NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK COMMERCIAL DIVISION

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW	§	
YORK, BY LETITIA JAMES,	Š	
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE	§	
STATE OF NEW YORK,	§	
	§	INDEX NO. 451625/2020
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	
v.	§	
	§	
THE NATIONAL RIFLE	§	Motion Sequence No
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA,	§	
WAYNE LAPIERRE, WILSON	§	
PHILLIPS, JOHN FRAZER, and	§	
JOSHUA POWELL,	§	
	§	
Defendants.	§	

AFFIRMATION IN SUPPORT OF THE NRA'S MOTION FOR A SEALING ORDER

I, Svetlana M. Eisenberg, an attorney duly admitted to practice law before the Courts of the State of New York, affirm under penalty of perjury pursuant to CPLR § 2106 as follows:

- 1. I am a Partner at Brewer, Attorneys & Counselors, counsel for the National Rifle Association of America (the "NRA").
- 2. I submit this affirmation in support of the NRA's motion for a sealing order dated April 17, 2023.
 - 3. I am familiar with the facts and circumstances discussed herein.
- 4. On July 14, 2022, the NYAG took the deposition of a fact witness (the "Deposition"). The questioning and testimony during the Deposition revealed the identity of whistleblowers and substance of their reports. Therefore, on August 3, 2022, pursuant to the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

Protective Order (NYSCEF 869), the NRA designated passages of the Deposition Confidential. Exhibit A (redacted).

- 5. On February 10, 2023, March 20, 2023, and April 10, 2023, Joshua Powell and the NYAG filed papers in support of and in opposition to his motion for summary judgment. Certain of their filings attached and/or quoted from the transcript of the Deposition, including certain of the passages designated Confidential. Such filings are:
 - a. Affirmation of Kristin Chin dated February 10, 2023 (NYSCEF 1195), which attached excerpts, filed under seal, of the transcript of the Deposition (Chin Aff. Ex. 25; NYSCEF 1220);¹
 - b. Affirmation of Alexander Mendelson dated March 20, 2023 (NYSCEF 1522), which attached excerpts, filed under seal, of the transcript of the Deposition (Mendelson Aff. Ex. AH; NYSCEF 1557);
 - c. NYAG's counterstatement of material facts in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment dated March 20, 2023 (NYSCEF 1586), which quoted a passage of the Deposition designated Confidential by the NRA; and
 - d. Powell's reply to the NYAG's additional statements of material fact (NYSCEF 1802), which likewise quoted a passage of the Deposition designated Confidential by the NRA.
- 6. The deposition testimony at issue in this motion contains information pertaining to the identity of potential whistleblowers and the substance of their reports.

¹ Counsel's affirmation apparently inadvertently refers to the Deposition as Exhibit 17. The NRA believes that the relevant deposition transcript was filed by counsel as Exhibit 25 (under seal).

CLERK

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

7. For the Court's convenience, attached are copies of the above-referenced documents:

- a) Email message from counsel dated August 3, 2022, designating on behalf of the NRA portions of the Deposition, including the testimony at issue in this motion, Confidential pursuant to the Protective Order entered in this case (NYSCEF 869) (Exhibit A);²
- b) Exhibit 25 (NYSCEF 1220) to Kristen Chin's affirmation, dated February 10, 2023, in support of Joshua Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1195), with proposed redactions (Exhibit C);
- c) Exhibit AH (NYSCEF 1557) to Alex Mendelson's affirmation, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Mr. Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1522), with NYAG's redactions (Exhibit D);
- d) NYAG's counterstatement of material facts, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1586), with NYAG's redactions (Exhibit E); and
- e) Powell's reply to Plaintiff's additional statements of material fact, dated April 10, 2023, in further support of his motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1802), with proposed redactions (**Exhibit F**).

The designation consisted of (i) an email message listing portions designated Confidential; and (ii) a copy of the relevant transcript attached to the email message highlighting passages designated Confidential. Page:line designations 411:13-411:18, which were highlighted in the attachment (Exhibit B), were inadvertently omitted from the list in the email message. It is nonetheless clear based on the substance of the information, the highlighted attachment (Exhibit B), and other designations that the NRA designated the testimony confidential. See also Protective Order (NYSCEF 869), Paragraph 2 (stating that the designation can be effected through various means, including notice in writing).

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

8. Pursuant to Part 3 – Sealing Practices and Instructions, the passages are also listed in the chart below. The first column of the chart lists the number of the relevant exhibit to this affirmation (as referenced above). Other columns identify:

- a) The NYSCEF number associated with the Notice of Motion in connection with which Powell and the NYAG filed the relevant documents under seal;
- b) Description of the document and NYSCEF number associated with the documents filed under seal by Powell and the NYAG;
- c) Page pin cite or page:line pin cite where the information which the NRA seeks to seal appears within the document; and
- d) A brief description of the basis for the request to seal (as set forth with particularity in the NRA's memorandum of law in support of the sealing motion).

Exhibit No. to this Affirmation	NYSCEF No. of relevant notice of motion	Description of Document(s) the NRA seeks permission to have filed in part under seal	Page number or page:line of passage at issue	Basis
Exhibit C	1194	Exhibit 25 (NYSCEF 1220) to Kristen Chin's affirmation, dated February 10, 2023, in support of Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1195)	Excerpt of the Deposition, at 411:13-18	Information pertaining to the identity of potential whistleblowers and the substance of their reports.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

Exhibit No. **NYSCEF Description of** Page number Basis to this No. of Document(s) the or page:line **Affirmation** relevant NRA seeks of passage at notice of permission to have issue motion filed in part under seal Exhibit D Exhibit AH Excerpts from Same Same (NYSCEF 1557) to the Alex Mendelson's Deposition, at 170:3-172:25 affirmation, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1522) Exhibit D Exhibit AH Excerpt of the Same Same Deposition, at (NYSCEF 1557) to Alex Mendelson's 411:13-18 affirmation, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1522) Exhibit AH Exhibit D Same Excerpts from Same (NYSCEF 1557) to the Alex Mendelson's Deposition, at 412:9-17 affirmation, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1522) Exhibit D Exhibit AH Same Excerpts from Same (NYSCEF 1557) to Alex Mendelson's Deposition, at affirmation, dated 412:21-25 March 20, 2023, in opposition to

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

Exhibit No. to this Affirmation	NYSCEF No. of relevant notice of motion	Description of Document(s) the NRA seeks permission to have filed in part under seal	Page number or page:line of passage at issue	Basis
		Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1522)		
Exhibit D	Same	Exhibit AH (NYSCEF 1557) to Alex Mendelson's affirmation, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1522)	Excerpts of the Deposition at 413:10-413:23	Same
Exhibit E	Same	NYAG's counterstatement of material facts, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1586)	Pages 13-14 (Referring to the Deposition at 170:10-172:19)	Same
Exhibit E	Same	NYAG's counterstatement of material facts, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1586)	Pages 16-17, 19 (Referring to the Deposition at 411:13-18)	Same

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

Exhibit No. to this Affirmation	NYSCEF No. of relevant notice of motion	Description of Document(s) the NRA seeks permission to have filed in part under seal	Page number or page:line of passage at issue	Basis
Exhibit E	Same	NYAG's counterstatement of material facts, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1586)	Page 19 (Referring to the Deposition at 412:9-17)	Same
Exhibit E	Same	NYAG's counterstatement of material facts, dated March 20, 2023, in opposition to Powell's motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1586)	Page 19 (Referring to the Deposition at 412:21-25)	Same
Exhibit F	Same	Powell's reply to Plaintiff's additional statements of material fact, dated April 10, 2023, in further support of his motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1802)	Page 13 (Referring to the Deposition at 170:10-172:19)	Same
Exhibit F	Same	Powell's reply to Plaintiff's additional statements of material fact, dated April 10, 2023, in further support of his motion for	Pages 17, 19 (Referring to the Deposition at 411:13-18)	Same

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

Exhibit No. to this Affirmation	NYSCEF No. of relevant notice of motion	Description of Document(s) the NRA seeks permission to have filed in part under seal	Page number or page:line of passage at issue	Basis
		summary judgment (NYSCEF 1802)		
Exhibit F	Same	Powell's reply to Plaintiff's additional statements of material fact, dated April 10, 2023, in further support of his motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1802)	Page 19 (Referring to the Deposition at 412:9-17)	Same
Exhibit F	Same	Powell's reply to Plaintiff's additional statements of material fact, dated April 10, 2023, in further support of his motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1802)	Page 19 (Referring to the Deposition at 412:21-25)	Same
Exhibit F	Same	Powell's reply to Plaintiff's additional statements of material fact, dated April 10, 2023, in further support of his motion for summary judgment (NYSCEF 1802)	Page 19 (Referring to the Deposition at 413:10-413:23)	Same

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1818

INDEX NO. 451625/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 04/17/2023

Dated: April 17, 2023 New York, New York

/s/ Svetlana M. Eisenberg
Svetlana M. Eisenberg