was: (gun* or shot* or shoot* or fire* or arm*) and ("broke in" or "break in" or "broken into" or "breaking into" or burglar* or intrud* or inva*) and (home* or "apartment" or "property"). An asterisk denotes a wildcard, meaning the search includes words which have any letters in place of the asterisk. For example, a search for shoot* would return results including "shoots," "shooter" and "shooting." The search excluded duplicate stories classified as "similar" on Factiva.

to "United States." The search returned approximately 35,000 stories for the period January 2011 to May 2017.¹⁸

- 13. Using a random number generator, a random sample of 200 stories was selected for each calendar year, yielding 1,400 stories in total.¹⁹ These 1,400 stories were reviewed to identify those stories that were relevant to the analysis, *i.e.*, incidents of self-defense with a firearm in or near the home. This methodology yielded a random selection of 200 news stories describing incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home out of a population of approximately 4,800 relevant stories.²⁰ Thus, out of the over 70 million news stories aggregated by Factiva between January 2011 and May 2017, approximately 4,800 news stories were on incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home. We analyzed a random selection of 200 of these stories.
- 14. For each news story, the city/county, state and number of shots fired were tabulated. When tabulating the number of shots fired, we used the same methodology as we used

The effect of using alternative keywords was considered. For example, removing the second category ("broke in" or "break in" or "broken into" or "breaking into" or burglar* or intrud* or inva*) and including incidents in which the assailant was already inside the home and/or was known to the victim was considered. *A priori*, there was no reason to believe that a larger number of shots would be used in these incidents and based on an analysis of the NRA stories we found that the number of shots fired in incidents when defending against someone already in the home was not different than those with an intruder.

The random numbers were generated by sampling with replacement.

The approximately 4,800 relevant news stories were estimated by calculating the proportion of relevant news stories from the 200 randomly selected stories each year and applying that proportion to the number of results returned by the search for each year of the analysis. For example, in 2017, 33 out of 200 (17%) randomly selected news stories involved incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home. Applying that proportion to the 1,595 results from the Factiva search in 2017 yields 263 relevant news stories in 2017. This process was repeated every year to arrive at a total of 4,841 relevant news stories from 2011-2017.

to analyze stories in the NRA Armed Citizen database.²¹ We then identified other stories describing the same incident on Factiva based on the date, location and other identifying information, and recorded the number of times that each incident was covered by Factiva news stories.

15. To determine the average number of shots fired per *incident*, we first determined the average number of shots fired per *story* and then analyzed the number of stories per incident. According to our study of a random selection from approximately 4,800 relevant stories on Factiva describing incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home, the average number of shots fired per story was 2.61. This is not a measure of the average shots fired *per incident*, however, because the number of stories covering an incident varies, and the variation is not independent of the number of shots fired. We found that there was a statistically significant relationship between the number of shots fired in an incident and the number of news stories covering an incident.²² We found that on average the more shots fired in a defensive gun use incident, the greater the number of stories covering an incident. For example, as shown in the table below, we found that incidents in Factiva news stories with zero shots fired were covered

When the exact number of shots fired was not specified, we used the average for the most relevant incidents with known number of shots. For example, if the story stated that "shots were fired" this would indicate that at least two shots were fired and thus we used the average number of shots fired in all incidents in which two or more shots were fired and the number of shots was specified.

Based on a linear regression of the number of news stories as a function of the number of shots fired, the results were statistically significant at the 1% level (more stringent than the 5% level commonly used by academics and accepted by courts. See, for example, Freedman, David A., and David H. Kaye, "Reference Guide on Statistics," *Reference Manual on Scientific Evidence* (Washington, D.C.: The National Academies Press, 3rd ed., 2011), pp. 211-302, and Fisher, Franklin M., "Multiple Regression in Legal Proceedings," 80 *Columbia Law Review* 702 (1980).)

on average by 1.8 news stories, while incidents with six or more shots fired were covered on average by 10.4 different news stories.

Average Number of News Stories by Number of Shots Fired In Factiva Stories on Incidents of Self-Defense with a Firearm January 2011 - May 2017

Number of Shots Fired By Defender	Average Number of News Stories
0	1.8
1 to 2	2.8
3 to 5	3.8
6 or more	10.4

Notes and Sources:

Based on stories describing defensive gun use in a random selection of Factiva stories between 2011 to May 2017 using the search string: (gun* or shot* or shoot* or fire* or arm*) and ("broke in" or "break in" or "broken into" or "breaking into" or burglar* or intrud* or inva*) and (home* or "apartment" or "property"), with region set to "United States" and excluding duplicate stories classified as "similar" on Factiva. Methodology for tabulation of shots fired as per footnote 21.

16. After adjusting for this disparity in news coverage, we find that the average number of shots fired per incident covered is 2.34.²³ Note that this adjustment does not take into

$$\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \left(\textit{Shots Fired}_{i} \times \frac{R_{i}}{C_{i}} \right)}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \left(\frac{R_{i}}{C_{i}} \right)}$$

where:

n = random selection of news stories on incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home

 R_i = number of search results on Factiva in the calendar year of incident i

 C_i = number of news stories covering incident i

The adjustment reflects the probability that a news story on a particular incident would be selected at random from the total population of news stories on incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home. The formula used for the adjustment is:

account the fact that some defensive gun use incidents may not be picked up by *any* news story. Given the observed relationship that there are more news stories when there are more shots fired, one would expect that the incidents that are not written about would on average have fewer shots than those with news stories. Therefore, the expectation is that these results, even after the adjustment, are biased upward (*i.e.*, estimating too high an average number of shots and underestimating the percent of incidents in which no shots were fired).

17. As shown in the table below, according to the study of Factiva news stories, in 11.6% of incidents the defender did not fire any shots, and simply threatened the offender with a gun. In 97.3% of incidents the defender fired 5 or fewer shots. There were no incidents where the defender was reported to have fired more than 10 or 17 bullets.

Number of Shots Fired in Self-Defense in the Home Based on Random Selection of Articles from Factiva January 2011 - May 2017

	Incidents in the Home
Estimated population of news reports in Factiva on self-defense with a firearm in the home	4,841
Random selection of news reports	200
Average Number of Shots Fired	2.34
Median Number of Shots Fired	2.03
Number of Incidents with No Shots Fired	23
Percent of Incidents with No Shots Fired	11.6%
Number of Incidents with <=5 Shots Fired	195
Percent of Incidents with <= 5 Shots Fired	97.3%
Number of Incidents with >10 Shots Fired	0
Percent of Incidents with >10 Shots Fired	0.0%
Number of Incidents with >17 Shots Fired	0
Percent of Incidents with >17 Shots Fired	0.0%

Notes and Sources:

Based on news stories describing defensive gun use in a random sample of Factiva stories 2011 to May 2017 using search string (gun* or shot* or shoot* or fire* or arm*) and ("broke in" or "break in" or "broken into" or "breaking into" or burglar* or intrud* or inva*) and (home* or apartment or "property") with region set to United States and excluding duplicate stories classified as "similar." Calculated using weights reflecting the probability that a news story on a particular incident would be selected at random from the total population of news stories on incidents of self-defense with a firearm in the home.

18. In sum, an analysis of incidents in the NRA Armed Citizen database, as well as our own study of a random sample from approximately 4,800 news stories describing incidents of self-defense with a firearm, indicates that it is extremely rare for a person, when using a firearm in self-defense, to fire more than 10 or 17 rounds.

2. Use of assault rifles in self-defense according to FBI active shooter incidents

- 19. I have been asked to analyze the "Active Shooter Incidents" reports published by the Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI").²⁴ In particular, I have been asked to analyze the use of assault rifles by private citizens in active shooter incidents. According to this analysis, citizens rarely use a firearm, and even less frequently use an assault rifle, to defend themselves during active shooter incidents.
- 20. The FBI defines an active shooter as "one or more individuals actively engaged in killing or attempting to kill people in a populated area" and notes that "the active aspect of the definition inherently implies the ongoing nature of an incident, and thus the potential for the response to affect the outcome, whereas a mass killing is defined as three or more killings in a single incident."²⁵ The FBI uses its own "holdings and repositories," as well as "official law enforcement reports" and "open-sourced data" to identify active shooter incidents that meet their criteria.²⁶ For each incident, the FBI reports the date, location, age and sex of the shooter, and number of injuries and fatalities. The FBI also identifies incidents involving intervention by

This analysis is similar to an analysis conducted by Columbia University Professor Louis Klarevas and yields similar results. See, for example, Declaration of Louis Klarevas in *National Association for Gun Rights et al.*, v. City of Highland Park, Illinois, filed on January 19, 2023, ¶¶ 23-26.

²⁵ "Active Shooter Incidents in the United States in 2021," *FBI*, May 2022, p. 2.

[&]quot;Active Shooter Incidents in the United States in 2021," *FBI*, May 2022, p. 2. The FBI excludes gun-related incidents that are the result of "self-defense, gang violence, drug violence, contained residential or domestic disputes, controlled hostage situations, crossfire as a byproduct of another ongoing criminal act, or an action that appeared to not have put other people in peril." The FBI notes that the "there is no mandated database collection or central intake point for reporting active shooter incidents, which exists for other crimes."

civilians, including instances in which armed civilians used firearms to defend themselves or engage with the shooter.²⁷

21. According to the FBI, over the 22-year period from 2000 to 2021, there were 434 active shooter incidents. In 15, or 3.5%, of these incidents armed civilians defended themselves or engaged with the shooter.²⁸ Of these 15 incidents, 12, or 80%, involved armed civilians using a handgun as defense and only 1, or 6.6%, involved using an assault rifle.²⁹ Of the remaining 2 incidents, one involved a bolt-action rifle and the other a shotgun. Overall, only 1, or 0.2%, of the 434 active shooter incidents identified by the FBI involved civilians defending themselves with an assault rifle.

3. Percent of incidents in which rifles were used in self-defense according to Heritage Defensive Gun Uses Database

22. I have been asked to analyze The Heritage Foundation's "Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S." database ("Heritage DGU Database"), a database of defensive gun incidents that was first published after my research on the number of rounds used by individuals in self-defense was performed.³⁰ In particular, I have been asked to analyze the percent of incidents in which rifles were used in self-defense according to the Heritage DGU Database. The analysis of the Heritage DGU Database indicates that it is rare for a rifle to be used in self-defense.

See, for example, "Active Shooter Incidents in the United States in 2021," *FBI*, May 2022, pp. 2, 11-12.

Excludes incidents where the armed private citizens were security guards.

The firearm type used by the armed private citizen was determined by descriptions in the FBI's Active Shooter reports, as well as news articles from Factiva and Google.

[&]quot;Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S.," *The Heritage Foundation*, as of October 7, 2022, https://datavisualizations.heritage.org/firearms/defensive-gun-uses-in-the-us.

- 23. The Heritage Foundation is a think tank focused on "formulat[ing] and promot[ing] public policies based on the principles of free enterprise, limited government, individual freedom, traditional American values, and a strong national defense." According to The Heritage Foundation, "[t]he right of the people to keep and bear arms is a fundamental part of American liberty, serving as an important individual defense against crime and a collective defense against tyranny."
- 24. In April 2020, The Heritage Foundation began publishing and periodically updating a database of news stories describing incidents in the U.S. in which individuals purportedly defended themselves using firearms.³³ The Heritage Foundation notes that its database is not comprehensive but meant to "highlight" stories of successful self-defense.^{34,35} As a result, one would expect the Heritage DGU Database to be more likely to identify successful uses of rifles in self-defense than a randomized review of news stories.
- 25. As of October 7, 2022, the Heritage DGU Database included 2,714 incidents from January 1, 2019 through October 6, 2022.³⁶ The Heritage DGU Database codes the following information for each incident:³⁷

[&]quot;About Heritage," *The Heritage Foundation*, https://www.heritage.org/about-heritage/mission.

³² "Firearms," *The Heritage Foundation*, https://www.heritage.org/firearms.

[&]quot;Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S.," *The Heritage Foundation*.

[&]quot;Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S.," *The Heritage Foundation*.

Note that a review of the news stories cited in the database indicates that a number of the incidents may not involve individuals defending themselves. For example, in one incident ("Two Burglary Suspects Caught By Victim's Brother And Friend, Held At Gunpoint For Police," *5NewsOnline*, February 11, 2019), a homeowner's brother and friend appear to have found and apprehended burglars on the roadside.

[&]quot;Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S.," *The Heritage Foundation*.

[&]quot;Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S.," *The Heritage Foundation*.

- Date of the incident;
- Website link to the news story;
- Location (city and state);
- Context (e.g., domestic violence, home invasion, robbery, etc.);
- Whether the defender had a concealed-carry permit;
- Whether there were multiple assailants;
- Whether shots were fired; and
- Firearm type (handgun, shotgun, rifle, pellet rifle, long gun, or unknown).³⁸
- 26. I performed an analysis of all 2,714 incidents in the Heritage DGU Database as of

October 7, 2022 to determine what number and percent of the incidents involved a rifle. I found there were 51 incidents indicating a rifle was involved. These 51 incidents represent 2% of all incidents in the database and 4% of incidents with a known gun type.³⁹ The table below shows the breakdown of incidents by coded firearm type for the 2,714 incidents.

A review of the data and linked news stories from the Heritage DGU Database indicates that the firearm type corresponds to the firearm associated with the defender.

This analysis is based on The Heritage Foundation's coding of these incidents. We have not independently verified the coding of these incidents.

The Heritage Foundation	
Defensive Cun Uses Database	

Firearm Type	Incidents	% of Total	% of Known
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Handgun	1,113	41%	90%
Shotgun	78	3%	6%
Rifle	51	2%	4%
Long Gun	1	0%	0%
Pellet Rifle	1	0%	0%
Unknown	1,473	54%	

Total known: 1,241
Total: 2,714

Source:

"Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S.," *The Heritage Foundation*. Data as of October 7, 2022.

27. I conducted the same analysis of the Heritage DGU Database excluding incidents that occurred in states that have restrictions on assault weapons. In particular, I excluded incidents in California, Connecticut, Hawaii, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Jersey, and New York, as well as Washington D.C.⁴⁰ In states without assault weapons restrictions, the Heritage DGU Database has 48 incidents indicating a rifle was involved. These 48 incidents represent 2%

¹ Note that three incidents are coded as having more than one firearm type and thus the sum by firearm type is larger than the total number of incidents.

See, "Assault Weapons," *Giffords Law Center*, https://giffords.org/lawcenter/gun-laws/policy-areas/hardware-ammunition/assault-weapons/. Delaware is not excluded since restrictions in Delaware were enacted in June 2022. See, "Governor Carney Signs Package of Gun Safety Legislation," *Delaware.gov*, June 30, 2022, https://news.delaware.gov/2022/06/30/governor-carney-signs-package-of-gun-safety-legislation/.

of incidents in these states and 4% of incidents with a known gun type in these states. The table below shows the breakdown of incidents by coded firearm type for states that do not restrict assault weapons.

The Heritage Foundation Defensive Gun Uses Database States Without Assault Weapon Restrictions

Firearm Type	Incidents ¹	% of Total	% of Known
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Handgun	1,033	41%	90%
Shotgun	63	3%	6%
Rifle	48	2%	4%
Long Gun	0	0%	0%
Pellet Rifle	1	0%	0%
Unknown	1,357	54%	

Total known: 1,142 Total: 2,499

Source:

"Defensive Gun Uses in the U.S.," *The Heritage Foundation*. Data as of October 7, 2022. Excludes the following states with assault weapon restrictions: California, Connecticut, Hawaii, Maryland, Massachusetts, New Jersey, and New York as well as Washington D.C. Classification from Giffords Law Center. Incidents in Delaware not excluded as restrictions were enacted in June 2022.

¹ Note that three incidents are coded as having more than one firearm type and thus the sum of the individual firearm types is larger than the total number of incidents.

B. Public Mass Shootings

28. We analyzed the use of assault weapons and large-capacity magazines⁴¹ in public mass shootings using four sources for identifying public mass shootings: Mother Jones,⁴² the Citizens Crime Commission of New York City,⁴³ the Washington Post⁴⁴ and the Violence Project.^{45, 46} The analysis focused on public mass shootings because it is my understanding that

My analysis is based on the definitions of assault weapons ("Assault Weapons") and large capacity magazines ("Large-Capacity Magazines") provided by California law, specifically: California Penal Code sections 30510, 30515 and 32310, and California Code of Regulations, title 11, section 5499. California law defines Large Capacity Magazines as magazines capable of holding more than ten rounds and Assault Weapons based on either their "make and model" or on certain "features." See, for example, California Department of Justice: "What is considered an assault weapon under California law?" and "What are AK and AR-15 series weapons?" https://oag.ca.gov/firearms/regagunfaqs, accessed October 25, 2018.

[&]quot;US Mass Shootings, 1982-2022: Data From Mother Jones' Investigation," Mother Jones, updated November 23, 2022, http://www.motherjones.com/politics/2012/12/mass-shootings-mother-jones-full-data.

[&]quot;Mayhem Multiplied: Mass Shooters and Assault Weapons," Citizens Crime Commission of New York City, February 2018 update. Additional details on the mass shootings were obtained from an earlier source by the Citizens Crime Commission. "Mass Shooting Incidents in America (1984-2012)," Citizens Crime Commission of New York City, http://www.nycrimecommission.org/mass-shooting-incidents-america.php, accessed June 1, 2017.

[&]quot;The terrible numbers that grow with each mass shooting," The Washington Post, updated May 12, 2021.

[&]quot;Mass Shooter Database," The Violence Project, https://www.theviolenceproject.org/mass-shooter-database/, updated May 14, 2022.

When I began research in 2013 on mass shootings, I found Mother Jones and Citizens Crime Commission to maintain the most comprehensive lists of relevant mass shootings. More recently, two additional sources, the Washington Post and The Violence Project, have compiled lists of public mass shootings. The Violence Project began work on its mass shootings database in September 2017 and its database first went online in November 2019, while the Washington Post first published its mass shootings database in February 2018. There is substantial overlap between the mass shootings in all four sources. For example, the Mother Jones data contains 93% of the mass shootings in the Citizens Crime Commission data for the years covered by both data sources, 1984 to 2016, while the Washington Post contains 94% of the mass shootings in The Violence Project data for the years covered by both data sources, 1966 to 2019.

the state of Delaware is concerned about public mass shootings and enacted the challenged law, in part, to address the problem of public mass shootings.⁴⁷

29. The type of incident considered a mass shooting is generally consistent across the four sources. In particular, all four sources consider an event a mass shooting if four or more people were killed in a public place in one incident and exclude incidents involving other criminal activity such as a robbery.⁴⁸

Mother Jones describes a mass shooting as "indiscriminate rampages in public places resulting in four or more victims killed by the attacker," excluding "shootings stemming from more conventionally motivated crimes such as armed robbery or gang violence." Although in January 2013 Mother Jones changed its definition of mass shooting to include instances when three or more people were killed, for this declaration we only analyzed mass shootings where four or more were killed to be consistent with the definition of the other three sources. "A Guide to Mass Shootings in America," Mother Jones, updated November 23, 2022, http://www.motherjones.com/politics/2012/07/mass-shootings-map. See also, "What Exactly is a Mass Shooting," Mother Jones, August 24, 2012. http://www.motherjones.com/mojo/2012/08/what-is-a-mass-shooting.

The Washington Post describes a mass shooting as "four or more people were killed, usually by a lone shooter" excluding "shootings tied to robberies that went awry" and "domestic shootings that took place exclusively in private homes." The Washington Post notes that its sources include "Grant Duwe, author of 'Mass Murder in the United States: A History,' Mother Jones and Washington Post research," as well as "Violence Policy Center, Gun Violence Archive; FBI 2014 Study of Active Shooter Incidents; published reports." "The terrible numbers that grow with each mass shooting," The Washington Post, updated May 12, 2021, https://www.washingtonpost.com/graphics/2018/national/mass-shootings-in-america/.

The Violence Project indicates that it uses the Congressional Research Service definition of a mass shooting: - "a multiple homicide incident in which four or more victims are murdered with firearms—not including the offender(s)—within one event, and at least some of the murders occurred in a public location or locations in close geographical proximity (e.g., a workplace, school, restaurant, or other public settings), and the murders are not attributable to any other

See Delaware's HB 450, which discusses numerous public mass shootings and notes that "assault-style weapons have been used disproportionately to their ownership in mass shootings."

Citizen Crime Commission describes a mass shooting as "four or more victims killed" in "a public place" that were "unrelated to another crime (e.g., robbery, domestic violence)." Citizen Crime notes that its sources include "news reports and lists created by government entities and advocacy groups." "Mayhem Multiplied: Mass Shooters and Assault Weapons," Citizens Crime Commission of New York City, February 2018 update.

30. Each of the four sources contains data on mass shootings covering different time periods. The Mother Jones data covers 112 mass shootings from 1982 to October 13, 2022,⁴⁹ the Citizens Crime Commission data covers 80 mass shootings from 1984 to February 2018,⁵⁰ the Washington Post data covers 185 mass shootings from 1966 to May 12, 2021,⁵¹ and The Violence Project data covers 182 mass shootings from 1966 to May 14, 2022.^{52, 53}

underlying criminal activity or commonplace circumstance (armed robbery, criminal competition, insurance fraud, argument, or romantic triangle)." The Violence Project notes that its sources include "Primary Sources: Written journals / manifestos / suicide notes etc., Social media and blog posts, Audio and video recordings, Interview transcripts, Personal correspondence with perpetrators" as well as "Secondary Sources (all publicly available): Media (television, newspapers, magazines), Documentary films, Biographies, Monographs, Peerreviewed journal articles, Court transcripts, Law Enforcement records, Medical records, School records, Autopsy reports." "Mass Shooter Database," The Violence Project, https://www.theviolenceproject.org/methodology/, accessed January 17, 2020.

[&]quot;A Guide to Mass Shootings in America," Mother Jones, updated November 23, 2022, http://www.motherjones.com/politics/2012/07/mass-shootings-map. Excludes mass shootings where only three people were killed. Note this analysis of the Mother Jones data may not match other analyses because Mother Jones periodically updates its historical data.

⁵⁰ "Mayhem Multiplied: Mass Shooters and Assault Weapons," *Citizens Crime Commission of New York City*, February 2018 update.

[&]quot;The terrible numbers that grow with each mass shooting," *The Washington Post*, updated May 12, 2021, https://www.washingtonpost.com/graphics/2018/national/mass-shootings-in-america/.

^{52 &}quot;Mass Shooter Database" The Violence Project https://www.theviolenceproject.org/p

[&]quot;Mass Shooter Database," *The Violence Project* https://www.theviolenceproject.org/mass-shooter-database/, updated May 14, 2022.

Note that I have updated this mass shooting analysis to include more recent incidents, as well as more recently available details. In my 2017 declaration in *Virginia Duncan et al. v. California Attorney General*, I included data on mass shootings through April 2017. In my 2018 declaration in *Rupp v. California Attorney General*, I updated the analysis to include data on mass shootings through September 2018. The analyses in both of these declarations included mass shootings only from Mother Jones and the Citizen Crime Commission. In my 2020 declaration in *James Miller et al. v. California Attorney General*, I updated the analysis to include mass shootings through December 2019 and added mass shootings from two more sources, the Washington Post and the Violence Project. The number of mass shootings, as well as some details about the shootings, are not identical across these declarations for three main reasons. First, I have updated the analysis to include more recent incidents as well as more recently available details. Second, starting in 2020, I added two more sources (Washington Post

- Washington Post and The Violence Project, include additional mass shootings that were not covered by either Mother Jones or Citizens Crime Commission. In general, we found that these additional mass shootings were less covered by the media and involved fewer fatalities and/or injuries than the ones previously identified by Mother Jones or Citizens Crime Commission. For example, using the mass shooting data for the period 1982 through 2019, we found that the median number of news stories for a mass shooting included in Mother Jones and/or Citizen Crime Commission was 317, while the median for the additional mass shootings identified in the Washington Post and/or The Violence Project was 28.⁵⁴ In addition, using the mass shooting data through 2019, we found an average of 21 fatalities or injuries for a mass shooting included in Mother Jones and/or Citizen Crime Commission, while only 6 fatalities or injuries for the additional mass shootings identified in the Washington Post and/or The Violence Project.
- 32. We combined the data from the four sources for the period 1982 through October 2022, and searched news stories on each mass shooting to obtain additional details on the types of weapons used as well as data on shots fired where available. We compared the details on the weapons used in each shooting to the list of prohibited firearms and features specified in California law to identify, based on this publicly available information, which mass shootings involved the use of Assault Weapons. In addition, we identified, based on this publicly available

and Violence Project), which include additional mass shootings and details not included in the initial sources. Third, even though Mother Jones included instances when three or more people were killed, for my declarations and reports starting in 2020, I only included mass shootings where four or more were killed to be consistent with the definition of the other three sources.

The search was conducted over all published news stories on Factiva. The search was based on the shooter's name and the location of the incident over the period from one week prior to three months following each mass shooting.

Exhibit B for a summary of the combined data, and Exhibit C for a summary of the weapons used in each public mass shooting based on Mother Jones, Citizens Crime Commission, the Washington Post, the Violence Project, and news reports.⁵⁵

1. Use of Assault Weapons in public mass shootings

- 33. Based on the 179 mass shootings through October 2022, we found that Assault Weapons are often used in public mass shootings. Whether an Assault Weapon was used in a mass shooting can be determined in 153 out of the 179 incidents (85%) considered in this analysis. Out of these 153 mass shootings, 36 (or 24%) involved Assault Weapons. Even assuming the mass shootings where it is not known whether an Assault Weapon was used *all* did not involve an Assault Weapon, 36 out of 179 mass shootings, or 20%, involved Assault Weapons.
- 34. Based on our analysis, casualties were higher in the mass shootings that involved Assault Weapons than in other mass shootings. In particular, we found an average number of fatalities or injuries of 36 per mass shooting with an Assault Weapon versus 10 for those without. Focusing on just fatalities, we found an average number of fatalities of 12 per mass shooting with an Assault Weapon versus 6 for those without. (See table below.)

2. Use of Large-Capacity Magazines in public mass shootings

35. Based on the 179 mass shootings through October 2022, we found that Large-Capacity Magazines (those with a capacity to hold more than 10 rounds of ammunition) are often used in public mass shootings. Magazine capacity is known in 115 out of the 179 mass

Note that the Citizens Crime Commission data was last updated in February 2018 and the Washington Post was last updated in May 2021.

shootings (or 64%) considered in this analysis. Out of the 115 mass shootings with known magazine capacity, 73 (or 63%) involved Large-Capacity Magazines. Even assuming the mass shootings with unknown magazine capacity *all* did not involve Large-Capacity Magazines, 73 out of 179 mass shootings or 41% of mass shootings involved Large-Capacity Magazines. (See table below.)

- 36. Based on our analysis, casualties were higher in the mass shootings that involved weapons with Large-Capacity Magazines than in other mass shootings. In particular, we found an average number of fatalities or injuries of 25 per mass shooting with a Large-Capacity Magazines versus 9 for those without. Focusing on just fatalities, we found an average number of fatalities of 10 per mass shooting with a Large-Capacity Magazines versus 6 for those without. (See table below.)
- 37. In addition, we found that casualties were higher in the mass shootings that involved both Assault Weapons *and* Large-Capacity Magazines. In particular, we found an average number of fatalities or injuries of 40 per mass shooting with both an Assault Weapon and a Large-Capacity Magazine versus 8 for those without either. Focusing on just fatalities, we found an average number of fatalities of 13 per mass shooting with both an Assault Weapon and a Large-Capacity Magazine versus 6 for those without either. (See table below.)

Numbers of Fatalities and Injuries in Public Mass Shootings 1982 - October 2022

# of	Average # of		
Incidents	Fatalities	Injuries	Total
36	12	24	36
117	6	4	10
26	5	3	9
73	10	16	25
42	6	3	9
64	5	3	7
31	13	27	40
36	8	7	15
41	6	3	8
71	5	3	8
	36 117 26 73 42 64 31 36 41	Incidents Fatalities 36 12 117 6 26 5 73 10 42 6 64 5 31 13 36 8 41 6	Incidents Fatalities Injuries 36 12 24 117 6 4 26 5 3 73 10 16 42 6 3 64 5 3 31 13 27 36 8 7 41 6 3

Notes and Sources:

Casualty figures exclude the shooter. Assault Weapon and large-capacity magazine classification and casualties updated based on review of stories from Factiva/Google searches.

38. Our results are consistent with those of other studies that have analyzed mass shootings. Note that although the other studies are based on alternate sets of mass shootings, including covering different years and defining mass shootings somewhat differently, the results are similar in finding that fatalities and injuries are larger in mass shootings in which large capacity magazines and assault weapons are involved. A 2019 academic article published in the American Journal of Public Health by Klarevas et al. found that "[a]ttacks involving LCMs

¹ Shootings involving large-capacity magazine and no Assault Weapon.

² Shootings involving neither a large-capacity magazine nor Assault Weapon.

³ Shootings where it is either unknown whether a large-capacity magazine was involved or unknown whether an Assault Weapon was involved.

resulted in a 62% higher mean average death toll."⁵⁶ This study found an average number of fatalities of 11.8 per mass shooting with a large-capacity magazine versus 7.3 for those without. The results in this study were based on 69 mass shootings between 1990 and 2017.⁵⁷ An analysis of the mass shootings detailed in a 2016 article by Gary Kleck yielded similar results (21 average fatalities or injuries in mass shootings involving large-capacity magazines versus 8 for those without).⁵⁸ The Kleck study covered 88 mass shooting incidents between 1994 and 2013.⁵⁹ In a 2018 study, Koper et al. found that mass shootings involving assault weapons and large-capacity magazines resulted in an average of 13.7 victims versus 5.2 for other cases.⁶⁰ The Koper et al. study covered 145 mass shootings between 2009 and 2015.⁶¹ The table below summarizes their results.

Louis Klarevas, Andrew Conner, and David Hemenway, "The Effect of Large-Capacity Magazine Bans on High-Fatality Mass Shootings, 1990–2017," *American Journal of Public Health* (2019).

The Klarevas et al. study defines mass shootings as "intentional crimes of gun violence with 6 or more victims shot to death, not including the perpetrators" and, unlike my analysis, does not exclude incidents in private places or incidents involving other criminal activity such as robbery.

Kleck, Gary, "Large-Capacity Magazines and the Casualty Counts in Mass Shootings: The Plausibility of Linkages," 17 *Justice Research and Policy* 28 (2016).

The Kleck study defines a mass shooting as "one in which more than six people were shot, either fatally or nonfatally, in a single incident."

Koper et al., "Criminal Use of Assault Weapons and High-Capacity Semiautomatic Firearms: an Updated Examination of Local and National Sources," *Journal of Urban Health* (2018).

The Koper et al. study defined mass shooting as "incidents in which four or more people were murdered with a firearm, not including the death of the shooter if applicable and irrespective of the number of additional victims shot but not killed."

Comparison of Studies on the Use of Large-Capacity Magazines in Mass Shootings

Criteria		Time	# of	Avg. # of Fatalities + Injuries / Fatalities		
Source # Victims (2)	Other Criteria (3)	Period (4)	Incidents (5)	With LCM (6)	(7)	
						Allen (2020) ¹
Kleck et al. (2016) ³	at least 6 shot	Excludes "spree shootings" and includes shootings in both "public" and "private" places	1994-2013	88	21 / n/a	8 / n/a
Klarevas et al. (2019) ⁴	at least 6 killed ²	Includes "intentional crimes of gun violence"	1990-2017	69	n/a / 12	n/a / 7
Koper et al. (2018) ⁵	at least 4 <u>killed</u> 2	Includes shootings in both public and private places	2009-2015	145	14 / n/a	5 / n/a

Notes and Sources:

3. Number of rounds fired in public mass shootings with Assault Weapons or Large-Capacity Magazines

- 39. The data on public mass shootings indicates that it is common for offenders to fire more than seventeen rounds when using an Assault Weapon. Of the 36 mass shootings we analyzed through October 2022 that are known to have involved an Assault Weapon, there are 24 in which the number of shots fired is known. Shooters fired more than seventeen rounds in 22 out of the 24 incidents (or 92%), and the average number of shots fired in those incidents was 161.
- 40. In addition, the data indicates that it is common for offenders to fire more than seventeen rounds when using a gun with a Large-Capacity Magazine in mass shootings. Of the 73 mass shootings that are known to have involved a Large-Capacity Magazine, there are 49 in

¹ Declaration of Lucy P. Allen in Support of Defendants' Opposition to Motion for Preliminary Injunction in *James Miller et al. v. Xavier Becerra et al.*, dated January 23, 2020.

² Excluding shooter.

³ Kleck, Gary, "Large-Capacity Magazines and the Casualty Counts in Mass Shootings: The Plausibility of Linkages," 17 Justice Research and Policy 28 (2016).

⁴ Klarevas et al., "The Effect of Large-Capacity Magazine Bans on High-Fatality Mass Shootings 1990-2017," American Journal of Public Health (2019).

⁵ Koper et al., "Criminal Use of Assault Weapons and High-Capacity Semiautomatic Firearms: an Updated Examination of Local and National Sources," Journal of Urban Health (2018). Note that the Koper et al study includes shootings involving both LCM and assault weapons.

which the number of shots fired is known. Shooters fired more than seventeen rounds in 41 of the 49 incidents (or 84%), and the average number of shots fired in those incidents was 116.

4. Percent of mass shooters' guns legally obtained

41. The data on public mass shootings indicates that the majority of guns used in these mass shootings were obtained legally.⁶² Of the 179 mass shootings analyzed through October 2022, there are 112 where it can be determined whether the gun was obtained legally. According to the data, shooters in 79% of mass shootings obtained their guns legally (89 of the 112 mass shootings) and 80% of the guns used in these 112 mass shootings were obtained legally (202 of the 252 guns). (Note that even if one assumes that *all* of the mass shootings where it is not known were assumed to be illegally obtained, then one would find 50% of the mass shootings and 62% of the guns were obtained legally.)

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on January 30, 2023

Lucy P. Allen

The determination of whether guns were obtained legally is based on Mother Jones and Washington Post reporting.

Exhibit A



Exhibit A

Lucy P. AllenManaging Director

NERA Economic Consulting 1166 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10036 Tel: +1 212 345 5913 Fax: +1 212 345 4650 lucy.allen@nera.com www.nera.com

LUCY P. ALLEN MANAGING DIRECTOR

Education

YALE UNIVERSITY

M.Phil., Economics, 1990 M.A., Economics, 1989 M.B.A., 1986

STANFORD UNIVERSITY

A.B., Human Biology, 1981

Professional Experience

1994-Present National Economic Research Associates, Inc.

Managing Director. Responsible for economic analysis in the areas of

securities, finance and environmental and tort economics.

Senior Vice President (2003-2016).

<u>Vice President (1999-2003)</u>. Senior Consultant (1994-1999).

1992-1993 Council of Economic Advisers, Executive Office of the President

<u>Staff Economist</u>. Provided economic analysis on regulatory and health care issues to Council Members and interagency groups. Shared responsibility for regulation and health care chapters of the *Economic Report of the President*, 1993. Working Group member of the President's National

Health Care Reform Task Force.

1986-1988 Ayers, Whitmore & Company (General Management Consultants)

1983-1984 <u>Senior Associate</u>. Formulated marketing, organization, and overall

business strategies including:

Plan to improve profitability of chemical process equipment manufacturer. Merger analysis and integration plan of two equipment manufacturers.

Evaluation of Korean competition to a U.S. manufacturer.

Diagnostic survey for auto parts manufacturer on growth obstacles.

Lucy P. Allen

Marketing plan to increase international market share for major accounting firm.

Summer 1985 WNET/Channel Thirteen, Strategic Planning Department

Associate. Assisted in development of company's first long-term strategic plan. Analyzed relationship between programming and viewer support.

1981-1983 Arthur Andersen & Company

<u>Consultant</u>. Designed, programmed and installed management information systems. Participated in redesign/conversion of New York State's accounting system. Developed municipal bond fund management system, successfully marketed to brokers. Participated in President's Private Sector Survey on Cost Control (Grace Commission). Designed customized tracking and accounting system for shipping company.

Teaching

1989- 1992 **Teaching Fellow, Yale University**

Honors Econometrics
Intermediate Microeconomics
Competitive Strategies
Probability and Game Theory
Marketing Strategy

Marketing Strategy Economic Analysis

Publications

"Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2022 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2022.

"Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2021 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2021.

"The Short-Term Effect of Goodwill Impairment Announcements on Companies' Stock Prices" (co-author), *International Journal of Business, Accounting and Finance*, Volume 14, Number 2, Fall 2020.

"Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2020 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2020.

"Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2019 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2019.

"Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2018 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2018.

- "Trends and the Economic Effect of Asbestos Bans and Decline in Asbestos Consumption and Production Worldwide," (co-author), *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 15(3), 531, 2018.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2017 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2017.
- "Asbestos: Economic Assessment of Bans and Declining Production and Consumption," World Health Organization, 2017.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2016 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2016.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2015 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2015.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2014 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2014.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2013 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2013.
- "Asbestos Payments per Resolved Claim Increased 75% in the Past Year Is This Increase as Dramatic as it Sounds? Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2012 Update," (co-author), NERA Report, 2012.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2011 Update," (co-author), NERA White Paper, 2011.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation: 2010 Update," (co-author), NERA White Paper, 2010.
- "Settlement Trends and Tactics" presented at Securities Litigation During the Financial Crisis: Current Development & Strategies, hosted by the New York City Bar, New York, New York, 2009.
- "Snapshot of Recent Trends in Asbestos Litigation," (co-author), NERA White Paper, 2009.
- "China Product Recalls: What's at Stake and What's Next," (co-author), NERA Working Paper, 2008.
- "Forecasting Product Liability by Understanding the Driving Forces," (co-author), The International Comparative Legal Guide to Product Liability, 2006.
- "Securities Litigation Reform: Problems and Progress," Viewpoint, November 1999, Issue No. 2 (co-authored).

Lucy P. Allen

"Trends in Securities Litigation and the Impact of the PSLRA," Class Actions & Derivative Suits, American Bar Association Litigation Section, Vol. 9, No. 3, Summer 1999 (co-authored).

"Random Taxes, Random Claims," Regulation, Winter 1997, pp. 6-7 (co-authored).

Depositions & Testimony (4 years)

Supplemental Declaration before the United States District Court, Central District of California, Southern Division, in *Steven Rupp et al. v. California Attorney General et al.*, 2023.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court for the District of Harris County, Texas in *Boxer Property Management Corp. et al. v. Illinois Union Ins. Co. et al.*, 2022.

Declaration before the United States District Court, Southern District of California, in *Virginia Duncan, et al. v. Rob Bonta, et al.*, 2022.

Declaration before the United States District Court, Eastern District of Washington, in *Michael Scott Brumback, et al. v. Robert W. Ferguson, et al.*, 2022.

Trial Testimony before the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York, in MUFG Union Bank, N.A. (f/k/a Union Bank, N.A.) v. Axos Bank (f/k/a Bank of Internet USA), et al., 2022.

Supplemental Declaration before the United States District Court, Southern District of California, in *James Miller et al. v. California Attorney General et al.*, 2022.

Declaration before the United States District Court, Northern District of Texas, Dallas Division, in *Samir Ali Cherif Benouis v. Match Group, Inc., et al.,* 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia, in *Plymouth County Retirement System, et al. v. Evolent Health, Inc., et al.*, 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court for the Northern District of Georgia, in *Public Employees' Retirement System of Mississippi v. Mohawk Industries, Inc., et al.*, 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, in SEC v. AT&T, Inc. et al., 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the Superior Court of New Jersey, Hudson County, in *Oklahoma Firefighters Pension and Retirement System vs. Newell Brands Inc.*, et al., 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court for the District of Pennsylvania, in *Allegheny County Employees, et al. v. Energy Transfer LP., et al.,* 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, District of Tennessee, in St. Clair County Employees' Retirement System v. Smith & Acadia Healthcare Company, Inc., et al., 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, District of Colorado, in *Cipriano Correa, et al. v. Liberty Oilfield Services Inc., et al.*, 2022.

Deposition Testimony before the Superior Court of New Jersey, Hudson County, in *Oklahoma Firefighters Pension and Retirement System vs. Newell Brands Inc.*, et al., 2021.

Deposition Testimony before the Superior Court of New Jersey, Middlesex County, in *Dana Transport, Inc. et al., vs. PNC Bank et al.*, 2021.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, Western District of North Carolina, in *Cheyenne Jones and Sara J. Gast v. Coca-Cola Consolidated Inc.*, et al., 2021.

Testimony and Deposition Testimony before the Court of Chancery of the State of Delaware in *Bardy Diagnostics Inc. v. Hill-Rom, Inc. et al.*, 2021.

Deposition Testimony before the United States Bankruptcy Court, Southern District of Texas, Houston Division, in *Natixis Funding Corporation v. Genon Mid-Atlantic, LLC*, 2021.

Testimony and Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, Southern District of California, in *James Miller et al. v. Xavier Becerra et al.*, 2021.

Deposition Testimony before the Court of Chancery of the State of Delaware in *Arkansas Teacher Retirement System v. Alon USA Energy, Inc., et al.*, 2021.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, Western District of Oklahoma, in *Kathleen J. Myers v. Administrative Committee, Seventy Seven Energy, Inc. Retirement & Savings Plan, et al.*, 2020.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, in *Nikki Bollinger Grae v. Corrections Corporation of America, et al.*, 2020.

Lucy P. Allen

Deposition Testimony before the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York, in *MUFG Union Bank, N.A. (f/k/a Union Bank, N.A.) v. Axos Bank (f/k/a Bank of Internet USA), et al.*, 2020.

Declaration before the United States District Court for the Northern District of Georgia, in Sunil Amin et al. v. Mercedes-Benz USA, LLC and Daimler AG, 2020.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, Western District of Washington at Seattle, in *In re Zillow Group, Inc. Securities Litigation*, 2020.

Declaration before the United States District Court for the Southern District of California in *James Miller et al. v. Xavier Becerra et al.*, 2020.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, in *Zwick Partners LP and Aparna Rao v. Quorum Health Corporation*, 2019.

Testimony and Declaration before the United States District Court, Southern District of Iowa, in *Mahaska Bottling Company, Inc., et al. v. PepsiCo, Inc. and Bottling Group, LLC*, 2019.

Declaration before the United States District Court Western District of Oklahoma in *In re: Samsung Top-Load Washing Machine Marketing, Sales Practices and Products Liability Litigation*, 2019.

Testimony before the United States District Court, Southern District of New York, in *Chicago Bridge & Iron Company N.V. Securities Litigation*, 2019.

Deposition Testimony before the United States District Court, Middle District of Florida, in *Jacob J. Beckel v. Fagron Holdings USA, LLC et al.*, 2019.

Exhibit B

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 9 of 37 PageID #: 995 $\mathbf{Exhibit} \ \mathbf{B}$

	Case	Location	Date	Source	Large Capacity Mag.? ^a	Assault Weapon? ^b	' Fatalities ^c	Injuries ^c	Total Fatalities & Injuries ^c	Shots Fired ^d	Gun(s) Obtained Legally? ^e	Offender(s)' Number of Guns
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)
1.	Raleigh spree shooting	Hedingham, NC	10/13/22	MJ	-	_	5	2	7	-	_	2
	Highland Park July 4 parade shooting	Highland Park, IL	7/4/22	MJ	Yes	-	7	48	55	83 ba	Yes	1
	Tulsa medical center shooting	Tulsa, OK	6/1/22	MJ	-	-	4	9 bb	13 bb	37 bc	Yes	2
4.	Robb Elementary School massacre	Uvalde, TX	5/24/22	MJ	Yes	Yes	21	17	38	164 ^{bd}	Yes	1 be
5.	Buffalo supermarket massacre	Buffalo, NY	5/14/22	MJ/VP	Yes	Yes	10	3	13	60 bf	Yes	1
	Sacramento County church shooting	Sacramento, CA	2/28/22	MJ	Yes	-	4	0	4	-	Yes bg	1
7.	Oxford High School shooting	Oxford, MI	11/30/21	MJ/VP	Yes	No	4	7	11	30 bh	Yes bi	1
8.	San Jose VTA shooting	San Jose, CA	5/26/21	MJ/VP	Yes	No	9	0	9	39 bj	Yes bk	3
9.	Canterbury Mobile Home Park shooting	Colorado Springs, CO	5/9/21	WaPo	Yes	-	6	0	6	17 ^{bl}	-	1
10.	FedEx warehouse shooting	Indianapolis, IN	4/15/21	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	8	7	15	-	Yes	2 bm
11.	Orange office complex shooting	Orange, CA	3/31/21	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	-	4	1	5	-	-	1
12.	Essex Royal Farms shooting	Baltimore County, MD	3/28/21	WaPo	-	-	4	1	5	-	Yes ^{bn}	1
13.	King Soopers supermarket shooting	Boulder, CO	3/22/21	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	10	0	10	-	Yes	2
14.	Atlanta massage parlor shootings	Atlanta, GA	3/16/21	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	-	8	1	9	-	Yes bo	1
15.	Hyde Park shooting	Chicago, IL	1/9/21	WaPo	-	-	5	2	7	-	-	1
16.	Englewood block party shooting	Chicago, IL	7/4/20	WaPo	-	-	4	4	8	-	-	-
17.	Springfield convenience store shooting	Springfield, MO	3/15/20	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	-	4	2	6	-	Yes bp	2
18.	Molson Coors shooting	Milwaukee, WI	2/26/20	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	-	5	0	5	12 ^{bq}	-	2 br
19.	Jersey City Kosher Supermarket	Jersey City, NJ	12/10/19	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	4	3	7	-	Yes	5
20.	Football-watching party	Fresno, CA	11/17/19	WaPo	-	No	4	6	10	-	-	2
21.	Halloween Party	Orinda, CA	11/1/19	WaPo	-	-	5	0	5	-	-	1
22.	Tequila KC bar	Kansas City, KS	10/6/19	WaPo	-	No	4	5	9	-	No	2
23.	Midland-Odessa Highways	Odessa, TX	8/31/19	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	Yes	7	25	32	-	No	1
24.	Dayton	Dayton, OH	8/4/19	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	9	27	36	41 ^f	Yes	1/2
25.	El Paso Walmart	El Paso, TX	8/3/19	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	22	26	48	-	Yes	1
26.	Casa Grande Senior Mobile Estates	Santa Maria, CA	6/19/19	WaPo	-	-	4	0	4	-	-	1
27.	Virginia Beach Municipal Center	Virginia Beach, VA	5/31/19	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	12	4	16	-	Yes	2
28.	Henry Pratt Co.	Aurora, IL	2/15/19	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	5	6	11	-	No	1
29.	SunTrust Bank	Sebring, FL	1/23/19	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	5	0	5	-	Yes	1
30.	Borderline Bar & Grill	Thousand Oaks, CA	11/7/18	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	12	1	13	50 g	Yes	1

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 10 of 37 PageID #: 996 Exhibit B

					Large Capacity	Assault			Total Fatalities &	Shots	Gun(s) Obtained	Offender(s)' Number of
	Case	Location	Date	Source	Mag.? ^a		Fatalities ^c	Injuries ^c	Injuries ^c	$\mathbf{Fired}^{\mathrm{d}}$	Legally?e	Guns
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)
31.	Tree of Life Synagogue	Pittsburgh, PA	10/27/18	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	Yes	11	6	17	-	Yes	4
32.	T&T Trucking	Bakersfield, CA	9/12/18	MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	0	5	-	-	1
33.	Capital Gazette	Annapolis, MD	6/28/18	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	5	2	7	-	Yes	1
34.	Santa Fe High School	Santa Fe, TX	5/18/18	MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	10	13	23	-	-	2
35.	Waffle House	Nashville, TN	4/22/18	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	Yes	4	4	8	-	Yes	1
36.	Detroit	Detroit, MI	2/26/18	VP	-	No	4	0	4	-	-	-
37.	Stoneman Douglas HS	Parkland, FL	2/14/18	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	17	17	34	-	Yes	1
38.	Pennsylvania Carwash	Melcroft, PA	1/28/18	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	-	4	1	5	-	-	3 h
39.	Rancho Tehama	Rancho Tehama, CA	11/14/17	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	4	10	14	30 ⁱ	No	2
40.	Texas First Baptist Church	Sutherland Springs, TX	11/5/17	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	26	20	46	450 ^j	Yes	1
41.	Las Vegas Strip	Las Vegas, NV	10/1/17	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	58	422	480	1100 ^k	Yes	23
42.	Taos and Rio Arriba counties	Abiquiu, NM	6/15/17	WaPo	No	No	5	0	5	-	-	1
43.	Fiamma Workplace	Orlando, FL	6/5/17	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	0	5	-	-	1
44.	Marathon Savings Bank	Rothschild, WI	3/22/17	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	0	4	-	-	2
45.	Club 66	Yazoo City, MS	2/6/17	VP/WaPo	-	-	4	0	4	-	-	1
46.	Fort Lauderdale Airport	Fort Lauderdale, FL	1/6/17	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	6	11	15 ¹	Yes	1
47.	Cascade Mall	Burlington, WA	9/23/16	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	5	0	5	-	-	1
48.	Dallas Police	Dallas, TX	7/7/16	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	5	11	16	-	Yes	3
49.	Walgreens Parking Lot	Las Vegas, NV	6/29/16	WaPo	-	-	4	0	4	-	-	1
50.	Orlando Nightclub	Orlando, FL	6/12/16	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	49	53	102	110 ^m	Yes	2
51.	Franklin Avenue Cookout	Wilkinsburg, PA	3/9/16	VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	6	3	9	48 ⁿ	No	2
52.	Kalamazoo	Kalamazoo County, MI	2/20/16	MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	6	2	8	-	Yes	1
53.	San Bernardino	San Bernardino, CA	12/2/15	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	14	22	36	150 °	Yes	4
54.	Tennessee Colony campsite	Anderson County, TX	11/15/15	VP/WaPo	-	-	6	0	6	-	-	1
55.	Umpqua Community College	Roseburg, OR	10/1/15	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	9	9	18	-	Yes	6
56.	Chattanooga Military Center	Chattanooga, TN	7/16/15	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	5	2	7	-	Yes	3
57.	Charleston Church	Charleston, SC	6/17/15	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	9	3	12	-	Yes	1
58.	Marysville High School	Marysville, WA	10/24/14	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	4	1	5	-	No	1
59.	Isla Vista	Santa Barbara, CA	5/23/14	MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	6	13	19	50 P	Yes	3
60.	Alturas Tribal	Alturas, CA	2/20/14	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	4	2	6	-	-	2
61.	Washington Navy Yard	Washington, D.C.	9/16/13	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	12	8	20	-	Yes	2

Exhibit B Public Mass Shootings Data 1982 – October 2022

Large Total Gun(s) Offender(s)' Fatalities & **Shots** Capacity Assault Obtained Number of Weapon?^b Fatalities^c Injuries^c Fired^d Source Mag.?^a Injuries^c Legally?e Case Location Date Guns (1) (2) (3) **(4) (5) (6) (7) (8)** (9) (10)(11)(12)62. Hialeah 10 q Hialeah, FL 7/26/13 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes No 6 0 6 Yes 3 8 70 r 63. Santa Monica Santa Monica, CA 6/7/13 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes Yes 5 Yes 2 64. Federal Way Federal Way, WA 4/21/13 MJ/VP/WaPo No 4 0 4 Yes 65. Upstate New York Herkimer County, NY 3/13/13 MJ/VP/WaPo No 4 2 6 Yes 1 66. Newtown School Newtown, CT 12/14/12 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes Yes 27 2 29 154 No 4/3 67. Accent Signage Systems Minneapolis, MN 9/27/12 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes No 6 2 8 46 Yes 4 68. Sikh Temple Oak Creek, WI 8/5/12 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes No 10 Yes 12 70 82 80 69. Aurora Movie Theater Aurora, CO 7/20/12 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes Yes Yes 4 70. Seattle Café Seattle, WA 5/30/12 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo No No 5 6 Yes Oakland, CA 71. Oikos University 7 3 10 Yes 4/2/12 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo No No 0 72. Su Jung Health Sauna Norcross, GA 2/22/12 4 Yes MJ/WaPo No 4 8 9 3 73. Seal Beach Seal Beach, CA 10/14/11 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo No No 1 Yes 74. IHOP Carson City, NV 9/6/11 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes Yes 4 7 11 Yes 3 21 ^s 75. Akron Akron, OH 8/7/11 VPNo No 7 2 9 76. Forum Roller World Grand Prairie, TX 7/23/11 WaPo No 5 4 9 77. Grand Rapids Grand Rapids, MI 7/7/11 CCYes 7 2 9 10 No 1 78. Family law practice Yuma, AZ 6/2/11 WaPo 5 1 6 79. Tucson Tucson, AZ 1/8/11 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes No 6 13 19 33 Yes 12 ^t 80. Jackson Jackson, KY 9/11/10 VP No No 5 0 5 10 ^u Buffalo, NY 81. City Grill 8/14/10 VP/WaPo No 4 4 8 1 82. Hartford Beer Distributor Manchester, CT 8/3/10 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo No 8 2 10 11 2 Yes Yes 9 V 83. Yoyito Café Hialeah, FL 6/6/10 CC/VP/WaPo No No 4 3 7 50 W 84. Hot Spot Café Los Angeles, CA 4/3/10 VP/WaPo No 4 2 6 85. Coffee Shop Police Parkland, WA 11/29/09 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo No No 4 0 4 No 2 _ 86. Fort Hood Fort Hood, TX 11/5/09 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes No 13 32 45 214 Yes 87. Worth Street Mount Airy, NC 0 16 ^X 11/1/09 VP/WaPo Yes 4 4 No 2 88. Binghamton Binghamton, NY 4/3/09 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo Yes No 13 4 17 99 Yes CC/MJ/VP/WaPo 89. Carthage Nursing Home Carthage, NC 3/29/09 8 2 10 Yes 2 No No 4 2 90. Skagit County Alger, WA 9/2/08 VP/WaPo 6 10 No No 91. Atlantis Plastics Henderson, KY 6/25/08 CC/MJ/VP/WaPo 5 1 6 Yes No No 17 ^y 92. Black Road Auto Santa Maria, CA 3/18/08 VP/WaPo No 4 0 4

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 12 of 37 PageID #: 998 $\mathbf{Exhibit} \ \mathbf{B}$

	Case	Location	Date	Source	Large Capacity Mag.? ^a	Assault Weapon? ^b	Fatalities ^c	Injuries ^c	Total Fatalities & Injuries ^c	Shots Fired ^d	Gun(s) Obtained Legally?	Offender(s)' Number of Guns
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)
93.	Northern Illinois University	DeKalb, IL	2/14/08	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	5	21	26	54	Yes	4
94.	Kirkwood City Council	Kirkwood, MO	2/7/08	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	6	1	7	-	No	2
95.	Youth With a Mission and New Life Church	Colorado Springs, CO	12/9/07	VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	4	5	9	25 ^Z	-	3
96.	Westroads Mall	Omaha, NE	12/5/07	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	8	5	13	14	No	1
97.	Crandon	Crandon, WI	10/7/07	CC/MJ/WaPo	Yes	-	6	1	7	30 ^{aa}	Yes	1
98.	Virginia Tech	Blacksburg, VA	4/16/07	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	32	17	49	176	Yes	2
99.	Trolley Square	Salt Lake City, UT	2/12/07	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	4	9	-	No	2
100.	Amish School	Lancaster County, PA	10/2/06	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	5	10	-	Yes	3
101.	The Ministry of Jesus Christ	Baton Rouge, LA	5/21/06	VP/WaPo	-	No	5	1	6	-	-	1
102.	Capitol Hill	Seattle, WA	3/25/06	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	6	2	8	-	Yes	4
103.	Goleta Postal	Goleta, CA	1/30/06	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	7	0	7	-	Yes	1
104.	Sash Assembly of God	Sash, TX	8/29/05	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	0	4	-	-	2
105.	Red Lake	Red Lake, MN	3/21/05	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	9	7	16	-	No	3
106.	Living Church of God	Brookfield, WI	3/12/05	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	7	4	11	-	Yes	1
107.	Fulton County Courthouse	Atlanta, GA	3/11/05	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	0	4	-	No	1
108.	Damageplan Show	Columbus, OH	12/8/04	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	4	3	7	15 ^{ab}	Yes	1
109.	Hunting Camp	Meteor, WI	11/21/04	CC/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	6	2	8	20	-	1
110.	ConAgra Foods Plant	Kansas City, KS	7/3/04	VP/WaPo	-	No	6	1	7	10 ^{ac}	-	2
111.	Stateline Tavern	Oldtown, ID	10/24/03	VP/WaPo	Yes	No	4	0	4	14 ^{ad}	-	1
112.	Windy City Warehouse	Chicago, IL	8/27/03	CC/VP/WaPo	No	No	6	0	6	-	-	-
113.	Lockheed Martin	Meridian, MS	7/8/03	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	6	8	14	-	Yes	5
114.	Labor Ready	Huntsville, AL	2/25/03	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	1	5	-	=	1
115.	Bertrand Products	South Bend, IN	3/22/02	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	2	6	-	-	2
116.	Burns International Security	Sacramento, CA	9/10/01	VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	5	2	7	200 ^{ae}	-	2
117.	Bookcliff RV Park	Rifle, CO	7/3/01	VP/WaPo	No	No	4	3	7	6 af	-	1
118.	Navistar	Melrose Park, IL	2/5/01	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	4	4	8	-	Yes	4
119.	Houston	Houston, TX	1/9/01	VP	-	No	4	0	4	-	-	-
120.	Wakefield	Wakefield, MA	12/26/00	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	-	7	0	7	37	Yes	3
121.	Mount Lebanon	Pittsburgh, PA	4/28/00	VP/WaPo	No	No	5	1	6	-	Yes	1
122.	Mi-T-Fine Car Wash	Irving, TX	3/20/00	VP/WaPo	-	No	5	1	6	-	-	-
123.	Hotel	Tampa, FL	12/30/99	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	3	8	-	Yes	2

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 13 of 37 PageID #: 999 Exhibit B

					Large Capacity	Assault			Total Fatalities &	Shots	Gun(s) Obtained	Offender(s)' Number of
	Case	Location	Date	Source	Mag.? ^a	Weapon? ^b	Fatalities ^c	<u>Injuries</u> ^c	Injuries ^c	Fired ^d	Legally?e	Guns
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)
124.	Xerox	Honolulu, HI	11/2/99	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	7	0	7	28	Yes	1
125.	Wedgwood Baptist Church	Fort Worth, TX	9/15/99	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	7	7	14	30	Yes	2
126.	Atlanta Day Trading	Atlanta, GA	7/29/99	MJ/VP/WaPo	-	No	9	13	22	-	Yes	4
127.	Albertson's Supermarket	Las Vegas, NV	6/3/99	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	1	5	-	-	1
128.	Columbine High School	Littleton, CO	4/20/99	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	13	23	36	188	No	4
129.	New St. John Fellowship Baptist Church	Gonzalez, LA	3/10/99	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	4	8	-	-	1
130.	Thurston High School	Springfield, OR	5/21/98	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	4	25	29	50	No	3
131.	Westside Middle School	Jonesboro, AR	3/24/98	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	5	10	15	26	No	9/10
132.	Connecticut Lottery	Newington, CT	3/6/98	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	4	0	4	5	Yes	1
133.	Caltrans Maintenance Yard	Orange, CA	12/18/97	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	4	2	6	144	Yes	1
134.	Erie Manufacturing	Bartow, FL	12/3/97	VP	-	No	4	0	4	12 ^{ag}	-	-
135.	R.E. Phelon Company	Aiken, SC	9/15/97	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	4	3	7	-	No	1
136.	News and Sentinel	Colebrook, NH	8/20/97	VP/WaPo	-	Yes	4	4	8	-	-	2
137.	Fire Station	Jackson, MS	4/25/96	VP/WaPo	-	No	5	3	8	-	-	3
138.	Fort Lauderdale	Fort Lauderdale, FL	2/9/96	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	1	6	14 ^{ah}	Yes	2
139.	Little Chester Shoes	New York, NY	12/19/95	VP/WaPo	Yes	No	5	3	8	-	-	1
140.	Piper Technical Center	Los Angeles, CA	7/19/95	CC/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	4	0	4	-	-	-
141.	Walter Rossler Company	Corpus Christi, TX	4/3/95	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	0	5	-	Yes	2
142.	Puppy creek	Hoke County, NC	12/31/94	VP	-	-	5	1	6	-	-	-
143.	Air Force Base	Fairchild Base, WA	6/20/94	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	4	23	27	50 ^{ai}	Yes	1
144.	Chuck E. Cheese	Aurora, CO	12/14/93	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	4	1	5	-	-	1
145.	Long Island Railroad	Garden City, NY	12/7/93	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	6	19	25	30	Yes	1
146.	Unemployment Office	Oxnard, CA	12/2/93	VP/WaPo	-	-	4	4	8	-	-	-
147.	Family Fitness Club	El Cajon, CA	10/14/93	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	0	4	-	Yes	1
148.	Luigi's Restaurant	Fayetteville, NC	8/6/93	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	4	8	12	-	Yes	3
149.	Washington County Bar	Jackson, MS	7/8/93	WaPo	-	-	5	0	5	-	-	1
150.	101 California Street	San Francisco, CA	7/1/93	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	8	6	14	75	No	3
151.	Card club	Paso Robles, CA	11/8/92	VP/WaPo	-	No	6	1	7	-	-	1
152.	Watkins Glen	Watkins Glen, NY	10/15/92	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	4	0	4	-	Yes	1
153.	Lindhurst High School	Olivehurst, CA	5/1/92	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	4	10	14	-	Yes	2
	Phoenix	Phoenix, AZ	3/15/92	VP	-	-	4	0	4	-	-	-

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 14 of 37 PageID #: 1000 $\mathbf{Exhibit} \ \mathbf{B}$

Public Mass Shootings Data 1982 – October 2022

	Case	Location	Date	Source	Large Capacity Mag.? ^a	Assault Weapon? ^b	Fatalities ^c	Injuries ^c	Total Fatalities & Injuries ^c	Shots Fired ^d	Gun(s) Obtained Legally?	Offender(s)' Number of Guns
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)
155.	Royal Oak Postal	Royal Oak, MI	11/14/91	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	4	4	8	-	Yes	1
156.	Restaurant	Harrodsburg, KY	11/10/91	VP/WaPo	No	No	4	0	4	6 ^{aj}	No	1
157.	University of Iowa	Iowa City, IA	11/1/91	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	5	1	6	-	Yes	1
158.	Luby's Cafeteria	Killeen, TX	10/16/91	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	23	20	43	100	Yes	2
159.	Post office	Ridgewood, NJ	10/10/91	VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	4	0	4	-	-	2
160.	GMAC	Jacksonville, FL	6/18/90	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	9	4	13	14	Yes	2
161.	Standard Gravure Corporation	Louisville, KY	9/14/89	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	8	12	20	21	Yes	5
162.	Stockton Schoolyard	Stockton, CA	1/17/89	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	5	29	34	106	Yes	2
163.	Montefiore School	Chicago, IL	9/22/88	VP/WaPo	No	No	4	2	6	-	-	1
164.	Old Salisbury Road	Winston-Salem, NC	7/17/88	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	5	9	-	-	1
165.	ESL	Sunnyvale, CA	2/16/88	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	7	4	11	-	Yes	7
166.	Shopping Centers	Palm Bay, FL	4/23/87	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	6	14	20	40 ^{ak}	Yes	3
167.	United States Postal Service	Edmond, OK	8/20/86	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	No	-	14	6	20	-	Yes	3
168.	Anchor Glass Container Corporation	South Connellsville, PA	3/16/85	VP/WaPo	No	No	4	1	5	-	-	1
169.	Other Place Lounge	Hot Springs, AR	7/24/84	VP/WaPo	No	No	4	1	5	-	-	1
170.	San Ysidro McDonald's	San Ysidro, CA	7/18/84	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	Yes	21	19	40	257	Yes	3
171.	Dallas Nightclub	Dallas, TX	6/29/84	CC/MJ/VP/WaPo	Yes	No	6	1	7	-	No	1
172.	Alaska Mining Town	Manley Hot Springs, AK	5/17/84	VP/WaPo	No	No	7	0	7	-	-	1
173.	College Station	Collge Station, TX	10/11/83	VP	-	No	6	0	6	-	-	-
174.	Alaska Back-County	McCarthy, AK	3/1/83	VP/WaPo	-	No	6	2	8	-	-	2
175.	Upper West Side Hotel	New York, NY	2/3/83	VP	No	No	4	1	5	-	-	1
176.	The Investor	Noyes Island, AK	9/6/82	WaPo	-	No	8	0	8	-	-	1
177.	Welding Shop	Miami, FL	8/20/82	MJ/VP/WaPo	No	No	8	3	11	-	Yes	1
178.	Western Transfer Co.	Grand Prairie, TX	8/9/82	VP/WaPo	-	No	6	4	10	-	-	3
179.	Russian Jack Springs Park	Anchorage, AK	5/3/82	VP/WaPo	-	No	4	0	4	-	No	1
				U	Capacity Ma Capacity Ma	0	U	16	25 9	99 16		

Assault Weapon Average: 12

Non-Assault Weapon Average: 6

24

4

36

10

149

38

Exhibit B

Public Mass Shootings Data 1982 – October 2022

				Large				Total		Gun(s)	Offender(s)'
				Capacity	Assault			Fatalities &	Shots	Obtained	Number of
Case	Location	Date	Source	Mag.? ^a	Weapon? ^b	Fatalities ^c	Injuries ^c	Injuries ^c	Fired ^d	Legally?e	Guns
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)

Notes and Sources:

Public Mass Shootings from Mother Jones ("US Mass Shootings, 1982-2022: Data from Mother Jones' Investigation," updated November 23, 2022). MJ indicates a mass shooting identified by Mother Jones.

The Citizens Crime Commission of New York City ("Mayhem Multiplied: Mass Shooters and Assault Weapons," February 2018 update, and "Citizens Crime Commission of New York City, Mass Shooting Incidents in America (1984-2012)," accessed June 1, 2017). CC indicates a mass shooting identified by Citizens Crime Commission of New York City data.

The Washington Post ("The Terrible Numbers That Grow With Each Mass Shooting,", updated May 12, 2021). WaPo indicates a mass shooting identified by The Washington Post.

The Violence Project ("Mass Shooter Database," updated May 14, 2022). VP indicates a mass shooting identified by the Violence Project.

bd "The gunman in Uvalde carried more ammunition into Robb Elementary School than a U.S. soldier carries into combat," CBS News, May 27, 2022. Note the number of shots fired has been updated since Allen 2022 in Duncan v. Rob Bonta which listed 315 shots fired based on the number of rounds found at the school.

- bh "Oxford High School shooter fired 30 rounds, had 18 more when arrested, sheriff says," Fox2Detroit, December 1, 2021.
- bi "Father of suspected Oxford High School shooter bought gun 4 days before shooting," Fox 2 Detroit, December 1, 2021.
- bj "VTA shooter fired 39 rounds during attack; carried 32 high-capacity magazines," KTVU Fox 2, May 27, 2021.
- bk "Sam Cassidy legally owned guns used in San Jose VTA shooting: Sheriff," Kron4, May 28, 2021.
- bl "Colorado Springs shooter who killed 6 at party had "displayed power and control issues," police say," The Denver Post, May 11, 2021.

a Large capacity magazines are those with a capacity to hold more than 10 rounds of ammunition. Stories from Factiva and Google searches reviewed to determine whether an LCM was involved.

^b See Exhibit C for details.

^c Offender(s) are not included in counts of fatalities and injuries. Stories from Factiva and Google searches reviewed to determine number of fatalities and injuries.

^d Except where noted, all data on shots fired obtained from CC.

^e The determination of whether guns were obtained legally is based on Mother Jones and Washington Post reporting.

ba "This is the norm in our country': Highland Park Mayor speaks to Senate committee about gun violence," CBS Chicago, July 20, 2022.

bb MJ reported "fewer than 10" injuries for this incident.

bc "Update: Man among those killed held door to allow others to escape, Tulsa police chief says," TulsaWorld, June 2, 2022.

be "Uvalde gunman legally bought AR rifles days before shooting, law enforcement says," The Texas Tribune, May 25, 2022.

bf "Buffalo shooting suspect says his motive was to prevent 'eliminating the white race'," NPR, June 16, 2022.

bg "Sacramento Church Mass Shooting Follows Disturbing Trend of Domestic Violence, Mass Shooting Connection; Rise of Ghost Guns," Everytown, March 7, 2022.

bm "Indianapolis FedEx Shooter Who Killed 4 Sikhs Was Not Racially Motivated, Police Say," NPR, July 28, 2021.

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 16 of 37 PageID #: 1002

Exhibit B

				Large				Total		Gun(s)	Offender(s)'
				Capacity	Assault			Fatalities &	Shots	Obtained	Number of
Case	Location	Date	Source	Mag.? ^a	Weapon?b	Fatalities ^c	Injuries ^c	Injuries ^c	\textbf{Fired}^{d}	Legally?e	Guns
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)

bn "Police Investigate Three Separate Fatal Shooting Incidents In Baltimore County," Baltimore County Government Website, March 29, 2021.

bo "Atlanta Shooting Suspect Bought Gun on Day of Rampage," Courthouse News, March 26, 2021.

bp "Search warrant reveals new information in Springfield Kum & Go shooting," Springfield News-Leader, April 8, 2020.

bq "There was no warning this was going to happen,' Miller shooting witnesses told investigators," WISN 12 News, November 24, 2020.

br "Milwaukee Miller brewery shooting: Six Molson Coors workers, including shooter, dead in rampage," Milwaukee Journal Sentinel, February 26, 2020.

f "The Dayton gunman killed 9 people by firing 41 shots in 30 seconds. A high-capacity rifle helped enable that speed," CNN, August 5, 2019.

^g "Authorities Describe 'Confusion And Chaos' At Borderline Bar Shooting In California," NPR, November 28, 2018.

h "Suspect in quadruple killing at car wash dies," CNN, January 30, 2018.

i "California gunman fired 30 rounds at elementary school, left when he couldn't get inside," ABC News, November 15, 2017.

j "Be quiet! It's him!' Survivors say shooter walked pew by pew looking for people to shoot," CNN, November 9, 2017.

k "Sheriff Says More than 1,100 Rounds Fired in Las Vegas," Las Vegas Review Journal, November 22, 2017

¹ "Fort Lauderdale Shooting Suspect Appears in Court, Ordered Held Without Bond," Washington Post, January 9, 2017.

m "'We Thought It Was Part of the Music': How the Pulse Nightclub Massacre Unfolded in Orlando," *The Telegraph*, June 13, 2016.

ⁿ "Two men charged with homicide in connection with Wilkinsburg backyard ambush," *Pittsburgh's Action News*, June 24, 2016.

O "San Bernardino Suspects Left Trail of Clues, but No Clear Motive," New York Times, December 3, 2015.

^p "Sheriff: Elliot Rodger Fired 50-plus Times in Isle Vista Rampage," Los Angeles Times, June 4, 2014.

^q "Shooter Set \$10,000 on Fire in Hialeah Shooting Rampage," *NBC News*, July 28, 2013.

^r "Police Call Santa Monica Gunman 'Ready for Battle," New York Times , June 8, 2013.

s "Questions linger in slayings; investigation continues in rampage as community searches for answers on why gunman shot eight people," The Beacon Journal, August 14, 2011.

t "Kentucky Tragedy: Man Kills Wife, Five Others, in Rampage Over Cold Eggs, Say Cops," CBS News, September 13, 2010.

^u "Ex-gang member guilty of shooting 5 in deadly 17-second rampage," *NBC*, April 1, 2011.

^v "Hialeah Gunman's Rage Over Estranged Wife Leaved 5 Dead," *Sun-Sentinel*, June 7, 2010.

W "Man convicted of killing 4 at Los Angeles restaurant," Associated Press, March 15, 2016.

Exhibit B

				Large				Total		Gun(s)	Offender(s)'
				Capacity	Assault			Fatalities &	Shots	Obtained	Number of
Case	Location	Date	Source	Mag.? ^a	Weapon?b	Fatalities ^c	Injuries ^c	Injuries ^c	\textbf{Fired}^{d}	Legally?e	Guns
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)

X "4 Victims In Mount Airy Shooting Related, Police Say," WXII 12 News, November 2, 2009.

^y "Arrested suspect might have warned of Santa Maria shooting", *Associated Press*, March 20, 2008.

^Z "Profile: New information released on Matthew Murray, gunman in church-related shootings in Colorado; Larry Bourbannais, wounded in one of the shootings, discusses his experience," NBC News, December 11, 2007.

^{aa} "Small Town Grieves for 6, and the Killer," Los Angeles Times, October 9, 2007.

ab "National Briefing | Midwest: Ohio: Shooter At Club May Have Reloaded," New York Times, January 15, 2005.

ac "Sixth person dies of injuries from shooting at Kansas meatpacking plant," Associated Press, July 3, 2004.

ad "Four Killed In Oldtown Shooting," *The Miner*, October 30, 2003.

ae "Sacramento shooter unscathed before killing self, autopsy shows," Associated Press, September 14, 2001.

af "Gunman kills 3, wounds 4 in Rifle rampage; mental patient is arrested," *The Denver Post*, April 2, 2015.

ag "Unfinished business," *Dateline NBC*, December 21, 2006.

ah "5 Beach Workers in Florida are Slain by Ex-Colleague," New York Times, February 10, 1996.

ai "Man Bent On Revenge Kills 4, Hurts 23 -- Psychiatrist Is First Slain In Rampage At Fairchild Air Force Base," The Seattle Times, June 21, 1994.

^{aj} "Man Killed Estranged Wife, Three Others as They Drove to Dinner," *Associated Press*, November 11, 1991.

ak "6 Dead in Florida Sniper Siege; Police Seize Suspect in Massacre," *Chicago Tribune*, April 25, 1987.

Exhibit C

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 19 of 37 PageID #: 1005 Exhibit $\bf C$

					Weapon Description From		Assault
C	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post c	Weapon? ^d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Raleigh spre	e shooting	Hedingham, NC	10/13/22		shotgun, semiautomatic handgun		-
2. Highland Pa parade shoot		Highland Park, IL	7/4/22		AR-15 style rifle, possibly modified for rapid fire		-
3. Tulsa medical shooting	al center	Tulsa, OK	6/1/22		AR-15 style rifle		-
4. Robb Element massacre	ntary School	Uvalde, TX	5/24/22		semiautomatic rifles		Yes ca
5. Buffalo supe massacre	ermarket	Buffalo, NY	5/14/22		Bushmaster XM-15 semiautomatic rifle		Yes
6. Sacramento shooting	County church	Sacramento, CA	2/28/22		AR-15-style "ghost gun"		-
7. Oxford High shooting	School	Oxford, MI	11/30/21		Sig Sauer 9mm pistol		No cb
8. San Jose VT	'A shooting	San Jose, CA	5/26/21		semiautomatic handguns		No cc
9. Canterbury ! Park shootin	Mobile Home g	Colorado Springs, CO	5/9/21			Smith & Wesson handgun	-
10. FedEx warel	nouse shooting	Indianapolis, IN	4/15/21		semiautomatic rifle	Ruger AR 556, HM Defense HM15F Rifle	Yes cd
11. Orange office shooting	e complex	Orange, CA	3/31/21		semiautomatic handgun	Glock semiautomatic handgun	-
12. Essex Royal shooting	Farms	Baltimore County, MD	3/28/21			-	-
13. King Sooper shooting	s supermarket	Boulder, CO	3/22/21		Ruger AR-556	Ruger AR 556 pistol, 9mm pistol	Yes ce
14. Atlanta mass shootings	sage parlor	Atlanta, GA	3/16/21		semiautomatic handgun	9mm handgun	-
15. Hyde Park s	hooting	Chicago, IL	1/9/21			.45-caliber pistol	-
16. Englewood by shooting	plock party	Chicago, IL	7/4/20			-	-
17. Springfield of store shooting		Springfield, MO	3/15/20		SKS 7.62-caliber rifle; Glock 9mm	Glock 9mm, SKS 7.62-caliber rifle	-
18. Molson Coo	rs shooting	Milwaukee, WI	2/26/20		semiautomatic handgun	Handgun	-
19. Jersey City I Supermarket		Jersey City, NJ	12/10/19	-	-	mossberg 12-gauge; .22-caliber ruger Mark IV; AR-15-style rifle; Ruger 9mm semiautomatic pistol; 9mm glock 17	No
20. Football-wat	ching party	Fresno, CA	11/17/19	-	-	two semiautomatic handguns	No
21. Halloween P	arty	Orinda, CA	11/1/19	-	-	-	-

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 20 of 37 PageID #: 1006 Exhibit $\bf C$

			W	Veapon Description From		Assault
Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission ^a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post	Weapon? d
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
22. Tequila KC bar	Kansas City, KS	10/6/19	-	-	Handgun	No
23. Midland-Odessa Highways	Odessa, TX	8/31/19	-	semiautomatic rifle	AR-style rifle	Yes ^e
24. Dayton	Dayton, OH	8/4/19	-	AR-15-style rifle, with a 100-round capacity ammunition drum	23 caliber anderson AM-15 pistol modified to function like an AR- 15 rifle, shotgun	Yes cf
25. El Paso Walmart	El Paso, TX	8/3/19	-	AK-47-style rifle, per authorities	7.62 caliber AK-47 style rifle	Yes
26. Casa Grande Senior Mobile Estates	Santa Maria, CA	6/19/19	-	-	-	-
Virginia Beach Municipal Center	Virginia Beach, VA	5/31/19	-	.45-caliber handguns; noise suppressor (silencer); several high- capacity magazines	.45 caliber handgun with noise suppressor, .45 caliber handgun	No
28. Henry Pratt Co.	Aurora, IL	2/15/19	-	Smith & Wesson handgun, with a green sighting laser	.40-caliber Smith & Wesson semiautomatic handgun	No
29. SunTrust Bank	Sebring, FL	1/23/19	-	9 mm handgun	9mm semiautomatic handgun	No
30. Borderline Bar & Grill	Thousand Oaks, CA	11/7/18	-	Glock 21, .45 caliber; high- capacity magazine	Glock 21 .45-caliber handgun	No
31. Tree of Life Synagogue	Pittsburgh, PA	10/27/18	-	AR-15; Glock .357	Colt AR-15 semiautomatic rifle; three glock .357 pistols	Yes f
32. T&T Trucking	Bakersfield, CA	9/12/18	-	-	.50-caliber Smith & Wesson 500	No g
33. Capital Gazette	Annapolis, MD	6/28/18	-	12-gauge pump-action shotgun	2 gauge shotgun	No
34. Santa Fe High School	Santa Fe, TX	5/18/18	-	shotgun; .38 revolver	.38 caliber revolver, shotgun	No
35. Waffle House	Nashville, TN	4/22/18	-	AR-15	AR-15-style semiautomatic rifle	Yes h
36. Detroit	Detroit, MI	2/26/18	-	-	-	No
37. Stoneman Douglas HS	Parkland, FL	2/14/18	-	AR-15	.223 caliber smith & wesson M&P 15 semiautomatic ar 15 rifle	No i
38. Pennsylvania Carwash	Melcroft, PA	1/28/18	-	semiautomatic rifle and semiautomatic handgun	AR-15 .223-caliber semiautomatic rifle; 9mm handgun	_ j
9. Rancho Tehama	Rancho Tehama, CA	11/14/17	-	Two illegally modified rifles	two semiautomatic rifles; two handguns	Yes k
40. Texas First Baptist Church	Sutherland Springs, TX	11/5/17	-	Ruger AR-556; Kelley also possessed semiautomatic handguns	9mm Glock pistol; Ruger .22- caliber; R uger AR-556	Yes ¹

				Weap	on Description From		Assault
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post	Weapon? ^d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
41.	Las Vegas Strip	Las Vegas, NV	10/1/17	-	AR-15-style and AK-47-style rifles and "a large cache of ammunition"; four Daniel Defense DDM4 rifles, three FN-15s and other rifles made by Sig Sauer.	-	Yes ^m
42.	Taos and Rio Arriba counties	Abiquiu, NM	6/15/17	-	-	.38 caliber revolver	No
43.	Fiamma Workplace	Orlando, FL	6/5/17	-	semiautomatic handgun	semiautomatic rifle (2); handgun (2)	No
44.	Marathon Savings Bank	Rothschild, WI	3/22/17	-	-	Rifle, handgun	No
45.	Club 66	Yazoo City, MS	2/6/17	-	-	-	-
46.	Fort Lauderdale Airport	Fort Lauderdale, FL	1/6/17	-	Walther 9mm semi-automatic pistol	9mm semiautomatic handgun	No
47.	Cascade Mall	Burlington, WA	9/23/16	-	Ruger .22-caliber	Ruger .22-caliber rifle	No n
48.	Dallas Police	Dallas, TX	7/7/16	-	Izhmash-Saiga 5.45mm (AK- style) semiautomatic rifle with large capacity magazines; Glock 9mm handgun, .25-caliber semiautomatic handgun	SKS-type semiautomatic rifle	Yes ^o
49.	Walgreens Parking Lot	Las Vegas, NV	6/29/16	-	-	-	-
50.	Orlando Nightclub	Orlando, FL	6/12/16	-	Sig Sauer MCX rifle, Glock 17 9mm; high-capacity magazines (30 rounds)	.223-caliber Sig Sauer MCX semiautomatic rifle; 9mm semiautomatic glock 17 pistol	Yes p
51.	Franklin Avenue Cookout	Wilkinsburg, PA	3/9/16	-	-	AK-47-style rifle, .40-caliber handgun	Yes
52.	Kalamazoo	Kalamazoo County, MI	2/20/16	-	9 mm handgun (ammo used unclear)	Walther P-99 9mm semiautomatic handgun	No
53.	San Bernardino	San Bernardino, CA	12/2/15	-	Two semiautomatic AR-15-style rifles—one a DPMS A-15, the other a Smith & Wesson M&P15, both with .223 calibre ammunition. Two 9mm semiautomatic handguns. High capacity magazines.	DPMS AR-15-style rifle; Smith & Wesson M&P AR-15-style rifle; Llama semiautomatic 9mm pistol; Smith & Wesson semiautomatic 9mm pistol	Yes ^q
54.	Tennessee Colony campsite	Anderson County, TX	11/15/15	-	-	-	-
55.	Umpqua Community College	Roseburg, OR	10/1/15	-	9 mm Glock pistol, .40 caliber Smith & Wesson, .40 caliber Taurus pistol, .556 caliber Del- Ton; (ammo details unclear)	rifle; five pistols	No ^r

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 22 of 37 PageID #: 1008 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon	Description From		Assault
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post C	Weapon? d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
26.	Chattanooga Military Center	Chattanooga, TN	7/16/15	-	AK-47, AR-15, and 30-round magazines; 9mm handgun	AR-15-style semiautomatic rifle; 9mm pistol; AK-47-type semiautomatic rifle	Yes ^s
57. C	Charleston Church	Charleston, SC	6/17/15	-	.45-caliber Glock (model 41, with 13-round capacity magazine)	.45-caliber glock 41 pistol	No
58. M	Marysville High School	Marysville, WA	10/24/14	-	Beretta .40-caliber handgun	.40-caliber beretta pistol	No
59. Is	sla Vista	Santa Barbara, CA	5/23/14	-	Two Sig Sauer P226 semiautomatic pistols and Glock 34 pistol, and hundreds of rounds of ammo. A 6- inchand 8-inch "SRK" and "Boar Hunter" hunting knives.	Sig Sauer P226s pistol; Glock 34 pistol; Sig Sauer P226s pistol	No
60. A	Alturas Tribal	Alturas, CA	2/20/14	-	9mm semi-automatic handgun	Unknown	No
61. W	Vashington Navy Yard	Washington, D.C.	9/16/13	-	Remington 870 Express 12-gauge shotgun; Beretta handgun	beretta pistol; Remington 970 Express 12-gauge shotgun	No
62. H	Iialeah	Hialeah, FL	7/26/13	-	Glock 17	Glock 17 pistol	No
63. Sa	anta Monica	Santa Monica, CA	6/7/13	-	.223-caliber semi-automatic assault rifle, about 40 high capacity magazines, "black powder" handgun (likely antique)	Black powder .33-caliber handgun; AR-15 type .223- caliber semiautomatic rifle	Yes ^t
64. Fe	ederal Way	Federal Way, WA	4/21/13	-	.40 caliber semi-automatic handgun, pistol grip shotgun	.40 caliber semiautomatic pistol; pistol grip shotgun	No ^u
65. U	Jpstate New York	Herkimer County, NY	3/13/13	-	Unknown	Unknown	No v
66. N	Jewtown School	Newtown, CT	12/14/12	An unknown make and model .22-caliber rifle, a Bushmaster XM15 .223-caliber semiautomatic assault rifle equipped with a 30-round large capacity ammunition magazine, and a GLOCK 10mm handgun were used. According to the Danbury State's Attorney, police also recovered in Lanza's possession a SIG SAUER P226 9mm handgun and three loaded 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines for the Bushmaster. Six additional 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines were recovered at the scene. A loaded unknown make and model 12-gauge shotgun was found in the passenger compartment of the car (later moved to the trunk by police). All of the guns used in the shooting were purchased by Lanza's mother.	10mm Glock, 9mm SIG Sauer P226 semiautomatic handguns; .223 Bushmaster XM15-E2S semiautomatic rifle; Izhmash Saiga-12 12-gauge semiautomatic shotgun	9mm SIG Sauer P226 pistol ;Savage Mark II bolt-action .22- caliber rifle; .223 Bushmaster XM15-E2S semiautomatic rifle; izhmash Saiga 12-gauge semiautomatic shotgun; 10mm Glock pistol	Yes W

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 23 of 37 PageID #: 1009 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon Description From			
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones	Washington Post c	Weapon? ^d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
67	. Accent Signage Systems	Minneapolis, MN	9/27/12	GLOCK 19 9mm semiautomatic pistol equipped with a 15-round large capacity ammunition magazine. Engeldinger purchased the firearm one year before the shooting at KGS Guns and Ammo in Minneapolis after passing a background check and obtaining a permit to purchase. Police reportedly found packaging for 10,000 rounds of ammunition and another handgun in Engeldinger's home.	9mm Glock semiautomatic handgun	9mm glock pistol	No
68	. Sikh Temple	Oak Creek, WI	8/5/12	Springfield Armory XD(M) 9mm semiautomatic handgun equipped with a 19-round large capacity ammunition magazine. Weeks before the shooting, Wade legally purchased the handgun and three 19-round large capacity ammunition magazines from a federal firearms licensed dealer in nearby West Allis, WI. According to media reports, Wade served in the U.S. Army from 1992 until 1998, when he was given an other-than-honorable discharge or general discharge. In 1994, while stationed at Fort Bliss in Texas, he was arrested by El Paso police, and pled guilty to a misdemeanor charge of criminal mischief. Federal law does not prohibit persons with convictions for misdemeanors other than domestic violence misdemeanors or persons who have been discharged from the military for reasons other than "dishonorably" from purchasing firearms.	9mm Springfield Armory XDM semiautomatic handgun	9mm springfield armory XDM pistol	No
69	. Aurora Movie Theater	Aurora, CO	7/20/12	A Smith & Wesson M&P15 assault rifle equipped with a 100-round drum large capacity ammunition magazine, a Remington Model 870 12-gauge pump shotgun, and two GLOCK .40 caliber handguns, were recovered at the scene by police. In the months leading to the shooting, Holmes purchased the weapons and 6,000-rounds of ammunition at gun shops and over the Internet. In addition to the weapons used in the shooting, Holmes booby-trapped his apartment, rigging trip wire to detonate 30 plastic shells stuffed with gunpowder, several glass jars filled with gasoline and gunpowder, and 10 gallons of gasoline in canisters.	Two .40-caliber Glock semiautomatic handguns; .223- caliber Smith & Wesson M&P15 semiautomatic rifle; 12- gauge Remington 870 pump- action shotgun	.40-caliber glock pistol; 12-gauge pump-action Remington 870 shotgun; .223-caliber Smith & Wesson M&P15 semiautomatic AR-15-style rifle	Yes X
70	. Seattle Café	Seattle, WA	5/30/12	-	Two .45-caliber semiautomatic handguns	.45-caliber pistol (2)	No
71	. Oikos University	Oakland, CA	4/2/12	-	.45-caliber semiautomatic handgun	.45-caliber pistol	No
72	. Su Jung Health Sauna	Norcross, GA	2/22/12	-	.45-caliber semiautomatic handgun	-	No

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 24 of 37 PageID #: 1010 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon Description From			
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post C	Weapon? d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
73.	Seal Beach	Seal Beach, CA	10/14/11	-	.45-caliber Heckler & Koch, 9mm Springfield semiautomatic handguns; .44 Magnum Smith & Wesson revolver	-	No
74.	ІНОР	Carson City, NV	9/6/11	AK-47 type assault rifle equipped with a 30-round large capacity ammunition magazine. Two additional guns and two more magazines were found in his vehicle.	AK-47 Norinco Arms variant, AK-47 Romarm Cugir variant rifles; .38-caliber Colt revolver	AK-47 variant semiautomatic rifle	Yes ^y
75.	Akron	Akron, OH	8/7/11	-	-	-	No ^z
76.	Forum Roller World	Grand Prairie, TX	7/23/11	-	-	-	No ^{aa}
77.	Grand Rapids	Grand Rapids, MI	7/7/11	GLOCK 9mm semiautomatic pistol (unknown model) equipped with a 30-round large capacity ammunition magazine.	-	-	No
78.	Family law practice	Yuma, AZ	6/2/11	-	-	-	-
79.	Tucson	Tucson, AZ	1/8/11	GLOCK 19 9mm semiautomatic pistol equipped with a 33-round large capacity ammunition magazine. Loughner was also carrying two 15-round large capacity ammunition magazines, and a knife. The ATF determined Loughner legally purchased the GLOCK pistol with an extended magazine and one box of Winchester ammunition on November 30, 2010, from Sportsman's Warehouse in Tucson.	9mm Glock 19 semiautomatic handgun	9mm glock 19 pistol	No
80.	Jackson	Jackson, KY	9/11/10	-	-	-	No ab
81.	City Grill	Buffalo, NY	8/14/10	-	-	9mm pistol	No
82.	Hartford Beer Distributor	Manchester, CT	8/3/10	Two Ruger SR9 9mm semiautomatic pistols equipped with 17-round magazines. Thornton purchased both firearms legally from an East Windsor, CT gun dealer.	Two 9mm Ruger SR9 semiautomatic handguns	9mm Ruger SR9 pistol (2)	No
83.	Yoyito Café	Hialeah, FL	6/6/10	-	-	.45-caliber Glock pistol	No ac
84.	Hot Spot Café	Los Angeles, CA	4/3/10	-	-	-	No ad
85.	Coffee Shop Police	Parkland, WA	11/29/09	-	9mm Glock 17 semiautomatic handgun; .38-caliber Smith & Wesson revolver	.38-caliber Smith & Wesson revolver; 9mm Glock 17 pistol	No

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 25 of 37 PageID #: 1011 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon	Weapon Description From		
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post	Weapon?
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
86.	Fort Hood	Fort Hood, TX	11/5/09	FN Herstal 5.7 Tactical Pistol equipped with 20-round large capacity ammunition magazine. When Hasan was apprehended, investigators found in his possession 177-rounds in 30-round and 20-round large capacity ammunition magazines, another handgun, a revolver, and two gunsights (for different lighting conditions). Hasan purchased the FN Herstal 5.7 Tactical Pistol legally at Guns Galore, a shop in Killeen, TX	FN Five-seven semiautomatic handgun	FN Five-seven pistol	No
87.	Worth Street	Mount Airy, NC	11/1/09	-	-	High-powered assault-style rifle	Yes
88.	Binghamton	Binghamton, NY	4/3/09	Beretta .45-caliber semiautomatic pistol, Beretta 9mm semiautomatic pistol (models unknown), and two 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines and two 15-round large capacity ammunition magazines.	9mm Beretta, .45-caliber Springfield semiautomatic handguns	9mm Beretta pistol; .45-caliber Springfield pistol	No
89.	Carthage Nursing Home	Carthage, NC	3/29/09	-	Winchester 1300 pump-action shotgun; .357 Magnum revolver	.357 magnum revolver; Winchester 1300 pump-action shotgun	No
90.	Skagit County	Alger, WA	9/2/08	-	-	lever-action winchester rifle, handgun	No
91.	Atlantis Plastics	Henderson, KY	6/25/08	-	.45-caliber Hi-Point semiautomatic handgun	.45-caliber Hi-Point pistol	No
92.	Black Road Auto	Santa Maria, CA	3/18/08	-	-	semiautomatic handgun	No
93.	Northern Illinois University	DeKalb, IL	2/14/08	SIG SAUER Kurz 9mm semiautomatic pistol, Hi-Point CF380 .380 caliber semiautomatic pistol, GLOCK 19 9mm semiautomatic pistol, Remington Sportsman 48 12-gauge shotgun, and 33-round and 15-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Kazmierczak purchased all four weapons from Tony's Gun & Ammo in Champaign, IL between August 3, 2007 and February 9, 2008. Kazmierczak also purchased gun accessories from a website operated by TGSCOM, Inc., the same company patronized by the VA Tech shooter.	9mm Glock 19, Hi-Point CF380, 9mm Kurz SIG Sauer P232 semiautomatic handguns; 12- gauge Remington Sportsman 48 sawed-off shotgun	12-gauge Remington Sportsman 48 sawed-off shotgun; 9mm glock 19 pistol; 9mm Kurz SIG Sauer P232 pistol; Hi-Point CF380 pistol	No ae
94.	Kirkwood City Council	Kirkwood, MO	2/7/08	-	.40-caliber Smith & Wesson semiautomatic handgun; .44 Magnum Smith & Wesson Model 29 revolver	.40-caliber Smith & Wesson pistol; .44 Magnum Smith & Wesson Model 29 revolver	No
95.	Youth With a Mission and New Life Church	Colorado Springs, CO	12/9/07	-	-	A pistol, .223-caliber Bushmaster XM16 rifle, .40- caliber Beretta pistol	Yes
96.	Westroads Mall	Omaha, NE	12/5/07	WASR-10 semiautomatic assault rifle and two 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines.	WASR-10 Century Arms semiautomatic rifle	WASR-10 Century Arms semiautomatic rifle	Yes af
97.	Crandon	Crandon, WI	10/7/07	-	AR-15 SWAT semiautomatic rifle	AR-15-style semiautomatic rifle	_ ag

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 26 of 37 PageID #: 1012 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon Description From			
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post C	Weapon? ^d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
98.	Virginia Tech	Blacksburg, VA	4/16/07	GLOCK 19 9mm semiautomatic pistol and Walther P22 .22-caliber semiautomatic pistol. Investigators found a total of 17 empty magazines at the scene of the shooting, a mix of several 15-round, and 10-round magazines loaded with hollow-point rounds (bullets with the tip hollowed out, designed to expand upon impact). He possessed over 400 rounds of ammunition. Cho ordered the Walther P22 from a website operated by TGSCOM, Inc. Kazmierczak patronized the same company before the NIU shooting. On February 9, 2007, Cho picked up the pistol from J-N-D Pawn-brokers, located across the street from the VA Tech campus. In compliance with the state law limiting handgun purchases to one every 30 days, Cho purchased the GLOCK 19 on March 13, 2007. He also purchased five 10-round magazines from eBay in March. Cho's purchase of these firearms was in violation of federal law; he was disqualified from purchasing or possessing a firearm and ammunition, because a special justice of the Montgomery County General District Court had found him to be a danger to himself on December 14, 2005.	9mm Glock 19, .22-caliber Walther P22 semiautomatic handguns	.22-caliber Walther P22 pistol; 9mm Glock 19 pistol	No
99.	Trolley Square	Salt Lake City, UT	2/12/07	-	Mossberg Maverick 88 Field shotgun; .38-caliber Smith & Wesson M36 revolver	.38-caliber Smith & Wesson M36 revolver; Mossberg Maverick 88 Field shotgun	No
100.	Amish School	Lancaster County, PA	10/2/06	-	Springfield semiautomatic handgun; .30-06 Ruger bolt-action rifle; 12-gauge Browning pump- action shotgun	12-gauge Browning pump-action shotgun; .30-06 Ruger bolt-action rifle; Springfield 9mm semiautomatic handgun	No ah
101.	The Ministry of Jesus Christ	Baton Rouge, LA	5/21/06	-	-	-	No ai
102.	Capitol Hill	Seattle, WA	3/25/06	-	.40-caliber Ruger, one other semiautomatic handgun; Bushmaster XM15 E2S semiautomatic rifle; 12-gauge Winchester Defender pump-action shotgun with extended tube and pistol grip	12-gauge pump-action Winchester Defender shotgun; .40-caliber Ruger pistol	Yes ^{aj}
103.	Goleta Postal	Goleta, CA	1/30/06	Smith & Wesson 915 9mm semiautomatic handgun equipped with a 15-round large capacity ammunition magazine. San Marco purchased the firearm at a pawn shop in New Mexico in August 2005.	9mm Smith & Wesson 915 semiautomatic handgun	9mm Smith & Wesson 915 pistol	No

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 27 of 37 PageID #: 1013 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon Description From				
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post	Weapon? d	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	
104.	Sash Assembly of God	Sash, TX	8/29/05	-	-	9mm semiautomatic pistol, .38-caliber revolver	No	
105.	Red Lake	Red Lake, MN	3/21/05	-	.40-caliber Glock 23, .22-caliber Ruger semiautomatic handguns; 12-gauge Remington 870 shotgun	.22-caliber Ruger pistol (2); 12-gauge Remington 870 shotgun	No	
106.	Living Church of God	Brookfield, WI	3/12/05	-	9mm Beretta semiautomatic handgun	9mm beretta pistol	No	
107.	Fulton County Courthouse	Atlanta, GA	3/11/05	-	-	9mm pistol	No	
108.	Damageplan Show	Columbus, OH	12/8/04	-	9mm Beretta 92FS semiautomatic handgun	9mm beretta 92FS pistol	No	
109.	Hunting Camp	Meteor, WI	11/21/04	SKS 7.62mm semiautomatic assault rifle equipped with a 20-round large capacity ammunition magazine.	-	7.62mm SKS semiautomatic rifle	Yes ak	
110.	ConAgra Foods Plant	Kansas City, KS	7/3/04	-	-	9mm pistol, revolver	No	
111.	Stateline Tavern	Oldtown, ID	10/24/03	-	-	semiautomatic pistol	No	
112.	Windy City Warehouse	Chicago, IL	8/27/03	-	-	.38-caliber Walther pistol	No ^{al}	
113.	Lockheed Martin	Meridian, MS	7/8/03	-	.45-caliber Ruger P90 semiautomatic handgun; .22- caliber rifle with scope, .223- caliber Ruger Mini-14 rifle; 12- gauge Winchester 1300 shotgun; .22 Magnum derringer	.223-caliber Ruger Mini-14 rifle; 12-gauge Winchester 1300 shotgun	No am	
114.	Labor Ready	Huntsville, AL	2/25/03	-	-	semiautomatic 9mm pistol	No	
115.	Bertrand Products	South Bend, IN	3/22/02	-	-	.22-caliber rifle, sawed-off shotgun	No	
116.	Burns International Security	Sacramento, CA	9/10/01	-	-	AK-47-type semiautomatic rifle, 9mm pistol	Yes an	
117.	Bookcliff RV Park	Rifle, CO	7/3/01	-	-	.38 caliber Charter Arms revolver	No	
118.	Navistar	Melrose Park, IL	2/5/01	-	SKS 1954R, .30-caliber Winchester rifles; 12-gauge Remington pump-action shotgun; .38-caliber revolver	12-gauge Remington pump-action shotgun; SKS 1954R rifle; .30- caliber Winchester rifle; .38- caliber revolver;	No ^{ao}	
119.	Houston	Houston, TX	1/9/01	-	-	-	No ap	

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 28 of 37 PageID #: 1014 Exhibit $\bf C$

			Weapor	Description From		Assault
Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post	Weapon? ^d
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
. Wakefield	Wakefield, MA	12/26/00	AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle , unknown make and model 12-gauge shotgun, unknown make and model .32-caliber semiautomatic pistol, and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine.	.32-caliber Retolaza semiautomatic handgun; AK-47 variant semiautomatic rifle; 12- gauge Winchester 1300 pump- action shotgun	.32-caliber Retolaza pistol; AK-47 variant semiautomatic rifle; 12- gauge Winchester 1300 pump- action shotgun	_ aq
. Mount Lebanon	Pittsburgh, PA	4/28/00	-	-	.357 Magnum revolver	No
. Mi-T-Fine Car Wash	Irving, TX	3/20/00	-	-	semiautomatic .9mm pistol	No
. Hotel	Tampa, FL	12/30/99	-	9mm Lorcin semiautomatic handgun; .38-caliber Charter Arms revolver	.38-caliber Charter Arms revolver; 9mm Lorcin pistol	No
. Xerox	Honolulu, HI	11/2/99	GLOCK 17 9mm semiautomatic pistol and three 17-round large capacity ammunition magazines, loaded with hollow point bullets (bullets with the tip hollowed out, designed to expand upon impact). Uyesugi legally purchased the GLOCK in 1989.	9mm Glock 17 semiautomatic handgun	9mm Glock 17 pistol	No
. Wedgwood Baptist Church	Fort Worth, TX	9/15/99	Ruger P85 9mm semiautomatic pistol, unknown make and model .380 caliber semiautomatic pistol, and three 15-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Ashbrook legally acquired both weapons from federally licensed firearms dealers in 1992.	.380-caliber, 9mm Ruger P85 semiautomatic handguns	.380-caliber revolver; 9mm Ruger P85 pistol	No
. Atlanta Day Trading	Atlanta, GA	7/29/99	-	.45-caliber Colt 1911-A1, 9mm Glock 17, .25-caliber Raven Arms MP-25 semiautomatic handguns; .22-caliber Harrington & Richardson revolver	.45-caliber Colt 1911-A1 pistol; .22-caliber Harrington & Richardson revolver; .25-caliber Raven Arms Mp-25 pistol; 9mm Glock 17 pistol	No
. Albertson's Supermarket	Las Vegas, NV	6/3/99	-	-	12-gauge pump-action shotgun	No
. Columbine High School	Littleton, CO	4/20/99	Savage Springfield 67H 12-gauge pump-action shotgun, Savage Stevens 311D 12-gauge sawedoff shotgun, Hi-Point 995 9mm semiautomatic rifle, INTRATEC TEC-DC9 9mm semiautomatic pistol, and thirteen 10-round magazines, one 52-, one 32-, one 28-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Harris and Klebold illegally acquired the shotguns and Hi- Point rifle through a "straw purchase" (a transaction in which a legal buyer makes a purchase for someone who cannot legally purchase the firearm). Their friend, Robyn Anderson, purchased the three firearms at the Tanner Gun Show from unlicensed sellers in December of 1998. A pizza shop employee, Mark Manes, illegally sold them the INTRATEC TEC-DC9.	9mm Intratec DC-9 semiautomatic handgun; 9mm Hi-Point 995 carbine rifle; 12- gauge sawed-off Savage Stevens 311D, 12-gauge sawed-off Savage Springfield 67H pump-action shotguns	9mm Hi-Point 995 carbine; 12- gauge sawed-off Savage Stevens 311D shotgun; 12-gauge sawed- off Savage Springfield 67H pump- action shotgun; 9mm Intratec DC- 9 machine pistol	Yes ^{ar}
2 3		(1) (2) D. Wakefield Wakefield, MA D. Mount Lebanon Pittsburgh, PA D. Mi-T-Fine Car Wash Irving, TX D. Hotel Tampa, FL D. Xerox Honolulu, HI D. Wedgwood Baptist Church Fort Worth, TX D. Atlanta Day Trading Atlanta, GA D. Albertson's Supermarket Las Vegas, NV	(1) (2) (3) O. Wakefield Wakefield, MA 12/26/00 O. Mount Lebanon Pittsburgh, PA 4/28/00 O. Mi-T-Fine Car Wash Irving, TX 3/20/00 O. Hotel Tampa, FL 12/30/99 O. Xerox Honolulu, HI 11/2/99 O. Wedgwood Baptist Church Fort Worth, TX 9/15/99 O. Atlanta Day Trading Atlanta, GA 7/29/99 O. Albertson's Supermarket Las Vegas, NV 6/3/99	Case Location Date Citizens Crime Commission (1) (2) (3) (4) AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 12-gauge shotgun, unknown make and model 13-2-caliber semiautomatic pistol, and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. Mount Lebanon Pittsburgh, PA 4/28/00 - Mi-T-Fine Car Wash Irving, TX 3/20/00 - Hotel Tampa, FL 12/30/99 - GLOCK 17 9mm semiautomatic pistol and three 17-round large capacity ammunition magazines, loaded with hollow point bullets (bullets with the tip hollowed out, designed to expand upon impact). Uyesugi legally purchased the GLOCK in 1989. Ruger P85 9mm semiautomatic pistol, unknown make and model .38 ocaliber semiautomatic pistol, and three 15-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Ashbrook legally acquired both weapons from federally licensed firearms semiautomatic rife, lnTRATEC TEC-DC9 9mm semiautomatic rife, and thirteen 15-round magazines, one 52-, one 32-, one 28-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Harris and Klebold illegally acquired the shotguns and Hi-Point rife through a "straw purchase" (a transaction in which a legal buyernase the firearm). Their friend, Robyn Anderson, purc	Case Location Date Citizens Crime Commission Mother Jones (I) (2) (3) (4) (5) AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 12-gauge shotgan, unknown make and model 12-gauge winchester 1300 pumpacion shotgan AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal, and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pstoal and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pagacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic pa	Case Location Date Citizens Crime Commission (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (5) (6) AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 132-caliber Relations model 122-gauge shotten, unknown make and model 132-caliber Relations from model 122-gauge shotten, and 60-round large capacity ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 132-caliber Relations and AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 132-caliber Relations and AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 132-caliber Relations shotting and the property ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 132-caliber Relations shotting and the property ammunition magazine. AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model 132-caliber Relations and the property and the property and antiboratic particular and the property and the

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 29 of 37 PageID #: 1015 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon Description From			Assault
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones	Washington Post c	Weapon? d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
129.	New St. John Fellowship Baptist Church	Gonzalez, LA	3/10/99	-	-	semiautomatic pistol	No
130.	Thurston High School	Springfield, OR	5/21/98	GLOCK 19 9mm semiautomatic pistol, Ruger (unknown model) .22-caliber semiautomatic pistol, Ruger (unknown model) .22-caliber rifle, and a 50-round large capacity ammunition magazine. The GLOCK and rifle were legally purchased by Kinkel's father.	9mm Glock, .22-caliber Ruger semiautomatic handguns, .22- caliber Ruger rifle	9mm Glock pistol; .22-caliber Ruger pistol; .22-caliber Ruger rifle	No ^{as}
131.	Westside Middle School	Jonesboro, AR	3/24/98	Universal M1 Carbine .30-caliber replica, Davis Industries .38-caliber two-shot derringer, Double Deuce Buddie .22-caliber two-shot derringer, Charter Arms .38-caliber revolver, Star .380-caliber pistol, FIE .380-caliber pistol, Ruger Security Six .357-caliber revolver, Ruger .44 magnum rifle, Smith & Wesson .38-caliber revolver, Remington 742 .30-06-caliber rifle, 15-round large capacity ammunition magazines, three 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines, and over 150-rounds of ammunition.	FIE 380, .380-caliber Star semiautomatic handguns; .44 Magnum Ruger, .30-06 Remington 742, .30-caliber Universal M-1 carbine replica rifles; .38-caliber Charter Arms, .357-caliber Ruger Security Six, .38-caliber Smith & Wesson revolvers; .22-caliber Double Deuce Buddie two-shot, .38-caliber Davis Industries two-shot derringers	.22-caliber Double Deuce revolver; .380-caliber Star pistol; .357- caliber Ruger Security six revolver; .44 Magnum Ruger revolver; .30-caliber Universal M- 1 carbine; .38-caliber Charter Arms revolver; .38-caliber Smith & Wesson revolver; FIE 380 pistol; .30-06 Remington 742 rifle	No ^{at}
132.	Connecticut Lottery	Newington, CT	3/6/98	GLOCK model unknown 9mm semiautomatic pistol equipped with a 19-round large capacity ammunition magazine. Beck had a permit for the 9mm pistol used in the shooting.	9mm semiautomatic handgun	9mm pistol	No
133.	Caltrans Maintenance Yard	Orange, CA	12/18/97	Chinese-made AK-47-type 7.62mm semiautomatic assault rifle and five 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Torres legally purchased the rifle on April 30, 1988, from B&B Gun Sales in Orange County, CA.	7.62mm AK-47 Chinese variant semiautomatic rifle	7.62mm AK-47 Chinese variant semiautomatic rifle	Yes
134.	Erie Manufacturing	Bartow, FL	12/3/97	-	-	-	No ^{au}
135.	R.E. Phelon Company	Aiken, SC	9/15/97	-	9mm semiautomatic handgun	9mm pistol	No
136.	News and Sentinel	Colebrook, NH	8/20/97	-	-	9mm pistol, AR-15-style rifle	Yes av
137.	Fire Station	Jackson, MS	4/25/96	-	-	Mac 11 machine pistol, Tec 9 automatic pistol, .45-caliber semiautomatic handgun	No
138.	Fort Lauderdale	Fort Lauderdale, FL	2/9/96	-	9mm Glock semiautomatic handgun; .32-caliber revolver	9mm Glock pistol; .32-caliber revolver	No
139.	Little Chester Shoes	New York, NY	12/19/95	-	-	.9mm semiautomatic pistol	No
140.	Piper Technical Center	Los Angeles, CA	7/19/95	-	-	Glock semiautomatic pistol	No ^{aw}

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 30 of 37 PageID #: 1016 Exhibit $\bf C$

				Weapon Description From			Assault
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post c	Weapon? d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
141.	Walter Rossler Company	Corpus Christi, TX	4/3/95	-	9mm Ruger semiautomatic handgun; .32-caliber revolver	.32-caliber revolver; 9mm Ruger pistol	No
142.	Puppy creek	Hoke County, NC	12/31/94	-	-	-	-
143.	Air Force Base	Fairchild Base, WA	6/20/94	Chinese-made Mak-90 semiautomatic assault rifle equipped with a 75-round drum large capacity ammunition magazine. He purchased the assault rifle on June 15, 1994, five days before the shooting, and the following day purchased 80 rounds of 7.62x39mm ammunition and a 75-round drum large capacity ammunition magazine.	MAK-90 semiautomatic rifle	MAK-90 semiautomatic AK- style rifle	Yes ^{ax}
144.	Chuck E. Cheese	Aurora, CO	12/14/93	-	.25-caliber semiautomatic handgun	.25-caliber pistol	No
145.	Long Island Railroad	Garden City, NY	12/7/93	Ruger P89 9mm semiautomatic pistol and four 15-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Ferguson legally acquired the weapon in California at an outlet of Turner's Outdoorsman.	9mm Ruger P89 semiautomatic handgun	9mm Ruger P89 pistol	No
146.	Unemployment Office	Oxnard, CA	12/2/93	-	-	Rifle	-
147.	Family Fitness Club	El Cajon, CA	10/14/93	-	-	12-gauge shotgun	No
148.	Luigi's Restaurant	Fayetteville, NC	8/6/93	-	.22-caliber rifle; two 12-gauge shotguns	12-gauge shotgun (2); .22-caliber rifle	No ^{ay}
149.	Washington County Bar	Jackson, MS	7/8/93	-	-	-	-
150.	101 California Street	San Francisco, CA	7/1/93	Two INTRATEC TEC-DC9 semiautomatic pistols, Colt (unknown model) .45-caliber semiautomatic pistol, and 40-round and 50-round large capacity ammunition magazines loaded with a mix of Black Talon and standard ammunition. According to the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department, Ferri purchased the pistols from two stores in Las Vegas: Super Pawn and Pacific Tactical Weapons.	Two Intratec DC-9, .45-caliber Colt semiautomatic handguns	.45-caliber Colt pistol; Intratec DC-9 machine pistols	Yes ^{az}
151.	Card club	Paso Robles, CA	11/8/92	-	-	-	No ^{ba}
152.	Watkins Glen	Watkins Glen, NY	10/15/92	-	9mm Llama semiautomatic handgun	9mm Llama pistol	No
153.	Lindhurst High School	Olivehurst, CA	5/1/92	-	.22-caliber sawed-off rifle; 12-gauge pump-action shotgun	.22-caliber sawed-off rifle; 12- gauge pump-action shotgun	No bb
154.	Phoenix	Phoenix, AZ	3/15/92	-	-	-	-
155.	Royal Oak Postal	Royal Oak, MI	11/14/91	-	.22-caliber Ruger sawed-off semiautomatic rifle	.22-caliber Ruger sawed-off semiautomatic rifle	No bc
156.	Restaurant	Harrodsburg, KY	11/10/91	-	-	.357 Magnum	No
156.	Restaurant	Harrodsburg, KY	11/10/91	-	-	.357 Magnum	No

				Weapon Description From			Assault
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post	Weapon? ^d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
157.	University of Iowa	Iowa City, IA	11/1/91	-	.38-caliber Taurus revolver	.38-caliber Taurus revolver	No
158.	Luby's Cafeteria	Killeen, TX	10/16/91	GLOCK 17 9mm semiautomatic pistol, Ruger P89 semiautomatic pistol, and 17-round and 15- round large capacity ammunition magazines. Hennard legally purchased the weapons from Mike's Gun Shop in Henderson, NV, in February and March of 1991.	9mm Glock 17, 9mm Ruger P89 semiautomatic handguns	9mm Glock 17 pistol; 9mm Ruger P89 pistol	No
159.	Post office	Ridgewood, NJ	10/10/91	-	-	9mm Uzi machine pistol, .22- caliber machine gun	Yes br
160.	GMAC	Jacksonville, FL	6/18/90	Universal M1 .30-caliber semiautomatic assault rifle, unknown make and model .38-caliber revolver, and a 30-round large capacity ammunition magazine.	.30-caliber Universal M1 carbine rifle; .38-caliber revolver	.30-caliber Universal M1 carbine; .38-caliber revolver	No bd
161.	Standard Gravure Corporation	Louisville, KY	9/14/89	Chinese-made AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, two INTRATEC MAC-11 semiautomatic assault pistols, SIG SAUER unknown model 9mm semiautomatic pistol, unknown make and model .38-caliber revolver, and 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines. Wesbecker legally purchased the AK-47-type assault rifle from Tilford's Gun Sales in Louisville.	Two Intratec MAC-11, 9mm SIG Sauer semiautomatic handguns; AK-47 Chinese variant semiautomatic rifle; .38-caliber revolver	9mm SIG Sauer pistol; AK-47 Chinese variant semiautomatic rifle ; Intratec MAC-11 machine pistol; .38-caliber revolver; 9mm SIG Sauer pistol	Yes
162.	Stockton Schoolyard	Stockton, CA	1/17/89	Chinese-made AK-47-type semiautomatic assault rifle, Taurus unknown model 9mm semiautomatic pistol, a 75-round large capacity ammunition drum magazine, a 75-round large capacity ammunition rotary magazine, and four 35-round large capacity ammunition banana magazines. Purdy legally purchased the AK-47-type rifle at Sandy Trading Post, in Sandy, OR on August 3, 1988, and the Taurus 9mm pistol at Hunter Loan and Jewelry Co. in Stockton, CA on December 28, 1988.	9mm Taurus semiautomatic handgun; AK-47 Chinese variant semiautomatic rifle	9mm Taurus pistol; AK-47 Chinese variant semiautomatic rifle	Yes
163.	Montefiore School	Chicago, IL	9/22/88	-	-	.38-caliber revolver	No
164.	Old Salisbury Road	Winston-Salem, NC	7/17/88	-	-	.22-caliber rifle	No
165.	ESL	Sunnyvale, CA	2/16/88	-	.380 ACP Browning, 9mm Smith & Wesson semiautomatic handguns; Ruger M-77 .22-250 bolt-action rifle with scope; Mossberg 12-gauge pump-action, 12-gauge Benelli semiautomatic shotguns; .357 Magnum Smith & Wesson, .22 Sentinel WMR revolvers	.22 Sentinel WMR revolver; 9mm Smith & Wesson pistol; Mossberg 12-gauge pump-action shotgun; Ruger M-77 .22-250 bolt-action rifle with scope; .380 AP Browning pistol; 12-gauge Benelli semiautomatic shotgun; .357 Magnum Smith & Wesson revolver;	No ^{be}

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 32 of 37 PageID #: 1018 Exhibit $\bf C$

			Weapon Description From				
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post	Weapon? d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
166.	Shopping Centers	Palm Bay, FL	4/23/87	Strum, Ruger Mini-14 semiautomatic assault rifle equipped with a 30-round large capacity ammunition magazine, five 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines, 180 rounds of ammunition, a shotgun (unknown make and model), and a pistol (unknown make and model). Cruse ordered the assault rifle on March 21, 1987. On April 17, 1987, he purchased 100-rounds of ammunition and six 30-round large capacity ammunition magazines.	Sturm, Ruger Mini-14 semiautomatic rifle; 20-gauge Winchester pump-action shotgun; .357 Ruger Blackhawk revolver	.357 Ruger Blackhawk revolver; Ruger Mini-14 semiautomatic rifle; Sturm; 20-gauge Winchester pump-action	No ^{bf}
167.	United States Postal Service	Edmond, OK	8/20/86	-	.22-caliber, two .45-caliber Colt Model 1911-A1 semiautomatic handguns	.45-caliber Colt Model 1911-A1 pistol; .45-caliber Colt Model 1911-A1 pistol; .22-caliber pistol	_ bg
168.	Anchor Glass Container Corporation	South Connellsville, PA	3/16/85	-	-	.38-caliber snub-nosed revolver	No
169.	Other Place Lounge	Hot Springs, AR	7/24/84	-	-	.45-caliber semiautomatic pistol	No
170.	San Ysidro McDonald's	San Ysidro, CA	7/18/84	-	9mm Browning P35 Hi-Power semiautomatic handgun; 9mm Israeli Military Industries Uzi Model A carbine semiautomatic rifle; 12-gauge Winchester 1200 pump-action shotgun	9mm Israeli Military industries Uzi Model A machine pistol, 12- gauge Winchester 1200 pump- action shotgun, 9mm Browning P35 Hi-Power pistol	Yes
171.	Dallas Nightclub	Dallas, TX	6/29/84	-	9mm Smith & Wesson 459 semiautomatic handgun	9mm Smith & Wasson 459 pistol	No bh
172.	Alaska Mining Town	Manley Hot Springs, AK	5/17/84	-	-	.30-06-caliber Ruger single-shot rifle	No
173.	College Station	Collge Station, TX	10/11/83	-	-	-	No bi
174.	Alaska Back-County	McCarthy, AK	3/1/83	-		.223-caliber Ruger Mini-14 semiautomatic rifle, .22-caliber pistol	No
175.	Upper West Side Hotel	New York, NY	2/3/83	-	-	-	No ^{bj}
176.	The Investor	Noyes Island, AK	9/6/82	-	-	.22-caliber	No
177.	Welding Shop	Miami, FL	8/20/82	-	Mossberg 500 Persuader pumpaction shotgun with pistol grip	12-gauge shotgun	No
178.	Western Transfer Co.	Grand Prairie, TX	8/9/82	-		.38-caliber revolver, .25-caliber semiautomatic pistol, carbine rifle	No

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 33 of 37 PageID #: 1019

Exhibit C

List of Firearms Used in Public Mass Shootings 1982 – October 2022

			_	Weapon Description From			
	Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission	Mother Jones	Washington Post c	Weapon? d
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
179.	. Russian Jack Springs Park	Anchorage, AK	5/3/82	-	-	.38-caliber pistol	No

Notes and Sources:

Public Mass Shootings from Mother Jones ("US Mass Shootings, 1982-2022: Data from Mother Jones' Investigation," updated November 23, 2022), the Citizens Crime Commission of New York City ("Mayhem Multiplied: Mass Shooters and Assault Weapons," February 2018 update, and "Citizens Crime Commission of New York City, Mass Shooting Incidents in America (1984-2012)," accessed June 1, 2017), Washington Post ("The Terrible Numbers That Grow With Each Mass Shooting,", updated May 12, 2021) and The Violence Project ("Mass Shooter Database," updated May 14, 2022). Identified Assault Weapons are in bold.

- Description of weapons from "Citizens Crime Commission of New York City, Mass Shooting Incidents in America (1984-2012)," accessed June 1, 2017,
- Description of weapons from Mother Jones ("US Mass Shootings, 1982-2022: Data from Mother Jones' Investigation," updated November 23, 2022).
- Description of weapons from Washington Post ("The Terrible Numbers That Grow With Each Mass Shooting,", updated May 12, 2021).
- d California Penal Code sections 30510 and 30515 and California Code of Regulations, title 11, section 5499.
- "House Investigative Committee on the Robb Elementary Shooting Texas House of Representatives Interim Report 2022," July 17, 2022; "DDM4 V7", Daniel Defense, https://danieldefense.com/ddm4-v7.html, accessed January 4, 2023.
- "Sheriff: Oxford High School shooter used 9 mm pistol recently purchased by father," ClickOnDetroit, December 1, 2021; "SP2022 Nitron Carry," Sig Sauer, https://www.sigsauer.com/sp2022-nitron-carry-size.html, accessed January 4, 2023.
- cc "The San Jose gunman appeared to specifically target his victims, sheriff says", CNN, May 28, 2021.
- cd "HM DEFENSE HM15F-MB-556 DEFENDER M5 223 REM,5.56X45MM NATO 16" 30+1 BLACK HARD COAT ANODIZED BLACK MIL-SPEC HM STOCK," Carter's Country,

https://www.carterscountry.com/product/hm-defense-defender-m5-223-rem5.56-nato-16-301-black-hard-coat-anodized-mil-spec-hm-stock, accessed January 5, 2023.

- ${\color{blue} {ce}} \\ \hbox{"Instruction Manual for Ruger AR-556 Pistol," https://ruger-docs.s3.amazonaws.com/_manuals/AR-556_Pistol-K94Vg4d.pdf.} \\$
- ^e "From Midland to Odessa, shooter cut a 64-minute path of terror," *Houston Chronicle*, September 8, 2019.
- cf "The Pistol That Looks Like A Rifle: The Dayton Shooter's Gun," npr, August 8, 2019.
- $\label{eq:final_control} f \text{ "11 Killed in Synagogue Massacre; Suspect Charged With 29 Counts," } \textit{New York Times} \text{ , October 27, 2018.}$
- g "Bakersfield mass shooting 'very calculated,' came after ugly divorce, officials say," Los Angeles Times, September 14, 2018; "Model S&W500," Smith & Wesson,
 - $https://www.smith-wesson.com/firearms/model-sw500-0, accessed September\ 25,\ 2018.$
- h "Authorities seized Waffle House shooting suspect's AR-15 after arrest, dad gave them back," *The Mercury News*, April 23, 2018; "Family of murder victim sues Waffle House suspect and his father for \$100 million," CBSWJTV, July 11, 2018; "Family of Waffle House victim in Nashville sues accused shooter's father," Reuters, May 15, 2018.

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 34 of 37 PageID #: 1020

Exhibit C

			Weapon	Weapon Description From				
Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post C	Weapon? ^d		
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)		

¹ "Florida shooting suspect bought gun legally, authorities say," USA Today, February 15, 2018; "Florida school shooter's AR-15 may have jammed, saving lives, report says," Miami Herald, February 27, 2018.

- m "List: Guns and evidence from Las Vegas shooter Stephen Paddock," KTNV, January 19, 2018; "47 guns, loaded high-capacity magazines found in Vegas shooter's hotel suite and Nevada home," ABC News, October 4, 2017; "The 'tricked out' guns Las Vegas shooter used in massacre," New York Post, October 3, 2017.
- n "Washington shooting victims ranged in age from 16 to 95, coroners say," CNN, September 27, 2016; Brown, Jason, "What You Should Know About .22 Rimfire," NRA, August 16, 2017; Ruger Homepage, https://ruger.com/, accessed October 24, 2018.
- ^o "Exclusive: Photo of the Saiga AK-74 Rifle Used at Dallas Shooting," *Law Officer*, July 10, 2016.
- p "Sig MCX Owners Manual: Handling & Safety Instructions," Sig Sauer, https://www.sigsauer.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/MCX.pdf, accessed October 23, 2018; Sig Sauer website, https://www.sigsauer.com/products/firearms/rifles/?state_compliant=1103, accessed October 24, 2018.
- ^q "San Bernardino Guns Originally Bought Legally, Later Modified," *The Wall Street Journal*, December 4, 2015.
- $^{\rm r}$ "Umpqua Community College 2015 shooting report: What we've learned," *The Oregonian*, September 8, 2017.
- S "Chattanooga Shooting Reignites Gun Control Debate After Mohammad Youssef Abdulazeez Used AK-47 Assault Weapon To Kill Marines," *International Business Times*, July 17, 2015; "Purple Hearts just approved for Marines and sailor targeted in Chattanooga attack," *The Washington Post*, December 17, 2015.
- t "John Zawahri, suspected gunman in deadly Santa Monica shooting, left farewell note, police say," CBS News, June 14, 2013.
- $^{\mathrm{u}}$ "Names of victims emerge after deadly Federal Way shooting," Federal Way Mirror , April 24, 2013.
- V "Upstate New York Shooting Update: Kurt Myers, suspected gunman, killed by police in shootout," CBS News, March 14, 2013.
- W "Fate of Sandy Hook lawsuit against gun maker could be decided by a slingshot," NBC News, November 14, 2017; "Embargo firing a run on Russian-made guns: Added restrictions put arms in short supply," San Antonio Express-News, August 11, 2014.
- X "Aurora Gunman's Arsenal: Shotgun, Semiautomatic Rifle and, at the End, a Pistol," New York Times, July 24, 2012; "M&P15 Centerfire Rifles Safety & Instruction Manual," Smith & Wesson, https://www.smith-wesson.com/sites/default/files/owners-manuals/M%26P15_CF_Rifle_Manual_10-20-15.pdf, accessed October 25, 2018.
- ^y "IHOP gunman used illegally altered AK-47, sheriff says," *Las Vegas Review-Journal*, October 5, 2011.

^j "Suspect in quadruple killing at car wash dies," CNN, January 30, 2018.

k "California mass shooter made his own rifles," NBC News, November 16, 2017; "California shooter built his own illegal guns, officials say," USA Today, November 15, 2017.

¹ "What we know about the rifle used in the Texas church massacre," *CNN*, November 6, 2017; "The Latest: 2 men who pursued gunman attend shooting vigil," *The Associated Press*, November 6, 2017; "Ruger AR-556." Ruger, https://ruger.com/products/ar556/specSheets/8500.html, accessed October 22, 2018.

Exhibit C

			Weapon Description From			Assault
Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post C	Weapon? ^d
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)

^Z "The mass killer, the cop and the armed citizen.(THE AYOOB FILES)," *The American Handgunner*, November 1, 2013.

aa "6 Killed In Grand Prairie Roller Rink Shooting," CBS DFW, July 23, 2011.

ab "Kentucky Tragedy: Man Kills Wife, Five Others, in Rampage Over Cold Eggs, Say Cops," CBS News, September 13, 2010.

ac "Hialeah: Only the Latest Mass Shooting by a Concealed Carry Killer," Huffington Post, July 30, 2013; "Hialeah gunman's rage over estranged wife leaves 5 dead," Sun Sentinel, June 7, 2010.

ad "Man convicted of killing 4 at Los Angeles restaurant," Associated Press, March 15, 2016.

ae "Instructions for Operation and Care of the Remington Model 11-'48, Sportsman-'48 Autoloading Shotguns," https://www.remington.com/sites/default/files/Model%2011-48.pdf, accessed October 24, 2018.

af "Images, suicide note released in mall massacre," *Nation World News*, December 7, 2007; "Romanian Kalashnikov Rifles," guns.net, accessed at http://www.gunsnet.net/Linx310/model.htm on July 28, 2005 via the Internet Archive WayBack Machine (accessed September 26, 2018).

ag "What happened in Crandon on Oct. 7," Los Angeles Times, June 8, 2008.

 $ah \\ \hbox{"Firearms Tutorial: Terminology," https://library.med.utah.edu/WebPath/TUTORIAL/GUNS/GUNTERM.html, accessed October 24, 2018.}$

ai "5 Dead After Louisiana Church Shooting," New York Times, May 21, 2006.

aj "Police: Seattle shooter said 'plenty for everyone'," NBC News, March 27, 2006.

ak "Both sides cite anger, hostility in killings; Hearings begin with law officers' testimony, grisly images," *Pioneer Press*, September 11, 2005.

al "Seven die in Chicago warehouse shooting," CNN, August 27, 2003.

am "Man Kills 5 Co-Works at Plant and Himself," New York Times, July 9, 2013; "Instruction Manuals & Product History," Ruger, https://ruger.com/service/productHistory.html, accessed October 23, 2018; Ruger Mini-14 manuals https://ruger-docs.s3.amazonaws.com/_manuals/mini14-180.pdf, https://ruger-docs.s3.amazonaws.com/_manuals/mini14-180.pdf, https://ruger-docs.s3.amazonaws.com/_manuals/mini14-580.pdf, accessed October 23, 2018; "What You Should Know About .22 Rimfire," NRA, August 16, 2017; Ruger Homepage, https://ruger.com/, accessed October 24, 2018.

an "Sacramento shooter unscathed before killing self, autopsy shows," $Associated\ Press$, September 14, 2001.

ao "Workplace Deaths Leave No One Untouched," *Chicago Tribune*, February 7, 2001; "Update 1-Source of guns used in US factory shootings sought," *Associated Press*, February 6, 2011; "SKS Rifle: Simonov Type 56," Department of the Army, October 1969, http://pdf.textfiles.com/manuals/FIREARMS/sks_56.pdf, accessed October 24, 2018; "Why .30-30 Winchester Will Never Die," *NRA*, February 2, 2016; "Firearms Tutorial: Terminology," https://library.med.utah.edu/WebPath/TUTORIAL/GUNS/GUNTERM.html, accessed October 24, 2018.

ap "Houston Rampage Leaves 4 Victims, Gunman Dead," The Record, January 10, 2001.

aq "Man Charged in Killings Evaded Strict Gun Laws," New York Times, December 28, 2000.

ar "How they were equipped that day," Jefferson County Sheriff, http://www.cnn.com/SPECIALS/2000/columbine.cd/Pages/EQUIPMENT_TEXT.htm, accessed September 26, 2018.

Exhibit C

			Weapon Description From			Assault
Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones	Washington Post C	Weapon? ^d
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)

as "What You Should Know About .22 Rimfire," NRA, August 16, 2017, Kipland Philip Kinkel v. Rob Persson, 13C13698;A155449 (2018); Ruger Homepage, https://ruger.com/, accessed October 24, 2018.

- "San Francisco massacre prompts families' suits," *The Las Vegas Review-Journal*, May 19, 1994; "Death Over the Counter," *The Washington Post*, July 27, 1993; "TEC-DC9 Manual," Intratec Firearms, http://pdf.textfiles.com/manuals/FIREARMS/intratec_tec_dc9.pdf, accessed October 22, 2018.
- ba "Morro Bay changed forever by killings," The Fresno Bee, November 10, 1992
- bb "Gunman may have blamed teacher who flunked him," Houston Chronicle, May 3, 1992; "What You Should Know About .22 Rimfire," NRA, August 16, 2017.
- bc "3 Killed, 8 Injured in Shooting Rampage at Post Office Crime," Los Angeles Times, November 15, 1991; "A 'Primer' About Rimfire Vs. Centerfire Ammunition," NRA, November 21, 2017; Ruger Homepage, https://ruger.com/, accessed October 24, 2018.
- br "Four Killed in Post Office, Home; Ex-Postal Employee In Custody," AP News, October 10, 1991.
- bd "Post WWII Commercially Manufactured M1 Carbines," *Universal Firearms*, http://www.m1carbinesinc.com/carbine_universal.html, accessed September 26, 2018.
- $be \\ "Firearms Tutorial: Terminology," https://library.med.utah.edu/WebPath/TUTORIAL/GUNS/GUNTERM.html, accessed October 24, 2018.$
- bf "Sales Of Exotic Weapons Are Mostly Cash And Carry," Orlando Sentinel, May 18, 1987; "Instruction Manuals & Product History," Ruger, https://ruger.com/service/productHistory.html, accessed October 23, 2018; and Ruger Mini-14 manuals,
- bg https://ruger-docs.s3.amazonaws.com/_manuals/mini14-180.pdf, https://ruger-docs.s3.amazonaws.com/_manuals/mini14-181-186.pdf; https://ruger-docs.s3.amazonaws.com/_manuals/mini14-580.pdf, accessed

 October 23, 2018."Authorities Piece Together Tragedy Gunman at Edmond Post Office 'Knew Where to Shoot People'," *The Oklahoman*, August 22, 1986.
- bh "6 Die in Dallas Club as Enraged Man Fires Wildly," New York Times, June 30, 1984.
- bi "Multiple charges filed in murder, kidnapping spree," UPI Archives, October 12, 1983.

at "Powerful, semiautomatic rifles in Jonesboro killers' arsenal," *Associated Press*, April 3, 1998; "Post WWII Commercially Manufactured M1 Carbines," *Universal Firearms*, http://www.m1carbinesinc.com/carbine_universal.html, accessed September 26, 2018; "77-Series Ruger 77/44," Ruger, https://ruger.com/products/77Series7744/models.html, accessed October 24, 2018; "Model 742," Remington, https://www.remington.com/sites/default/files/Model742.pdf, accessed October 24, 2018.

au "Unfinished business," Dateline NBC, December 21, 2006.

av "Explosive hoarded by killed of 4," Chicago Tribune, August 21, 1997

aw "High-Capacity Ammunition Magazines are the Common Thread Running Through Most Mass Shootings in the United States," Violence Policy Center, accessed September 9, 2018.

ax "An Airman's Revenge: 5 Minutes of Terror," The New York Times, June 22, 1994.

ay "Soldier from Pasco held in N.C. killings," St. Petersburg Times, August 8, 1993; "What You Should Know About .22 Rimfire," NRA, August 16, 2017.

Case 1:22-cv-00951-RGA Document 38-1 Filed 01/31/23 Page 37 of 37 PageID #: 1023 Exhibit $\bf C$

			Weapon Description From			Assault
Case	Location	Date	Citizens Crime Commission a	Mother Jones b	Washington Post c	Weapon? d
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)

bj "Gunman kills four and wounds a fifth at west side hotel," \textit{The New York Times}\ , February 4, 1983.