

1 C. D. Michel – SBN 144258  
2 [cmichel@michellawyers.com](mailto:cmichel@michellawyers.com)  
3 Joshua R. Dale – SBN 209942  
4 [jdale@michellawyers.com](mailto:jdale@michellawyers.com)  
5 Konstadinos T. Moros – SBN 306610  
6 [kmoros@michellawyers.com](mailto:kmoros@michellawyers.com)  
7 Alexander A. Frank – SBN 311718  
8 [afrank@michellawyers.com](mailto:afrank@michellawyers.com)  
9 MICHEL & ASSOCIATES, P.C.  
10 180 E. Ocean Blvd., Suite 200  
11 Long Beach, CA 90802  
12 Telephone: (562) 216-4444

13 Donald Kilmer-SBN 179986  
14 Law Offices of Donald Kilmer, APC  
15 14085 Silver Ridge Road  
16 Caldwell, Idaho 83607  
17 Telephone: (408) 264-8489  
18 Email: [Don@DKLawOffice.com](mailto:Don@DKLawOffice.com)

19 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

20 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
21 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
22 **SOUTHERN DIVISION**

23 RENO MAY, an individual; ANTHONY  
24 MIRANDA, an individual; ERIC HANS,  
25 an individual; GARY BRENNAN, an  
26 individual; OSCAR A. BARRETTO, JR.,  
27 an individual; ISABELLE R.  
28 BARRETTO, an individual; BARRY  
BAHRAMI, an individual; PETE  
STEPHENSON, an individual; ANDREW  
HARMS, an individual; JOSE FLORES,  
an individual; DR. SHELDON HOUGH,  
DDS, an individual; SECOND  
AMENDMENT FOUNDATION; GUN  
OWNERS OF AMERICA; GUN  
OWNERS FOUNDATION; GUN  
OWNERS OF CALIFORNIA, INC.; THE  
LIBERAL GUN CLUB, INC.; and  
CALIFORNIA RIFLE & PISTOL  
ASSOCIATION, INCORPORATED,

Plaintiffs,

v.

ROBERT BONTA, in his official capacity  
as Attorney General of the State of  
California, and DOES 1-10,

Defendants.

Case No.: 8:23-cv-01696 CJC (ADSx)

**MAY PLAINTIFFS’  
EVIDENTIARY OBJECTIONS TO  
AND MOTION TO STRIKE THE  
SUR-REBUTTAL TESTIMONY  
OF DEFENDANT’S EXPERT  
WITNESSES:**

- 1) ADAM WINKLER,
- 2) JOSHUA SALZMANN,
- 3) DR. BRENNAN RIVAS,
- 4) LEAH GLASER,
- 5) MARY FISSELL,
- 6) PATRICK CHARLES, AND
- 7) HOLLY BREWER

Hearing Date: December 20, 2023  
Hearing Time: 1:30 p.m.  
Courtroom: 9 B  
Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney

1 **TO THIS HONORABLE COURT:**

2 Plaintiffs Reno May, Anthony Miranda, Eric Hans, Gary Brennan, Oscar A.  
3 Barretto, Jr., Isabelle R. Barretto, Barry Bahrami, Pete Stephenson, Andrew Harms,  
4 Jose Flores, Dr. Sheldon Hough, DDS, The Second Amendment Foundation, Gun  
5 Owners of America, Inc., Gun Owners of California, Inc., The Liberal Gun Club,  
6 Inc., and California Rifle & Pistol Association, Incorporated, hereby object to the  
7 entirety of each of the *sur*-rebuttal declarations filed in support of Defendant’s  
8 opposition to the preliminary injunction, such declarations authored by (1) Adam  
9 Winkler (Dkt 38), (2) Joshua Salzman (Dkt 37), (3) Dr. Brennan Rivas (Dkt 36),  
10 (4) Leah Glaser (Dkt 35), (5) Mary Fissell (Dkt 34), (6) Patrick Charles (Dkt 33),  
11 and (7) Holly Brewer (Dkt 32). Such objections are made on the following  
12 grounds:

13 The *sur*-rebuttal declarations were filed in violation of C.D. Cal. Local Rule  
14 7-9 (time for presenting opposing briefs and evidence on motions), and 7-10 (no  
15 response to reply permitted absent court permission); *see also Gebretsadike v.*  
16 *Travelers Home and Marine Ins. Co.*, 103 F. Supp. 3d 78, 86 (D.D.C. 2015.)

17 Mr. Cramer’s declaration submitted on reply in direct response to the deluge  
18 of false, speculative, and irrelevant information presented by the Attorney General  
19 in opposition was not an invitation for the Attorney General to submit unapproved  
20 *sur*-reply evidence rebutting Mr. Cramer’s declaration. *See Terrell v. Contra Costa*  
21 *Cnty.*, 232 Fed. App’x 626, 629 n.2 (9th Cir. 2007) (evidence presented in reply to  
22 opposition is not “new” when it is presented in direct response to opposition  
23 evidence), citing *In re ConAgra Foods, Inc.*, 302 F.R.D. 537, 559 (C.D. Cal. 2014)  
24 (same). Nor did the Attorney General seek the Court’s permission before further  
25 using the substantial financial advantage of the State’s treasury to pay experts for  
26 additional written opinions; additional opinions that not only further muddle the  
27 record, but which Plaintiffs now have no opportunity to address. *See C.D. Cal. L.R.*  
28 *7-9 & 7-10.*

1 As Plaintiffs have the burden of persuasion as the moving party,  
2 consideration by the Court of this additional evidence without an opportunity for  
3 Plaintiffs to rebut and comment upon it denies them due process. *See generally*  
4 *Towery v. Brewer*, 672 F.3d 650, 657 (9th Cir. 2012). Plaintiffs move to strike  
5 these *sur*-rebuttal declarations in their entirety.

6 Plaintiffs further incorporate into these objections their prior objections made  
7 under, inter alia, Fed. R. Evid. 403 and 702 (Dkts 29-1, 29-5, 29-6, 29-7 & 29-14)  
8 as to the overall relevance and admissibility of any testimony of witnesses (1)  
9 Adam Winkler, (2) Joshua Salzman, (3) Leah Glaser, and (4) Mary Fissell on the  
10 basis that their *sur*-rebuttal testimony is as irrelevant, lacking foundation, or  
11 otherwise inappropriate in informing the Court as were their declarations filed in  
12 opposition to the motion.

13 Dated: December 14, 2023

**MICHEL & ASSOCIATES, P.C.**

*/s/ C.D. Michel*

C.D. Michel  
Counsel for Plaintiffs

17 Dated: December 14, 2023

**LAW OFFICES OF DON KILMER**

*/s/ Don Kilmer*

Don Kilmer  
Counsel for Plaintiff The Second Amendment  
Foundation

28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**  
IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

Case Name: *May, et al. v. Bonta*  
Case No.: 8:23-cv-01696 CJC (ADSx)

IT IS HEREBY CERTIFIED THAT:

I, the undersigned, am a citizen of the United States and am at least eighteen years of age. My business address is 180 East Ocean Boulevard, Suite 200, Long Beach, California 90802.

I am not a party to the above-entitled action. I have caused service of:

**MAY PLAINTIFFS’ EVIDENTIARY OBJECTIONS TO AND MOTION TO STRIKE THE *SUR*-REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF DEFENDANT’S EXPERT WITNESSES:**

- 1) ADAM WINKLER,
- 2) JOSHUA SALZMANN,
- 3) DR. BRENNAN RIVAS,
- 4) LEAH GLASER,
- 5) MARY FISSELL,
- 6) PATRICK CHARLES, AND
- 7) HOLLY BREWER

on the following party by electronically filing the foregoing with the Clerk of the District Court using its ECF System, which electronically notifies them.

Robert L. Meyerhoff, Deputy Attorney General  
California Department of Justice  
300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702  
Los Angeles, CA 90013  
Email: [Robert.Meyerhoff@doj.ca.gov](mailto:Robert.Meyerhoff@doj.ca.gov)  
*Attorney for Defendant*

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed December 14, 2023.

  
Christina Castron